

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 PROCEEDINGS HELD BEFORE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION
4 COMMISSION OF BRIGHTON AT 2300 ELMWOOD AVENUE, ROCHESTER, NEW
YORK ON AUGUST 29TH, 2019 AT APPROXIMATELY 7:22 P.M.

5

August 29th, 2019
Brighton Town Hall
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

8

9 PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON
DIANA ROBINSON
DAVID WHITAKER
AMANDA L. DREHER
JUSTIN DELVECCHIO
JOHN PAGE

13

14

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

NOT PRESENT:

20

RAMSEY A. BOLINER
WAYNE GOODMAN

21

22

83

23

REPORTED BY: ALEXANDRA K. WIATER, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

25

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Anyone here to speak in
4 open form? Okay. Let's call the meeting to order.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. Jerry Ludwig?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: John Page?

10 MR. PAGE: Here.

11 MS. LANPHEAR: David Whitaker?

12 MR. WHITAKER: Here.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: Amanda Dreher?

14 MS. DREHER: Here.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: Wayne Goodman?

16 Justin Delvecchio?

17 MR. DELVECCHIO: Here.

18 MS. LANPHEAR: And Diana Robinson?

19 MS. ROBINSON: Here.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks like we have a
22 quorum. Can I have a vote to approve the agenda?

23 MR. WHITAKER: So moved.

24 MR. DELVECCHIO: Second.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We have some minutes from
5 the July 25th meeting. I have some corrections here handed
6 to me by David Whitaker I'd like to present. Anyone else
7 have any corrections?

8 MS. LANPHEAR: I had an e-mail discussion with
9 Rhoda who did the minutes. And I did help her correct Page
10 28, the Jalna situation, but there's a phrase after that on
11 line 14 that maybe John Page knows because you're the one
12 that's friendly with that phrase. A rare art something style
13 house.

14 MR. PAGE: Art moderne.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: Moderne. Thank you.

16 MR. PAGE: Uh-huh.

17 MS. DREHER: And I noticed on Page 29, line 5,
18 Javama should be Jalna. And then on page 3 -- I'm sorry page
19 2, line 23, AE should actually be 80, the number, eight zero.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other corrections?

21 Can someone go to approve the minutes as corrected?

22 MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion.

23 MS. ROBINSON: I'll second them.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is this meeting duly
4 advertised?

5 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. It was advertised in The
6 Post of August 15th, 2019.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. The meeting is
8 duly advertised. We will hold it now.

11 Application of Mary Jo Lanphere; Town Historian, for property
12 owned by William F. Kearns III and Jason M. Barnecut, at 30
13 Stoneham Road, tax number 123.17-2-3, for landmark
14 designation.

15 Is there anyone here to speak on that?

16 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Our architect should
17 be pulling in momentarily. I apologize. So, he does have
18 our proposal for you to see as far as what we discussed at
19 the last meeting.

20 MR. GORDON: Mary Jo, did you want to make a
21 couple of comments about this property and why it should be
22 designated?

23 MS. LANPHEAR: In your packet you should have
24 a memo that I prepared earlier this week. And in that memo,
25 I said that the house is important, obviously, and that it

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 fulfills three of the four criteria in the preservation law.
4 And that is possesses historic value as part of the cultural,
5 political, economic, architectural -- or social history of
6 the town. It embodies the distinguishing characteristics of
7 an architectural style. And it's the work of a significant
8 designer, Herbert Stern. So, that's -- also because it's
9 unique for it's -- in the community, this art-moderne house
10 according to Cynthia Howa.

11 There's another house around the corner on
12 Weymouth Drive known by a famous international architect
13 named Lescaze. And Cynthia has singled that out as an
14 important house in that neighborhood.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: While we're waiting for
16 Jon, should we move to skip to the second matter on the
17 agenda, since he seems to be credible to the discussion here?

18 MR. GORDON: Mary Jo, when we noticed this
19 public hearing, did we notice it for 7:15 or 7:30?

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Let me look and see what the AD
21 says.

22 MR. GORDON: Thank you.

23 MS. LANPHEAR: Public hearing would be -- one
24 second.

25 Okay. Public hearing at 7:15 p.m. EST for the

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

purpose of considering, modifying or disapproving the following. And then the Stone-Tolan property is the first on the list though in this AD. 30 Stoneham is the second thing on the list.

MR. GORDON: Gentleman, did you want to say anything about the property while we wait?

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Nothing that we
didn't say at the previous meeting. So...

MR. GORDON: But anything that was said at the previous meeting is not part of this public record.

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Okay.

MR. GORDON: So, we're now creating a brand new public record for the purpose of considering designation. When you came in last time, we were not doing a public hearing on designation. It was really just a preliminary discussion. So, I know -- we know what you said --

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Okay.

MR. GORDON: -- but that doesn't make it part of our official record. So, if there is anything that you think is important to have on the record, now would be the time to put it on.

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: I think what we'd say is that we bought the home because of the architecture.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 MR. GORDON: And just for our court reporter,
4 could you just state your name and address for us?

5 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Sure. It's William
6 F. Barnecut-Kearns and Jason M. Barnecut-Kearns.

7 MR. GORDON: Can you spell those names?

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Sure. Just the last
9 name or the full name?

10 MR. GORDON: Just the last name.

11 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Sure. Sure. It's
12 B-a-r-n-e-c-u-t hyphen K-e-a-r-n-s.

13 MR. GORDON: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Would -- are you
25 ready?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 JON SCHICK: Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We're just discussing the
5 application, and feel free to come up and introduce yourself.

6 JON SHICK: Sure. Hello. My name is Jon
7 Schick.

8 MR. GORDON: Make sure you speak up loud
9 enough so the court reporter can hear.

10 JON SCHICK: I'm an architect here in the
11 city. So, this is an existing plan -- site plan. And the
12 first floor plan of the house. Just to sort of show you a
13 little bit about -- and I have photographs that I can --
14 copies of photographs that you can take a look at. But just
15 to sort of give you a sense of how sort of unordered the
16 existing site plan is. We're not really changing all that
17 much with the house. But the -- I think the landscaping was
18 sort of built over a period of time. The pool was -- I'm not
19 exactly sure when the pool was --

20 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: 1970.

21 JON SCHICK: 1970. There's a small terrace --
22 this is back of the house here. On the front of the house
23 here. This is the studio space that was added in the --

24 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: 50s.

25 JON SCHICK: 50s? Okay. But the original

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

house stops -- the original house stops right there. But there's all these sort of -- kind of -- sort of random walls and stairs and things like that back there that we want to try to sort of create some order with this new opportunity to develop the site because it is an amazing site. And that this is -- the houses are really quite nice.

So, that's really the -- as far of the design, the changes to the house we can also talk about those separately, I think. But they're all sort of -- kind of tied together in a sense that their intent is to try to sort of develop the outdoors for entertaining and create this sort of family room kind of space where the studio would work in concert with the outdoors. And, you know, sort of have an easier route -- or an easier way to get from the inside to the outside. Maybe direct this flow a little bit better and improve the esthetics of the spaces and the finishes and whatnot.

Right now, this is a screened porch on the back of the house that's in a pretty bad state of disrepair at this point.

And the big move we would like to make there is to at least turn that into a condition space. We would primarily be reconstructing it. It was pretty root measured

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

when it was built. Just basically rough lumber and a screen stapled to it. There's not a whole lot there. But we do want to try to maintain that same footprint and improve -- like I said, improve upon -- I'll grab some photos. Here, you can sort of pass these around if you'd like. There's -- I'll kind of separate them out a little bit. Some of them are more detailed photos. So, pass those around. They're sort of in order of starting with the front of the house and kind of working your way around the house just to sort of show you the condition of certain parts of the components of the house. The intent would be to try to keep the original part of the house intact. Eventually, I know they want to replace the windows. Somebody put vinyl windows in, removed the steel sash windows that used to be there. I don't think we're going to be putting steel sash windows in. But we will be putting in something that's a little bit more complimentary and sensitive, you know, we'll try to approach the look of a more -- more like a steel sash window. It would be black frames. And we would probably match the mount and pattern of the original windows. But that's sort of a -- I'm not exactly sure what the -- what phase that would be because the windows that are there are relatively new and in good condition. So, there's not a rush to put new windows

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

in. So, I know that's part of the master plan, and I'm not sure exactly when that would occur.

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Our thought is within that -- probably after -- post-architectural project on the back of the house, once that is done, we would match windows to that decision that we make if we were able to do the back of the house. So, that's probably two years out at this point.

JON SCHICK: Okay. So, I guess I'll show you -- I guess I'll just start with the elevations. So, these are proposed elevations -- I don't know how else to do this with you guys -- on the front of the house, I guess I'll just start with -- propose to you the changes they wanted to make on the front of the house. There's a canopy over the front door that's in pretty bad shape that we'd like to basically reconstruct it and get it more stable and more watertight and flashed properly. The studio addition, which is on the left here, right now is clad and homes oak. That's the original material on the exterior. Right now, the existing grade is probably about a foot right up onto the homes oak. It's rotted. So, we want to lower the grade. We'd like to replace the homes oak with something that's a little more durable and current with today's standards.

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 We're proposing shiplap siding there. So, it would be
4 painted probably the same color as the house. The shiplap
5 joints will be very subtle. So, it won't look as stripy as
6 what's on the left-hand drawing. There's an existing French
7 door at that end -- the studio doors to the fireplace
8 chimney. We are proposing to replace that with a window and
9 with a transom above it. And then we'd also like to add
10 three clerestory windows in the same -- at the same elevation
11 as the transom window. If you look at the photos, you can
12 see that elevation is pretty flum. There's just not a lot
13 going on there. The front of the house is pretty -- it's
14 just very simple and not very -- it's not super exciting.
15 So, anyhow, we'd like to just start kind of improve upon
16 that. And the plan is to renovate that studio space and
17 reconstruct a new space where the screened porch is, and
18 that's where most of the work is going to be to the house.

19

I think the other items that Jason and Bill

20

would like to work on would be replacing the glass block

21

windows on the stair, either with new glass block or some

22

alternative. We would like to add a window --

23

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Excuse me. Is there

24

something wrong with the glass windows?

25

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: The bottom

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

right-hand block is cracked. It creates a lot of fog and into the kitchen rotting. So, that's basically --

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The glass block is original to the house?

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's original?

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes.

10 JON SCHICK: We would like to add a window
11 from the first-floor bathroom, which would be some sort of
12 cantilever section on the second floor. Right now, there's a
13 dogwood tree that you don't even really see that wall. But
14 we would add a window that is similar to -- similar portions
15 and size to other windows that exist on the house. All
16 right. So, that would be really the extent of the work we
17 would do on the front of the house.

18 On the east side of the garage is -- the
19 garage is at the lower level -- there's a cantilever concrete
20 catwalk that accesses a door -- kitchen door -- which we
21 wanted to get rid of the catwalk because it's sagging very
22 badly. It's gonna -- with something covering up the bottom
23 of the catwalk. Some other structure, which we don't know
24 what it is because we haven't demoed it or anything. But
25 we'd like to do a similar structure there to what we're

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 proposing at the front of the -- front entrance just to sort
4 of replicate the presence of that catwalk there without it
5 really being a catwalk. That entrance is really not a
6 very -- it's not in a really -- very good location. And it's
7 not -- I don't think they use it.

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: We've never even
9 been -- walking along that catwalk feels -- it's too
10 dangerous right now to even think about using it honestly.

11 JON SCHICK: I don't know if I'd walk that
12 catwalk. But we would like to re-create a canopy there and
13 it would sort of take the place of that concrete catwalk
14 that's hanging off of a building there.

15 So, there's a door that goes into their
16 kitchen that we'd like to replace with a window. And there's
17 a window that we would like to either eliminate or -- if we
18 can eliminate it, we'd like to eliminate it. Otherwise, they
19 would just sort of cover it up because it's not working with
20 their proposed kitchen plan.

21 So, then on the back of the house, that's
22 where the majority of the changes would be occurring. So,
23 one of the biggest complications with the back of the house
24 that lives right now is, this lower level, the studio space
25 is where they spend most of their time. It's sort of like a

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 family room. There's a fireplace there. And it will be much
4 improved once we renovate it to the way it currently exists.
5 But it's at the opposite of the house. So, the kitchen is
6 over here. This is where they'll entertain. This is, you
7 know, direct access to the pool, to the terrace and to the
8 outdoors. So, in order to try to fix that, we would like to
9 -- in the kitchen space, we would like to add either a
10 sliding glass door or French doors. And we would like to
11 create a catwalk coming out of that door across the back of
12 the building with stairs down to the existing terrace level.
13 And then, when they are entertaining there, they have a
14 pretty direct -- and the grill -- the grill would be located
15 right at the foot of the stairs somewhere. But when they're
16 entertaining, they would have direct access to the kitchen,
17 direct access to the outdoors. And it would sort of work
18 pretty well with getting back and forth to the pool and to
19 the outdoor spaces. Where the existing studio space is and
20 the screened porch -- which is this space here -- we are
21 looking to -- like I said, rebuild the screened porch. It's
22 not built very well and it's in pretty bad shape. The floor
23 is rotting and whatnot. But two sides of the existing
24 screened porch are cantilevered out of the foundation. And
25 we were -- we'd like to sort of maintain that detail on the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 new house -- or excuse me, the new new enclosure that we're
4 proposing to build. And we have actually made it a little
5 bit -- in so doing it, we've made it a little bit larger.
6 So, it's about a foot bigger in both directions. Width and
7 in depth.

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Jon, may I say
9 something for one second?

10 JON SCHICK: Sure.

11 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Part of the
12 motivation on this is that my father and step mother own a
13 baby grand piano that was at the Leman Arts Conservatory that
14 they're giving to us. And to create a space for that piano
15 to live is why we need to do the extension of the living
16 room. Our thought is, it's going to be an art studio for
17 music space. So, we're staying in the theme of why it was
18 built as far as supporting the arts, if you will. But that
19 was the catalyst, to expand the space so we have a home for
20 the baby grand piano.

21 JON SCHICK: Thanks.

22 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Absolutely.

23 JON SCHICK: I forgot about that. So, the
24 screened porch is going to look very similar to the way it
25 does now given that what is now -- with the posts and the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 grid of the screen panels will now be glazed. And we're
4 going to open up the wall between the screened porch and the
5 existing studio space so those two spaces can work in
6 concert. We are changing the access from the upper level to
7 the lower level so it's more direct, it's more open. We'll
8 be matching -- there's arched opened windows from the front
9 entry to the living room. We'll be matching that arch in the
10 wall which is what's at the end of the house. So, that will
11 be the new entrance into the family room. There will be a
12 wet bar down there. We've added another sliding glass door
13 here which is -- will provide more direct access to the
14 exterior. Currently, the only way for them to get outside is
15 to go through the studio space, into the screened porch and
16 out of the screened porch. There is a big window here. It's
17 about the same size as this French door -- or sliding glass
18 door. So, currently, it's glazed. But it's not an operable
19 door that can be used for getting in and out.

20 And so then, for this new glass room that is
21 constructed, that will be -- that won't have any doors coming
22 out of it anymore. So, the main exit will be the sliding
23 glass door. And then this glass room will be more of a
24 destination than something that you can pass through. And
25 that will -- you know, they'll have a television in there and

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 that will also be their hanging out space. The studio space
4 will be -- we plan to enhance the fireplace there. As Bill
5 was saying, the piano will be in there and it will just be
6 more just of a seating area. The two spaces will really work
7 in concert.

8

8 On the west elevation of the house right now
9 is the pool equipment is there. There is a very old,
10 antiquated outdoor shower that I don't think works anymore.
11 And there's also -- I'll show you right here. So right now,
12 there's sort of this terrace -- this paver terrace that is a
13 couple feet above the pool deck --

14

14 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: That was done by the
15 owners previous to us.

16

16 JON SCHICK: And there's a stair that has this
17 concrete wall -- the original concrete wall sort of stuck in
18 the middle of it. That's a little funky. And there's a lot
19 of loose rubble stone walls that are not really all that well
20 constructed and not really all that stable. So now, they
21 would have to -- they would come through the room out, out in
22 the screened porch, out here, down these steps over here,
23 down those steps to get to the pool. And then there is
24 this -- the pool deck currently isn't quite large enough to
25 really occupy, you know, pool furniture, chess's and seating

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

3 area and things of that sort. It's just slightly a little
4 bit under scale for some -- outdoor furniture tends to be
5 large in scale. This terrace was added by the last owner to
6 try to fix that problem. The problem is, this terrace is so
7 remote from the rest of the house and the rest of the
8 activities and the grill and all that sort of stuff. So,
9 when people are sitting over here, they feel really -- kind
10 of lost. So, we'd like to eliminate this terrace and we want
11 to develop this area here, at the end on the pool, as a
12 terrace and create a new way to access all these different
13 levels and just sort of clean it up and make it a little bit
14 more orderly. There's existing terrace here we plan to keep.

15 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: That's the original.

16 JON SCHICK: What's that?

17 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: And that's the
18 original one.

19 JON SCHICK: Correct. That's the original
20 terrace. There is this existing stoop coming out of the
21 living room with sort of a pair of stairs flared at the
22 bottom to get down to grade that are in really bad condition.
23 So, this is the area where we'd like to create a catwalk and
24 that's really where we'd like to put the door in the kitchen.
25 And we'd like to remove this because this is in such bad

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 condition and do something that is a little more similar to
4 what we're doing with the glass room and that it would be --
5 we'd like to do a steel structure. And it would be sort of
6 light and airy. And the -- we'd have -- the structure post
7 would be set back from the catwalk. So, it would feel a
8 little more -- it would feel very similar to the catwalk that
9 was on the original garage doors. And sort of try to -- sort
10 of a nod to the original details on that house. So, it would
11 be sort of open below. So, it wouldn't be anything dense.
12 There's a window under here that they would like to expose.
13 Which by removing this, they can expose that window that's
14 coming out of the basement. It's really not a large home.
15 Once the -- what it was like before the addition was put on,
16 it was really like one large room on the first floor and a
17 kitchen and service area. So, they use the lower level. The
18 garage is on the lower level. The bedroom is on the lower
19 level. Laundry is going to be down there still. So, the
20 basement is really about a half level below this back terrace
21 here. You can see there's several steps down the grade. So,
22 these windows that exist in the basement are directly exposed
23 to the exterior. So, they bring in a lot of light. So, by
24 removing this, keeping an opened area underneath, we can
25 further enhance the light level in the basement.

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

I think that kind of sums up everything that we are proposing to do. I can show you the proposed plan. And you can sort of see -- if it's easier for me -- or to pass this around for you guys to take a look at it, that's fine too. So, at our last meeting, Bill and Jason both expressed interest in doing -- or replace the concrete walls rather than some sort of -- either cement concrete walls or some stone walls. You can see from the pictures, I don't think the stone walls that are there are very compatible with the style of the house. They're very, very irregular and very small in scale. Some of these retaining walls are between three to four feet tall. They're just -- it's not a good fit for anything more than a couple feet in terms of being stable. They just don't have the mass to retain that much soil. So, this is -- I guess starting from the living room, this is where that existing archway is from the front hall into the living room. We're going to match that arched opening here and there. There's four steps down into the studio space and we'll basically just renovate that interior. Like I said, enhancing the fireplace walls. Right now, it's raw. Painted concrete wall. We want to replace the French doors there and the window and add the three clerestory windows.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: And our intention
4 is -- would be the French doors. Whether to replace the
5 window and removing the wall or the window. It's a mirror
6 feel of the French door that's there.

7 JON SCHICK: Right now, the structure for this
8 space was the beams are four feet on center which is a nice
9 detail. They're exposed. We want to keep them exposed in
10 the studio space. So, the location of the doors -- the door
11 and clerestory windows -- but the door isn't really -- I
12 mean, this window is in the location of the existing doors
13 and it does not relate to the location of the beams.

14 So, the clerestory windows will relate to the
15 positioning of the beams and the ceiling. And this would be
16 the glass room that we're talking about. It would be
17 primarily glass on two sides. Most of this -- it's the east?

18

WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: West.

19

19
20 subtle. There will be one long window in the corner just to
21 sort of open up that corner of the room. And then this space
22 would have flat ceiling and we would sort of further
23 demarcate the flat space different from the studio space by
24 having all this glass by having, you know, different
25 materials, different ceiling -- a slightly lower ceiling, and

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 have a great view of the pool and the backyard.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 We want to lower the grade on this side.

4 We're going to -- where this end of the structure leads out,
5 we're going to use that area underneath as storage for
6 cushions for the chairs and whatnot.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Now, do you plan -- I
8 assume you will try to do this in phases?

9 JON SCHICK: Yeah, I think so. I mean, they
10 wouldn't want to do the addition right away.

11 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yeah. We'd like to
12 start moving on the addition of the house post-holiday.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And the plans on that is
14 relative to that?

15 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes.

16 MR. PAGE: Is that giving us the overview
17 knowledge?

18 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes. This is the
19 overview.

20 MR. GORDON: May I just ask for clarification
21 here. I thought I heard you said post-holiday. What does
22 that mean?

23 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: I'm the general
24 manager at Macy's. So, I would be --

25 MR. GORDON: After Christmas --

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: After Christmas,
4 yes.

5 MR. GORDON: -- not post-Labor Day, which
6 would be next week?

7 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: No, no.

8 Post-Christmas, yes. We actually have started kitchen
9 renovations. Again, two projects with three little dogs is
10 nearly impossible. So, we're planning for post --

11 MR. GORDON: Early next year?

12 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes. Thank you for
13 the clarification on the holiday. I appreciate it.

14 JON SCHICK: So, the grades actually worked
15 out really nicely in terms of stepping down and getting out
16 in the backyard. Right now, this is just sort of, like, a
17 ramp --

18 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Stepping stones.

19 JON SCHICK: Semi-lawn area. You can see in
20 the photo, there's the planting -- sort of a planting bed
21 with some mosses and stuff that separate that from the pool.
22 So, you know, the intent here is trying to create a really
23 nice flow, you know, sort of thing from the house directing
24 out and down to the pool. And then from there, you can get
25 out to these other sort of ancillary functions. Any sort of,

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 you know, maybe that requires a little bit more privacy when
4 you get out of the shower. And then they will still have
5 direct access to get out to the backyard which is extensive.

25 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Framed in.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 JON SCHICK: Yeah. It's been sort of covered
4 up. We're going to reveal that curved wall. But other than
5 that, the living room is pretty much done.

6 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Living room's done.

7 JON SCHICK: The kitchen will be done very
8 soon. This is that first-floor bathroom I told you about.
9 There's sort of a walk-in shower here. And that's the
10 location where we'd like to have a window -- similar sized to
11 the other windows. There's a few different sizes of windows
12 on the original house. But that would be one of the sizes
13 that occurs.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You would try to pick
15 whatever new material for the window you would want rather
16 than do a vinyl and change everything?

17 JON SCHICK: We'll do a thorough review of
18 window options and figure out what window we want to use and
19 that would be the window we put in.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And then you would follow
21 suit with --

22 JON SCHICK: Then we would follow suit with
23 the rest of the house. So...

24 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: When the bathroom
25 was remodeled, the bathroom has no vents and no windows. So,

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 if the window is not okay, we understand that, but we need
4 some sort of vent.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't have any
6 objection to the window. I was just curious as to whether
7 that started the new foundation.

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: At that point, we
9 would be committed to doing all the windows.

10 JON SCHICK: So, now that we've gone through
11 all of that, this is going to make more sense. This is the
12 rear of the house. Like I said, this is where most of the
13 work is going to happen. This is that catwalk on the back of
14 the house that we're proposing to build. Sort of have a
15 piece of tube sealed at the perimeter and have cable railing,
16 a pipe rail which is similar to what's on the front of the
17 house. We want to try to keep the materials to the minimum
18 -- different materials to the minimum. So, we're talking
19 about poured placed concrete. Some sort of concrete pavers,
20 which I can show you. So, these are -- you can pass these
21 around. Those are some images of what we're talking about
22 for walls, terraces, and the texture. And sort of a feel of
23 these new terraces and step and retaining walls. This is the
24 sliding glass door on the back of the studio space. This is the
25 the new room that's cantilevered out. This is the

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 foundation. This is the outdoor shower. The utility court
4 that's on that side of the house. The one thing that we did
5 -- that isn't changing, that's apart from what's existing,
6 and there are pictures that I brought so you can see that,
7 right now, there's this faceted corner of the house which
8 stops at the canopy. So, it's faceted above the canopy but
9 not below the canopy. To my eye, it just feels very chopped
10 off. So, we talked about when we do rebuild the canopy, to
11 return the corner of it. Not to return it all the way back
12 to this wall. We'd return it back to maybe, you know, a
13 couple feet. And that does show up on the plan. And then
14 you can see it on the elevation. So, this is the canopy
15 right here. So, right now, it stops right at that corner.
16 So, we'd like to sort of return that around the corner a
17 little bit. Just to sort of -- because of the way this has a
18 facet and no facet, it feels a little more complete. And so,
19 if you'd like to pass these around. You guys haven't seen
20 anything over here so I apologize.

21

MS. DREHER: I see what you mean now. Yeah.

22

23 one comment. There's been a lot of time in thinking this
24 through. We've started to engage Jon just as we got
25 notification that we were being considered for the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 preservation. So, I think what we're trying to engage today
4 is, if you do go ahead and approve us becoming a historic
5 preservation site -- house -- whether these plans are kind of
6 -- would be considered. So, we don't go ahead and spend a
7 lot of money on designs and further expenses with Jon, just
8 to get this sense, like, when we had some initial
9 conversation, he recommended bringing this to this committee
10 to have the consideration at the same time. So, we don't go
11 another three months, we come back with a whole bunch of
12 stuff and we spend a lot of money and you guys say no way.
13 This isn't something we would consider. So...

14

15 like to give people ultimately one direction and say, oh, no
16 and go the other way.

17

JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: Exactly.

18

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'm kidding.

19

20 direction, we can change direction.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG:

22

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's just a lot of --

22

JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: It's a lot of

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: A lot of information

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I certainly don't see any
4 overall objection to it.

5 MR. GORDON: Jerry, if I may. So, the
6 application before you presently --

7 MR. PAGE: Has nothing to do with this.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 for December 19th. The cutoff date for applications for that
4 is November 19th. So, you have that and your architect has
5 that in mind as well. Then the month ahead of that, we have
6 a November 21st meeting. The cutoff date is October 27th.

7

7 JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: And then I think we
8 understood the process. We had a discussion upfront and we
9 appreciate that. And I think generally we'll be in a foot of
10 snow because we're in Rochester. But I think it's just good
11 to -- we're just trying to get an assessment of the timeline.
12 It don't have to start immediately. We just want to
13 understand what the committee was thinking.

14

19

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone else here
20 that would like to speak to the application before us?

21

23

23 MR. PAGE: Not about the application, no.

24

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there a

2

25 MR. GORDON: Yes. Chairperson Ludwig, I

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 propose the following resolution for the board's
4 consideration whereas application 8H-01-19 has been submitted
5 for the designation of 30 Stoneham Road, in the Town of
6 Brighton, Monroe County, State of New York, tax parcel number
7 123.17-2-3 as a landmark under the town's historic
8 preservation law and whereas the Historic Preservation
9 Commission duly called a public hearing to consider such
10 designation, which a public hearing was duly held on August
11 29th, 2019, and all persons having an interest in such
12 matter, having had an opportunity to be heard therein. And
13 whereas based on the materials submitted at and testimony
14 from the public hearing including the June 5th, 2019
15 application for designation submitted by town historian, Mary
16 Jo Lanphear. That's L-a-n-p-h-e-a-r. The cultural resources
17 survey prepared by Cynthia Howa, H-a-w -- I'm sorry.
18 H-o-w-a, dated 1998. The update to said survey conducted by
19 Katie Eggers, E-g-g-e-r-s, Comeau, C-o-m-e-a-u, dated April
20 18th, 2019 and the August 22nd, 2019 memorandum from town
21 historian, Mary Jo Lanphear. The Historic Preservation
22 Commission finds that the subject property possesses such
23 historic value as part of the cultural, political, economic,
24 architectural or social history of the town embodies the
25 distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style and

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

it is the work of a significant designer based upon the fact that this Moderne -- is that the right word? Capital M-o-d-e-r-n-e style house stands out in the neighborhood area of a more traditional style. The house was designed in 1935 by Herbert Stern for Walter DiLima, D-i-L-i-m-a, Meyers and his wife Julienne and sold in 1938 to Dr. Harry L Segal, S-e-g-a-l, and his wife Evelyn. In 1953, the Segal's hired an architect, Roger Sheppard, S-h-e-p-p-a-r-d, to design an addition on the west side of the house for a painter studio for Mrs. Segal, a nationally known artist. 30 Stoneham Road is one of the few international style houses in Brighton. The house embodies the ideas of functionalism and modern technology with its mock shape, flat roof and stucco walls. Its design was a significant departure from the traditional houses from which Mr. Herbert Stern is noted. Mr. And Mrs. Meyers hired Frances Gott, G-o-t-t, to design a complementary landscape for 30 Stoneham Road. Gott first worked with known local landscape architect, Alling, A-l-l-i-n-g, DeForest, D-e-F-o-r-e-s-t, before opening his own practice in 1915. Later, Gott partnered with architect Walter Cassevear, C-a-s-s-e-v-e-a-r. It is hereby therefore resolved that the Town of Brighton application number 8H-01-19 for designation as a landmark of 30 Stoneham Road, tax parcel number

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 123.17-2-3 together with all of the above-referenced
4 documents and any and all other documents, drawings, and
5 photographs submitted in the public hearing be received and
6 filed. And be it further resolved that the Historic
7 Preservation Commission hereby designates the above
8 referenced subject property located at 30 Stoneham Road as a
9 historic landmark pursuant to Chapter 224 of the Town Code
10 based upon the commissions above, articulated findings
11 regarding the historic value of the subject property, its
12 association with the social, cultural, political and economic
13 history of the town. The fact that it embodies the
14 distinguishing characteristic of an architectural style and
15 is the work of a significant designer. Period.

16

MR. WHITAKER: Wow.

17

18 forth a motion on this?

19

MB WHTT

20

MS. ROBINSON: I'll second that motion.

21

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Discussion? Or has

22

all been said?

23

24

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No discussion?

25

Mary Jo, would you call for a vote?

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. Jerry Ludwig?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: Diana Robinson?

MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: Justin Delvecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: David Whitaker?

MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: John Page?

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: And Amanda?

MS. DREHER: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The motion stands to

approve. So, you're now designated.

MR. PAGE: So, could I -- I have a question

18 for the board. I have folks in town. I expect the meeting
19 to be lengthy this evening.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You may be excused.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You may.

4 MS. DREHER: Do we need you for the quorum?

5 MR. PAGE: No.

6 MS. DREHER: I can't go either.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Oh, that's right.

8 MR. GORDON: We do need you.

9 MS. DREHER: Oh, right. That's only three.

10 MR. GORDON: Why don't we then -- if these
11 gentleman don't mind hanging out, I don't think the landmark
12 hearing is going to take long at all.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No.

14 MR. GORDON: Why don't we do the landmark
15 hearing, get that done, get the vote taken and then John can
16 go.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We'll give you ten
18 minutes max. Okay. Next item on the agenda, 6H-01-19
19 application of the Landmark Society of Western New York,
20 owner of the property at 2370 East Avenue, tax number
21 122.20-1-3, for a certificate of appropriateness to install
22 it, should be a gutter on rear of shed. I'll describe the
23 pros. Basically, there's a wooden trough gutter on the front
24 of the shed. Adjacent to that, we want to put one on the
25 rear because we've had -- originally, we were just going to

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 put a metal gutter and ask for permission of that, but we
4 decided to do the real deal because the runoff of the roof
5 has deteriorated at the lower portions of siding on that
6 shed. So, it would basically be the same as on the front.

7 Any questions?

8 MS. ROBINSON: I just don't see the
9 application --

10 MR. GORDON: Didn't have what?

11 MS. ROBINSON: The application number and the
12 date.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, I don't know that.

14 MR. GORDON: I think it was circulated prior
15 to the application number was assigned to them. But you do
16 have -- this is --

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You should have a picture
18 somewhere.. I think you've already seen it.

19 MR. GORDON: This is application 6H-01-19.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. So, any questions
21 about that?

22 MR. GORDON: And you're talking on behalf of
23 the landmark society --

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

25 MR. GORDON: As part of the public hearing?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's correct.

4 MR. GORDON: And so, because Jerry and Amanda
5 are both on the board --

6 MS. DREHER: Yes.

7 MR. GORDON: Yes? Okay. They're not going to
8 vote on this matter because of their brief matter. I'm going
9 to have everyone stay in their seats and not have anyone
10 shift around.

11 So, Jon, you're actually running this part of
12 the meeting.

13 MR. PAGE: Okay. Any discussion? If not, can
14 we have a motion?

15 MR. GORDON: Sure. I'll make it shorter than
16 the last one.

17 MR. PAGE: Thank you.

18 MR. GORDON: Whereas application number
19 6H-01-19 has been submitted for a certificate of
20 appropriateness under the town's Historic Preservation Law
21 for improvement to property located at 2370 East Avenue owned
22 by the Landmark Society of Western New York, tax number
23 122.20-1-3, for improvement described as the installation of
24 gutters on the rear of the shed.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: A gutter on the rear of

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

the shed.

MR. GORDON: I'll take that correction. A gutter on the rear of the shed. And whereas the Historic Preservation Commission duly called a public hearing to consider the matter on August 29th, 2019. And whereas the necessary legal notice was published and the required sign posted pursuant to town code. And whereas the public hearing town law persons, having had interest in such matter, have had an opportunity to be heard therein and whereas the Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines pursuant to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of The Town Code, fit the composed above described part to the subject property is consistent with the purposes of the town's Historic Preservation Law and compatible with the property's historic character. Based upon its review of the application, the documents the town filed and received at the public hearing and the testimony presented at the public hearing, it is hereby resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby receives and files the above-described application. And it is further resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby approves application 6H-01-19 for the certificate of appropriateness for the above-described work to be performed at the property located at 2370 East Avenue,

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

subject to the condition that the above-described work be completed within one year from the date of approval.

MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Can I have a second? Oh,
I can't --

MR. DELVECCHIO: Second.

MR. PAGE: Can I get a vote now?

MS. LANPHEAR: Okay. Diana Robinson?

MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: Justin Delvecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: Okay. David Whitaker?

MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

MS. LANPHEAR: John Page?

MR. PAGE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

Any other business we want to attend to?

MS. LANPHEAR: 3325 East Avenue.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is this the first time
we've seen this completed report?

MS. LANPHEAR: It was circulated because people did not remember whether they had been sent out before. And so Gretchen did send it out in advance of this

1

2

3 meeting.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I will suggest that
5 we do not take action on this tonight, but we will consider
6 it next time.

7 MS. DREHER: So, we're at the step where we
8 would be --

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We would normally send a
10 letter out.

11 MS. DREHER: -- directed to send a letter out?

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

13 Any other business tonight? Motion to
14 adjourn?

15 MR. WHITAKER: I'll move.

16 MS. DREHER: I'll second.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second call here?

18 MR. DELVECCHIO: Aye.

19 * * *

20

21

22

23

24 REPORTER CERTIFICATE

25

1 Brighton Zoning Board of Appeals 1/24/19

2

3 I, Alexandra K. Wiater, do hereby certify that I did
4 report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in
5 the above-entitled matter;

6 Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and
7 accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at
8 the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

9

10 Dated this 13th day of September, 2019

11 At Rochester, New York

12

13

14

15 Alexandra K. Wiater

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25