

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

PROCEEDINGS HELD BEFORE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION OF BRIGHTON AT 2300 ELMWOOD AVENUE, ROCHESTER, NEW
YORK ON AUGUST 29TH, 2019 AT APPROXIMATELY 7:22 P.M.

August 29th, 2019
Brighton Town Hall
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON
DIANA ROBINSON
DAVID WHITAKER
AMANDA L. DREHER
JUSTIN DELVECCHIO
JOHN PAGE

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

NOT PRESENT:
RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
WAYNE GOODMAN

REPORTED BY: ALEXANDRA K. WIATER, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Anyone here to speak in
4 open form? Okay. Let's call the meeting to order.

5 Ms. Secretary, would you call the roll,
6 please?

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. Jerry Ludwig?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: John Page?

10 MR. PAGE: Here.

11 MS. LANPHEAR: David Whitaker?

12 MR. WHITAKER: Here.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: Amanda Dreher?

14 MS. DREHER: Here.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: Wayne Goodman?

16 Justin Delvecchio?

17 MR. DELVECCHIO: Here.

18 MS. LANPHEAR: And Diana Robinson?

19 MS. ROBINSON: Here.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks like we have a
22 quorum. Can I have a vote to approve the agenda?

23 MR. WHITAKER: So moved.

24 MR. DELVECCHIO: Second.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We have some minutes from
5 the July 25th meeting. I have some corrections here handed
6 to me by David Whitaker I'd like to present. Anyone else
7 have any corrections?

8 MS. LANPHEAR: I had an e-mail discussion with
9 Rhoda who did the minutes. And I did help her correct Page
10 28, the Jalna situation, but there's a phrase after that on
11 line 14 that maybe John Page knows because you're the one
12 that's friendly with that phrase. A rare art something style
13 house.

14 MR. PAGE: Art moderne.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: Moderne. Thank you.

16 MR. PAGE: Uh-huh.

17 MS. DREHER: And I noticed on Page 29, line 5,
18 Javama should be Jalna. And then on page 3 -- I'm sorry page
19 2, line 23, AE should actually be 80, the number, eight zero.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other corrections?
21 Can someone go to approve the minutes as corrected?

22 MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion.

23 MS. ROBINSON: I'll second them.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

25 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is this meeting duly
4 advertised?

5 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. It was advertised in The
6 Post of August 15th, 2019.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. The meeting is
8 duly advertised. We will hold it now.

9 We had no communications. Designation of
10 landmarks first up on the agenda, 8H-01-19.
11 Application of Mary Jo Lanphere; Town Historian, for property
12 owned by William F. Kearns III and Jason M. Barnecut, at 30
13 Stoneham Road, tax number 123.17-2-3, for landmark
14 designation.

15 Is there anyone here to speak on that?

16 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Our architect should
17 be pulling in momentarily. I apologize. So, he does have
18 our proposal for you to see as far as what we discussed at
19 the last meeting.

20 MR. GORDON: Mary Jo, did you want to make a
21 couple of comments about this property and why it should be
22 designated?

23 MS. LANPHEAR: In your packet you should have
24 a memo that I prepared earlier this week. And in that memo,
25 I said that the house is important, obviously, and that it

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 fulfills three of the four criteria in the preservation law.
4 And that is possesses historic value as part of the cultural,
5 political, economic, architectural -- or social history of
6 the town. It embodies the distinguishing characteristics of
7 an architectural style. And it's the work of a significant
8 designer, Herbert Stern. So, that's -- also because it's
9 unique for it's -- in the community, this art-moderne house
10 according to Cynthia Howa.

11 There's another house around the corner on
12 Weymouth Drive known by a famous international architect
13 named Lescaze. And Cynthia has singled that out as an
14 important house in that neighborhood.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: While we're waiting for
16 Jon, should we move to skip to the second matter on the
17 agenda, since he seems to be credible to the discussion here?

18 MR. GORDON: Mary Jo, when we noticed this
19 public hearing, did we notice it for 7:15 or 7:30?

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Let me look and see what the AD
21 says.

22 MR. GORDON: Thank you.

23 MS. LANPHEAR: Public hearing would be -- one
24 second.

25 Okay. Public hearing at 7:15 p.m. EST for the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 purpose of considering, modifying or disapproving the
4 following. And then the Stone-Tolan property is the first on
5 the list though in this AD. 30 Stoneham is the second thing
6 on the list.

7 MR. GORDON: Gentleman, did you want to say
8 anything about the property while we wait?

9 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Nothing that we
10 didn't say at the previous meeting. So...

11 MR. GORDON: But anything that was said at the
12 previous meeting is not part of this public record.

13 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Okay.

14 MR. GORDON: So, we're now creating a brand
15 new public record for the purpose of considering designation.
16 When you came in last time, we were not doing a public
17 hearing on designation. It was really just a preliminary
18 discussion. So, I know -- we know what you said --

19 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Okay.

20 MR. GORDON: -- but that doesn't make it part
21 of our official record. So, if there is anything that you
22 think is important to have on the record, now would be the
23 time to put it on.

24 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: I think what we'd
25 say is that we bought the home because of the architecture.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 MR. GORDON: And just for our court reporter,
4 could you just state your name and address for us?

5 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Sure. It's William
6 F. Barnecut-Kearns and Jason M. Barnecut-Kearns.

7 MR. GORDON: Can you spell those names?

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Sure. Just the last
9 name or the full name?

10 MR. GORDON: Just the last name.

11 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Sure. Sure. It's
12 B-a-r-n-e-c-u-t hyphen K-e-a-r-n-s.

13 MR. GORDON: Thank you.

14 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: So, like I was
15 saying, we bought the home because we loved the architecture
16 of the home. So, our intention here is to be fully
17 cooperative around the historic designation and changes that
18 we're making to the home. Anything that we're doing, Jon is
19 truly committed to the architecture of the house. So, I
20 think that's really where we stand right now. Most of what
21 we've already done to the home has been for maintenance
22 around the property. And that's where we are right now.
23 It's a process.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Would -- are you
25 ready?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 JON SCHICK: Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We're just discussing the
5 application, and feel free to come up and introduce yourself.

6 JON SHICK: Sure. Hello. My name is Jon
7 Schick.

8 MR. GORDON: Make sure you speak up loud
9 enough so the court reporter can hear.

10 JON SCHICK: I'm an architect here in the
11 city. So, this is an existing plan -- site plan. And the
12 first floor plan of the house. Just to sort of show you a
13 little bit about -- and I have photographs that I can --
14 copies of photographs that you can take a look at. But just
15 to sort of give you a sense of how sort of unordered the
16 existing site plan is. We're not really changing all that
17 much with the house. But the -- I think the landscaping was
18 sort of built over a period of time. The pool was -- I'm not
19 exactly sure when the pool was --

20 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: 1970.

21 JON SCHICK: 1970. There's a small terrace --
22 this is back of the house here. On the front of the house
23 here. This is the studio space that was added in the --

24 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: 50s.

25 JON SCHICK: 50s? Okay. But the original

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 house stops -- the original house stops right there. But
4 there's all these sort of -- kind of -- sort of random walls
5 and stairs and things like that back there that we want to
6 try to sort of create some order with this new opportunity to
7 develop the site because it is an amazing site. And that
8 this is -- the houses are really quite nice.

9 So, that's really the -- as far of the design,
10 the changes to the house we can also talk about those
11 separately, I think. But they're all sort of -- kind of tied
12 together in a sense that their intent is to try to sort of
13 develop the outdoors for entertaining and create this sort of
14 family room kind of space where the studio would work in
15 concert with the outdoors. And, you know, sort of have an
16 easier route -- or an easier way to get from the inside to
17 the outside. Maybe direct this flow a little bit better and
18 improve the esthetics of the spaces and the finishes and
19 whatnot.

20 Right now, this is a screened porch on the
21 back of the house that's in a pretty bad state of disrepair
22 at this point.

23 And the big move we would like to make there
24 is to at least turn that into a condition space. We would
25 primarily be reconstructing it. It was pretty root measured

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 when it was built. Just basically rough lumber and a screen
4 stapled to it. There's not a whole lot there. But we do
5 want to try to maintain that same footprint and improve --
6 like I said, improve upon -- I'll grab some photos. Here,
7 you can sort of pass these around if you'd like. There's --
8 I'll kind of separate them out a little bit. Some of them
9 are more detailed photos. So, pass those around. They're
10 sort of in order of starting with the front of the house and
11 kind of working your way around the house just to sort of
12 show you the condition of certain parts of the components of
13 the house. The intent would be to try to keep the original
14 part of the house intact. Eventually, I know they want to
15 replace the windows. Somebody put vinyl windows in, removed
16 the steel sash windows that used to be there. I don't think
17 we're going to be putting steel sash windows in. But we will
18 be putting in something that's a little bit more
19 complimentary and sensitive, you know, we'll try to approach
20 the look of a more -- more like a steel sash window. It
21 would be black frames. And we would probably match the mount
22 and pattern of the original windows. But that's sort of a --
23 I'm not exactly sure what the -- what phase that would be
24 because the windows that are there are relatively new and in
25 good condition. So, there's not a rush to put new windows

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 in. So, I know that's part of the master plan, and I'm not
4 sure exactly when that would occur.

5 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Our thought is
6 within that -- probably after -- post-architectural project
7 on the back of the house, once that is done, we would match
8 windows to that decision that we make if we were able to do
9 the back of the house. So, that's probably two years out at
10 this point.

11 JON SCHICK: Okay. So, I guess I'll show
12 you -- I guess I'll just start with the elevations. So,
13 these are proposed elevations -- I don't know how else to do
14 this with you guys -- on the front of the house, I guess I'll
15 just start with -- propose to you the changes they wanted to
16 make on the front of the house. There's a canopy over the
17 front door that's in pretty bad shape that we'd like to
18 basically reconstruct it and get it more stable and more
19 watertight and flashed properly. The studio addition, which
20 is on the left here, right now is clad and homes oak. That's
21 the original material on the exterior. Right now, the
22 existing grade is probably about a foot right up onto the
23 homes oak. It's rotted. So, we want to lower the grade.
24 We'd like to replace the homes oak with something that's a
25 little more durable and current with today's standards.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 We're proposing shiplap siding there. So, it would be
4 painted probably the same color as the house. The shiplap
5 joints will be very subtle. So, it won't look as stripy as
6 what's on the left-hand drawing. There's an existing French
7 door at that end -- the studio doors to the fireplace
8 chimney. We are proposing to replace that with a window and
9 with a transom above it. And then we'd also like to add
10 three clerestory windows in the same -- at the same elevation
11 as the transom window. If you look at the photos, you can
12 see that elevation is pretty flum. There's just not a lot
13 going on there. The front of the house is pretty -- it's
14 just very simple and not very -- it's not super exciting.
15 So, anyhow, we'd like to just start kind of improve upon
16 that. And the plan is to renovate that studio space and
17 reconstruct a new space where the screened porch is, and
18 that's where most of the work is going to be to the house.

19 I think the other items that Jason and Bill
20 would like to work on would be replacing the glass block
21 windows on the stair, either with new glass block or some
22 alternative. We would like to add a window --

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Excuse me. Is there
24 something wrong with the glass windows?

25 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: The bottom

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 right-hand block is cracked. It creates a lot of fog and
4 into the kitchen rotting. So, that's basically --

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The glass block is
6 original to the house?

7 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's original?

9 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes.

10 JON SCHICK: We would like to add a window
11 from the first-floor bathroom, which would be some sort of
12 cantilever section on the second floor. Right now, there's a
13 dogwood tree that you don't even really see that wall. But
14 we would add a window that is similar to -- similar portions
15 and size to other windows that exist on the house. All
16 right. So, that would be really the extent of the work we
17 would do on the front of the house.

18 On the east side of the garage is -- the
19 garage is at the lower level -- there's a cantilever concrete
20 catwalk that accesses a door -- kitchen door -- which we
21 wanted to get rid of the catwalk because it's sagging very
22 badly. It's gonna -- with something covering up the bottom
23 of the catwalk. Some other structure, which we don't know
24 what it is because we haven't demoed it or anything. But
25 we'd like to do a similar structure there to what we're

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 proposing at the front of the -- front entrance just to sort
4 of replicate the presence of that catwalk there without it
5 really being a catwalk. That entrance is really not a
6 very -- it's not in a really -- very good location. And it's
7 not -- I don't think they use it.

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: We've never even
9 been -- walking along that catwalk feels -- it's too
10 dangerous right now to even think about using it honestly.

11 JON SCHICK: I don't know if I'd walk that
12 catwalk. But we would like to re-create a canopy there and
13 it would sort of take the place of that concrete catwalk
14 that's hanging off of a building there.

15 So, there's a door that goes into their
16 kitchen that we'd like to replace with a window. And there's
17 a window that we would like to either eliminate or -- if we
18 can eliminate it, we'd like to eliminate it. Otherwise, they
19 would just sort of cover it up because it's not working with
20 their proposed kitchen plan.

21 So, then on the back of the house, that's
22 where the majority of the changes would be occurring. So,
23 one of the biggest complications with the back of the house
24 that lives right now is, this lower level, the studio space
25 is where they spend most of their time. It's sort of like a

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

family room. There's a fireplace there. And it will be much improved once we renovate it to the way it currently exists. But it's at the opposite of the house. So, the kitchen is over here. This is where they'll entertain. This is, you know, direct access to the pool, to the terrace and to the outdoors. So, in order to try to fix that, we would like to -- in the kitchen space, we would like to add either a sliding glass door or French doors. And we would like to create a catwalk coming out of that door across the back of the building with stairs down to the existing terrace level. And then, when they are entertaining there, they have a pretty direct -- and the grill -- the grill would be located right at the foot of the stairs somewhere. But when they're entertaining, they would have direct access to the kitchen, direct access to the outdoors. And it would sort of work pretty well with getting back and forth to the pool and to the outdoor spaces. Where the existing studio space is and the screened porch -- which is this space here -- we are looking to -- like I said, rebuild the screened porch. It's not built very well and it's in pretty bad shape. The floor is rotting and whatnot. But two sides of the existing screened porch are cantilevered out of the foundation. And we were -- we'd like to sort of maintain that detail on the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 new house -- or excuse me, the new new enclosure that we're
4 proposing to build. And we have actually made it a little
5 bit -- in so doing it, we've made it a little bit larger.
6 So, it's about a foot bigger in both directions. Width and
7 in depth.

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Jon, may I say
9 something for one second?

10 JON SCHICK: Sure.

11 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Part of the
12 motivation on this is that my father and step mother own a
13 baby grand piano that was at the Leman Arts Conservatory that
14 they're giving to us. And to create a space for that piano
15 to live is why we need to do the extension of the living
16 room. Our thought is, it's going to be an art studio for
17 music space. So, we're staying in the theme of why it was
18 built as far as supporting the arts, if you will. But that
19 was the catalyst, to expand the space so we have a home for
20 the baby grand piano.

21 JON SCHICK: Thanks.

22 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Absolutely.

23 JON SCHICK: I forgot about that. So, the
24 screened porch is going to look very similar to the way it
25 does now given that what is now -- with the posts and the

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

grid of the screen panels will now be glazed. And we're going to open up the wall between the screened porch and the existing studio space so those two spaces can work in concert. We are changing the access from the upper level to the lower level so it's more direct, it's more open. We'll be matching -- there's arched opened windows from the front entry to the living room. We'll be matching that arch in the wall which is what's at the end of the house. So, that will be the new entrance into the family room. There will be a wet bar down there. We've added another sliding glass door here which is -- will provide more direct access to the exterior. Currently, the only way for them to get outside is to go through the studio space, into the screened porch and out of the screened porch. There is a big window here. It's about the same size as this French door -- or sliding glass door. So, currently, it's glazed. But it's not an operable door that can be used for getting in and out.

And so then, for this new glass room that is constructed, that will be -- that won't have any doors coming out of it anymore. So, the main exit will be the sliding glass door. And then this glass room will be more of a destination than something that you can pass through. And that will -- you know, they'll have a television in there and

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 that will also be their hanging out space. The studio space
4 will be -- we plan to enhance the fireplace there. As Bill
5 was saying, the piano will be in there and it will just be
6 more just of a seating area. The two spaces will really work
7 in concert.

8 On the west elevation of the house right now
9 is the pool equipment is there. There is a very old,
10 antiquated outdoor shower that I don't think works anymore.
11 And there's also -- I'll show you right here. So right now,
12 there's sort of this terrace -- this paver terrace that is a
13 couple feet above the pool deck --

14 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: That was done by the
15 owners previous to us.

16 JON SCHICK: And there's a stair that has this
17 concrete wall -- the original concrete wall sort of stuck in
18 the middle of it. That's a little funky. And there's a lot
19 of loose rubble stone walls that are not really all that well
20 constructed and not really all that stable. So now, they
21 would have to -- they would come through the room out, out in
22 the screened porch, out here, down these steps over here,
23 down those steps to get to the pool. And then there is
24 this -- the pool deck currently isn't quite large enough to
25 really occupy, you know, pool furniture, chess's and seating

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 area and things of that sort. It's just slightly a little
4 bit under scale for some -- outdoor furniture tends to be
5 large in scale. This terrace was added by the last owner to
6 try to fix that problem. The problem is, this terrace is so
7 remote from the rest of the house and the rest of the
8 activities and the grill and all that sort of stuff. So,
9 when people are sitting over here, they feel really -- kind
10 of lost. So, we'd like to eliminate this terrace and we want
11 to develop this area here, at the end on the pool, as a
12 terrace and create a new way to access all these different
13 levels and just sort of clean it up and make it a little bit
14 more orderly. There's existing terrace here we plan to keep.

15 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: That's the original.

16 JON SCHICK: What's that?

17 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: And that's the
18 original one.

19 JON SCHICK: Correct. That's the original
20 terrace. There is this existing stoop coming out of the
21 living room with sort of a pair of stairs flared at the
22 bottom to get down to grade that are in really bad condition.
23 So, this is the area where we'd like to create a catwalk and
24 that's really where we'd like to put the door in the kitchen.
25 And we'd like to remove this because this is in such bad

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

condition and do something that is a little more similar to what we're doing with the glass room and that it would be -- we'd like to do a steel structure. And it would be sort of light and airy. And the -- we'd have -- the structure post would be set back from the catwalk. So, it would feel a little more -- it would feel very similar to the catwalk that was on the original garage doors. And sort of try to -- sort of a nod to the original details on that house. So, it would be sort of open below. So, it wouldn't be anything dense. There's a window under here that they would like to expose. Which by removing this, they can expose that window that's coming out of the basement. It's really not a large home. Once the -- what it was like before the addition was put on, it was really like one large room on the first floor and a kitchen and service area. So, they use the lower level. The garage is on the lower level. The bedroom is on the lower level. Laundry is going to be down there still. So, the basement is really about a half level below this back terrace here. You can see there's several steps down the grade. So, these windows that exist in the basement are directly exposed to the exterior. So, they bring in a lot of light. So, by removing this, keeping an opened area underneath, we can further enhance the light level in the basement.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 I think that kind of sums up everything that
4 we are proposing to do. I can show you the proposed plan.
5 And you can sort of see -- if it's easier for me -- or to
6 pass this around for you guys to take a look at it, that's
7 fine too. So, at our last meeting, Bill and Jason both
8 expressed interest in doing -- or replace the concrete walls
9 rather than some sort of -- either cement concrete walls or
10 some stone walls. You can see from the pictures, I don't
11 think the stone walls that are there are very compatible with
12 the style of the house. They're very, very irregular and
13 very small in scale. Some of these retaining walls are
14 between three to four feet tall. They're just -- it's not a
15 good fit for anything more than a couple feet in terms of
16 being stable. They just don't have the mass to retain that
17 much soil. So, this is -- I guess starting from the living
18 room, this is where that existing archway is from the front
19 hall into the living room. We're going to match that arched
20 opening here and there. There's four steps down into the
21 studio space and we'll basically just renovate that interior.
22 Like I said, enhancing the fireplace walls. Right now, it's
23 raw. Painted concrete wall. We want to replace the French
24 doors there and the window and add the three clerestory
25 windows.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: And our intention
4 is -- would be the French doors. Whether to replace the
5 window and removing the wall or the window. It's a mirror
6 feel of the French door that's there.

7 JON SCHICK: Right now, the structure for this
8 space was the beams are four feet on center which is a nice
9 detail. They're exposed. We want to keep them exposed in
10 the studio space. So, the location of the doors -- the door
11 and clerestory windows -- but the door isn't really -- I
12 mean, this window is in the location of the existing doors
13 and it does not relate to the location of the beams.

14 So, the clerestory windows will relate to the
15 positioning of the beams and the ceiling. And this would be
16 the glass room that we're talking about. It would be
17 primarily glass on two sides. Most of this -- it's the east?

18 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: West.

19 JON SCHICK: West elevation will be more
20 subtle. There will be one long window in the corner just to
21 sort of open up that corner of the room. And then this space
22 would have flat ceiling and we would sort of further
23 demarcate the flat space different from the studio space by
24 having all this glass by having, you know, different
25 materials, different ceiling -- a slightly lower ceiling, and

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 have a great view of the pool and the backyard.

4 Outside of the sliding glass door -- this is
5 the wet bar on the back of the living room fireplace. And
6 then there will be an eight-foot sliding glass door out onto
7 a stoop, down to the grade. This whole area would be level
8 except for the stoop. This whole area would be level. This
9 is basically where one of these flights of stairs of the
10 matching stone flare of stairs. But this would be a stair
11 that would go up to this catwalk that accesses these sliding
12 glass doors coming out of the kitchen.

13 Then as far as getting down to grade, there
14 are a couple different levels. This level is basically
15 similar to what's there now. If we're going to try to re-use
16 this into the foundation of this existing screened porch, we
17 don't want to lower the grade here because I think we would
18 be exposing the foundation. So, I think I want to keep that
19 elevation relatively the same. So, you would come down this
20 flight of stairs. I think five to six steps to that level.
21 And then down two more steps to this terrace that overlooks
22 the pool. And then from that level, there will be pavers
23 that would get you over to this area which will stair up to a
24 new outdoor shower and the utility court which is where all
25 the mechanical equipment is for the pool.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 We want to lower the grade on this side.

4 We're going to -- where this end of the structure leads out,
5 we're going to use that area underneath as storage for
6 cushions for the chairs and whatnot.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Now, do you plan -- I
8 assume you will try to do this in phases?

9 JON SCHICK: Yeah, I think so. I mean, they
10 wouldn't want to do the addition right away.

11 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yeah. We'd like to
12 start moving on the addition of the house post-holiday.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And the plans on that is
14 relative to that?

15 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes.

16 MR. PAGE: Is that giving us the overview
17 knowledge?

18 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes. This is the
19 overview.

20 MR. GORDON: May I just ask for clarification
21 here. I thought I heard you said post-holiday. What does
22 that mean?

23 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: I'm the general
24 manager at Macy's. So, I would be --

25 MR. GORDON: After Christmas --

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: After Christmas,
4 yes.

5 MR. GORDON: -- not post-Labor Day, which
6 would be next week?

7 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: No, no.
8 Post-Christmas, yes. We actually have started kitchen
9 renovations. Again, two projects with three little dogs is
10 nearly impossible. So, we're planning for post --

11 MR. GORDON: Early next year?

12 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Yes. Thank you for
13 the clarification on the holiday. I appreciate it.

14 JON SCHICK: So, the grades actually worked
15 out really nicely in terms of stepping down and getting out
16 in the backyard. Right now, this is just sort of, like, a
17 ramp --

18 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Stepping stones.

19 JON SCHICK: Semi-lawn area. You can see in
20 the photo, there's the planting -- sort of a planting bed
21 with some mosses and stuff that separate that from the pool.
22 So, you know, the intent here is trying to create a really
23 nice flow, you know, sort of thing from the house directing
24 out and down to the pool. And then from there, you can get
25 out to these other sort of ancillary functions. Any sort of,

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 you know, maybe that requires a little bit more privacy when
4 you get out of the shower. And then they will still have
5 direct access to get out to the backyard which is extensive.

6 This is the existing terrace that's there that
7 they're going to keep. Right now, there's a long flight of
8 stairs that extends all the way down to the driveway. They
9 would like to create a door to the basement, which would
10 actually be at the end of the garage. So, it's shown on
11 here, but it's actually below level. It's not at the kitchen
12 level. So, we would -- instead of the stairs going straight
13 down, we're going to create a little landing here to pull the
14 grade back, build a small retaining wall there and have --
15 the garage is very small, so the door would have to swing
16 out. But we'd have a door that will allow access into the
17 garage. And then the gate which is now across here, we'll
18 move it so it has to swing out because it's enclosing the
19 swimming pool. So, that gate would still swing out here.
20 So, we'll reuse all the stone -- treads and stone -- residual
21 stone stuff that is currently there to create this stair
22 down. That is about it. And there's some other things on
23 the inside that, you know, right now this curved wall is --
24 has been sort of --

25 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Framed in.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 JON SCHICK: Yeah. It's been sort of covered
4 up. We're going to reveal that curved wall. But other than
5 that, the living room is pretty much done.

6 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: Living room's done.

7 JON SCHICK: The kitchen will be done very
8 soon. This is that first-floor bathroom I told you about.
9 There's sort of a walk-in shower here. And that's the
10 location where we'd like to have a window -- similar sized to
11 the other windows. There's a few different sizes of windows
12 on the original house. But that would be one of the sizes
13 that occurs.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You would try to pick
15 whatever new material for the window you would want rather
16 than do a vinyl and change everything?

17 JON SCHICK: We'll do a thorough review of
18 window options and figure out what window we want to use and
19 that would be the window we put in.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And then you would follow
21 suit with --

22 JON SCHICK: Then we would follow suit with
23 the rest of the house. So...

24 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: When the bathroom
25 was remodeled, the bathroom has no vents and no windows. So,

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 if the window is not okay, we understand that, but we need
4 some sort of vent.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't have any
6 objection to the window. I was just curious as to whether
7 that started the new foundation.

8 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: At that point, we
9 would be committed to doing all the windows.

10 JON SCHICK: So, now that we've gone through
11 all of that, this is going to make more sense. This is the
12 rear of the house. Like I said, this is where most of the
13 work is going to happen. This is that catwalk on the back of
14 the house that we're proposing to build. Sort of have a
15 piece of tube sealed at the perimeter and have cable railing,
16 a pipe rail which is similar to what's on the front of the
17 house. We want to try to keep the materials to the minimum
18 -- different materials to the minimum. So, we're talking
19 about poured placed concrete. Some sort of concrete pavers,
20 which I can show you. So, these are -- you can pass these
21 around. Those are some images of what we're talking about
22 for walls, terraces, and the texture. And sort of a feel of
23 these new terraces and step and retaining walls. This is the
24 sliding glass door on the back of the studio space. This is
25 the new room that's cantilevered out. This is the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 foundation. This is the outdoor shower. The utility court
4 that's on that side of the house. The one thing that we did
5 -- that isn't changing, that's apart from what's existing,
6 and there are pictures that I brought so you can see that,
7 right now, there's this faceted corner of the house which
8 stops at the canopy. So, it's faceted above the canopy but
9 not below the canopy. To my eye, it just feels very chopped
10 off. So, we talked about when we do rebuild the canopy, to
11 return the corner of it. Not to return it all the way back
12 to this wall. We'd return it back to maybe, you know, a
13 couple feet. And that does show up on the plan. And then
14 you can see it on the elevation. So, this is the canopy
15 right here. So, right now, it stops right at that corner.
16 So, we'd like to sort of return that around the corner a
17 little bit. Just to sort of -- because of the way this has a
18 facet and no facet, it feels a little more complete. And so,
19 if you'd like to pass these around. You guys haven't seen
20 anything over here so I apologize.

21 MS. DREHER: I see what you mean now. Yeah.

22 JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: I would like to make
23 one comment. There's been a lot of time in thinking this
24 through. We've started to engage Jon just as we got
25 notification that we were being considered for the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 preservation. So, I think what we're trying to engage today
4 is, if you do go ahead and approve us becoming a historic
5 preservation site -- house -- whether these plans are kind of
6 -- would be considered. So, we don't go ahead and spend a
7 lot of money on designs and further expenses with Jon, just
8 to get this sense, like, when we had some initial
9 conversation, he recommended bringing this to this committee
10 to have the consideration at the same time. So, we don't go
11 another three months, we come back with a whole bunch of
12 stuff and we spend a lot of money and you guys say no way.
13 This isn't something we would consider. So...

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We like to do that. We
15 like to give people ultimately one direction and say, oh, no
16 and go the other way.

17 JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: Exactly.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'm kidding.

19 WILLIAM BARNECUT-KEARNS: If we can change
20 direction, we can change direction.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's just a lot of --

22 JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: It's a lot of
23 information.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: A lot of information to
25 take in at once.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I certainly don't see any
4 overall objection to it.

5 MR. GORDON: Jerry, if I may. So, the
6 application before you presently --

7 MR. PAGE: Has nothing to do with this.

8 MR. GORDON: -- is for designation. I'm going
9 to recommend that the board spend some time deliberating that
10 application and make its determination on designation. And
11 once that is done, perhaps these folks can stick around and
12 you can provide them some feedback after the public hearing
13 is done and in an informal sort of way, to give them an idea
14 if you feel that anything that they've generally found today
15 is a non-starter for what would have to then be a certificate
16 of appropriateness application. And just so I can sort of
17 continue along that a little for your information, if the
18 board designates your property is a landmark tonight, any of
19 the exterior work that you're talking about doing would need
20 to be authorized by this board through an application process
21 called an application of board certificate of
22 appropriateness, under which this board would consider or it
23 is consistent with the historic character of the property.
24 It sounds like you want to start this work shortly after the
25 first of the year. Our last meeting of the year is scheduled

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 for December 19th. The cutoff date for applications for that
4 is November 19th. So, you have that and your architect has
5 that in mind as well. Then the month ahead of that, we have
6 a November 21st meeting. The cutoff date is October 27th.

7 JASON BARNECUT-KEARNS: And then I think we
8 understood the process. We had a discussion upfront and we
9 appreciate that. And I think generally we'll be in a foot of
10 snow because we're in Rochester. But I think it's just good
11 to -- we're just trying to get an assessment of the timeline.
12 It don't have to start immediately. We just want to
13 understand what the committee was thinking.

14 MR. GORDON: I would suggest that we focus on
15 the designation issue first. And then, perhaps share some
16 comments with the owners and/or architect with these plans
17 after we finish addressing this matter if the committee is
18 okay with that.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone else here
20 that would like to speak to the application before us?

21 Okay. I would like to close the public
22 hearing. Mr. Page, any concerns or questions?

23 MR. PAGE: Not about the application, no.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there a motion?

25 MR. GORDON: Yes. Chairperson Ludwig, I would

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

propose the following resolution for the board's consideration whereas application 8H-01-19 has been submitted for the designation of 30 Stoneham Road, in the Town of Brighton, Monroe County, State of New York, tax parcel number 123.17-2-3 as a landmark under the town's historic preservation law and whereas the Historic Preservation Commission duly called a public hearing to consider such designation, which a public hearing was duly held on August 29th, 2019, and all persons having an interest in such matter, having had an opportunity to be heard therein. And whereas based on the materials submitted at and testimony from the public hearing including the June 5th, 2019 application for designation submitted by town historian, Mary Jo Lanphear. That's L-a-n-p-h-e-a-r. The cultural resources survey prepared by Cynthia Howa, H-a-w -- I'm sorry. H-o-w-a, dated 1998. The update to said survey conducted by Katie Eggers, E-g-g-e-r-s, Comeau, C-o-m-e-a-u, dated April 18th, 2019 and the August 22nd, 2019 memorandum from town historian, Mary Jo Lanphear. The Historic Preservation Commission finds that the subject property possesses such historic value as part of the cultural, political, economic, architectural or social history of the town embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style and

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

it is the work of a significant designer based upon the fact that this Moderne -- is that the right word? Capital M-o-d-e-r-n-e style house stands out in the neighborhood area of a more traditional style. The house was designed in 1935 by Herbert Stern for Walter DiLima, D-i-L-i-m-a, Meyers and his wife Julianne and sold in 1938 to Dr. Harry L Segal, S-e-g-a-l, and his wife Evelyn. In 1953, the Segal's hired an architect, Roger Sheppard, S-h-e-p-p-a-r-d, to design an addition on the west side of the house for a painter studio for Mrs. Segal, a nationally known artist. 30 Stoneham Road is one of the few international style houses in Brighton. The house embodies the ideas of functionalism and modern technology with its mock shape, flat roof and stucco walls. Its design was a significant departure from the traditional houses from which Mr. Herbert Stern is noted. Mr. And Mrs. Meyers hired Frances Gott, G-o-t-t, to design a complementary landscape for 30 Stoneham Road. Gott first worked with known local landscape architect, Alling, A-l-l-i-n-g, DeForest, D-e-F-o-r-e-s-t, before opening his own practice in 1915. Later, Gott partnered with architect Walter Cassevear, C-a-s-s-e-v-e-a-r. It is hereby therefore resolved that the Town of Brighton application number 8H-01-19 for designation as a landmark of 30 Stoneham Road, tax parcel number

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

123.17-2-3 together with all of the above-referenced documents and any and all other documents, drawings, and photographs submitted in the public hearing be received and filed. And be it further resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby designates the above referenced subject property located at 30 Stoneham Road as a historic landmark pursuant to Chapter 224 of the Town Code based upon the commissions above, articulated findings regarding the historic value of the subject property, its association with the social, cultural, political and economic history of the town. The fact that it embodies the distinguishing characteristic of an architectural style and is the work of a significant designer. Period.

MR. WHITAKER: Wow.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: May I have someone put forth a motion on this?

MR. WHITAKER: I'll put forth a motion.

MS. ROBINSON: I'll second that motion.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Discussion? Or has it all been said?

MR. WHITAKER: It all has been said.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No discussion? Okay.

Mary Jo, would you call for a vote?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. Jerry Ludwig?

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

5 MS. LANPHEAR: Diana Robinson?

6 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Justin Delvecchio?

8 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: David Whitaker?

10 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

11 MS. LANPHEAR: John Page?

12 MR. PAGE: Yes.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: And Amanda?

14 MS. DREHER: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The motion stands to
16 approve. So, you're now designated.

17 MR. PAGE: So, could I -- I have a question
18 for the board. I have folks in town. I expect the meeting
19 to be lengthy this evening.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You may be excused.

21 MR. PAGE: I was wondering if I could beg the
22 indulgence of the board. It looks like we have a quorum for
23 the total quorum, and I'll make some comments. But would it
24 be okay if I departed? The chairman, I'd ask the chairman.
25 And I do apologize.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2

3

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You may.

4

MS. DREHER: Do we need you for the quorum?

5

MR. PAGE: No.

6

MS. DREHER: I can't go either.

7

MS. LANPHEAR: Oh, that's right.

8

MR. GORDON: We do need you.

9

MS. DREHER: Oh, right. That's only three.

10

MR. GORDON: Why don't we then -- if these

11

gentleman don't mind hanging out, I don't think the landmark

12

hearing is going to take long at all.

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No.

14

MR. GORDON: Why don't we do the landmark

15

hearing, get that done, get the vote taken and then John can

16

go.

17

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We'll give you ten

18

minutes max. Okay. Next item on the agenda, 6H-01-19

19

application of the Landmark Society of Western New York,

20

owner of the property at 2370 East Avenue, tax number

21

122.20-1-3, for a certificate of appropriateness to install

22

it, should be a gutter on rear of shed. I'll describe the

23

pros. Basically, there's a wooden trough gutter on the front

24

of the shed. Adjacent to that, we want to put one on the

25

rear because we've had -- originally, we were just going to

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 put a metal gutter and ask for permission of that, but we
4 decided to do the real deal because the runoff of the roof
5 has deteriorated at the lower portions of siding on that
6 shed. So, it would basically be the same as on the front.
7 Any questions?

8 MS. ROBINSON: I just don't see the
9 application --

10 MR. GORDON: Didn't have what?

11 MS. ROBINSON: The application number and the
12 date.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, I don't know that.

14 MR. GORDON: I think it was circulated prior
15 to the application number was assigned to them. But you do
16 have -- this is --

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You should have a picture
18 somewhere. I think you've already seen it.

19 MR. GORDON: This is application 6H-01-19.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. So, any questions
21 about that?

22 MR. GORDON: And you're talking on behalf of
23 the landmark society --

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

25 MR. GORDON: As part of the public hearing?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's correct.

4 MR. GORDON: And so, because Jerry and Amanda
5 are both on the board --

6 MS. DREHER: Yes.

7 MR. GORDON: Yes? Okay. They're not going to
8 vote on this matter because of their brief matter. I'm going
9 to have everyone stay in their seats and not have anyone
10 shift around.

11 So, Jon, you're actually running this part of
12 the meeting.

13 MR. PAGE: Okay. Any discussion? If not, can
14 we have a motion?

15 MR. GORDON: Sure. I'll make it shorter than
16 the last one.

17 MR. PAGE: Thank you.

18 MR. GORDON: Whereas application number
19 6H-01-19 has been submitted for a certificate of
20 appropriateness under the town's Historic Preservation Law
21 for improvement to property located at 2370 East Avenue owned
22 by the Landmark Society of Western New York, tax number
23 122.20-1-3, for improvement described as the installation of
24 gutters on the rear of the shed.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: A gutter on the rear of

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 the shed.

4 MR. GORDON: I'll take that correction. A
5 gutter on the rear of the shed. And whereas the Historic
6 Preservation Commission duly called a public hearing to
7 consider the matter on August 29th, 2019. And whereas the
8 necessary legal notice was published and the required sign
9 posted pursuant to town code. And whereas the public hearing
10 town law persons, having had interest in such matter, have
11 had an opportunity to be heard therein and whereas the
12 Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines pursuant
13 to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of The Town Code,
14 fit the composed above described part to the subject property
15 is consistent with the purposes of the town's Historic
16 Preservation Law and compatible with the property's historic
17 character. Based upon its review of the application, the
18 documents the town filed and received at the public hearing
19 and the testimony presented at the public hearing, it is
20 hereby resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission
21 hereby receives and files the above-described application.
22 And it is further resolved that the Historic Preservation
23 Commission hereby approves application 6H-01-19 for the
24 certificate of appropriateness for the above-described work
25 to be performed at the property located at 2370 East Avenue,

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 8/29/19

2
3 subject to the condition that the above-described work be
4 completed within one year from the date of approval.

5 MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Can I have a second? Oh,
7 I can't --

8 MR. DELVECCHIO: Second.

9 MR. PAGE: Can I get a vote now?

10 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay. Diana Robinson?

11 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

12 MS. LANPHEAR: Justin Delvecchio?

13 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

14 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay. David Whitaker?

15 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

16 MS. LANPHEAR: John Page?

17 MR. PAGE: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

19 Any other business we want to attend to?

20 MS. LANPHEAR: 3325 East Avenue.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is this the first time
22 we've seen this completed report?

23 MS. LANPHEAR: It was circulated because
24 people did not remember whether they had been sent out
25 before. And so Gretchen did send it out in advance of this

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

meeting.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I will suggest that we do not take action on this tonight, but we will consider it next time.

MS. DREHER: So, we're at the step where we would be --

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We would normally send a letter out.

MS. DREHER: -- directed to send a letter out?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

Any other business tonight? Motion to adjourn?

MR. WHITAKER: I'll move.

MS. DREHER: I'll second.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second call here?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Aye.

* * *

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

Brighton Zoning Board of Appeals 1/24/19

I, Alexandra K. Wiater, do hereby certify that I did report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;

Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

Dated this 13th day of September, 2019

At Rochester, New York

Alexandra K. Wiater