

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

PROCEEDINGS HELD BEFORE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
COMMISSION OF BRIGHTON AT 2300 ELMWOOD AVENUE, ROCHESTER, NEW  
YORK ON SEPTEMBER 26TH, 2019 AT APPROXIMATELY 7:15 P.M.

September 26th, 2019  
Brighton Town Hall  
2300 Elmwood Avenue  
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JOHN PAGE, Acting Chairperson.  
WAYNE GOODMAN  
AMANDA L. DREHER  
DIANA ROBINSON

MARY JO LANPHEAR  
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.  
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER  
Town Planner

NOT PRESENT:  
JERRY LUDWIG  
JUSTIN DELVECCHIO  
DAVID WHITAKER

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter  
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC  
21 Woodcrest Drive  
Batavia, New York 14020

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I'd like to call the  
4 meeting to order. Would you call the roll please, Ramsey?

5 MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Ludwig, Delvecchio,  
6 and Whitaker.

7 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: May I have an approval of  
8 the agenda please?

9 MR. GOODMAN: I make a motion to approve the  
10 agenda.

11 MS. ROBINSON: I'll second it.

12 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: All in favor?

13 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Stands approved. Anyone  
15 take a look at the minutes from August 29th?

16 MS. DREHER: Yes, I have a couple of  
17 corrections. Page 9, Line 24, it states, and the big move we  
18 would like to make there is to at least turn that into a  
19 condition space. Condition isn't the right word, does anyone  
20 recall what the right word would be?

21 MS. LANPHEAR: What page?

22 MS. DREHER: Page 9, Line 24.

23 MS. DREHER: This is regarding that  
24 international style house and the big move that we would like  
25 to make there is to at least turn that into a condition



1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 Page 33, Line 18, it is Cynthia Howk, H-O-W-K  
4 I think the record said H-O-W-A.

5 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: It's also on Page 5,  
6 Line 10.

7 MS. DREHER: Okay. Last one, Page 37,  
8 Line 6, go should be vote. That was me stating that I cannot  
9 vote on the certificate of appropriateness regarding the  
10 Landmark Society because I'm on the Board.

11 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I will add on Page 5,  
12 Line 17, I believe where the word credible is it should be  
13 critical.

14 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Any others? Can we get a  
16 motion to approve the minutes as amended?

17 MS. DREHER: I will move.

18 MS. ROBINSON: Second.

19 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: All in favor.

20 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Minutes are approved as  
22 amended. Thank you.

Has the meeting been duly advertised?

24 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, it was properly advertised  
25 in the Brighton Pittsford Post of September 12, 2019.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Okay. The meeting as  
4 advertised will now be held.

12 Is there anyone here to speak on that  
13 application? If you could come forward and state your name  
14 and possibly spell it if necessary.

25 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: But this application is to

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3 just for the windows identified in this application?

4

CHRIS GIONTA: Correct. There's two twin casements, that's all we are doing.

6

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Is this a product that will be installed in the existing frame?

8

CHRIS GIONTA: No. The existing frames are rotted so they need to be replaced.

10

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: The frame and sash will be removed?

12

CHRIS GIONTA: Correct

13

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: And the replacement windows will fit into the opening as it exists?

1

CHRIS GIONTA: Correct.

1

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: And with the same operation  
in terms of segment versus segment and so3

1

SUDIUS, GIGONI, & YANG

MS. ROBINSON: They are custom built to the

CHRIS GIONTA: Correct. Made to fit the

MR. GOODMAN: I did make note in the application that these are paintable and the paint will match the existing windows.

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

CHRIS GIONTA: Exactly right.

4

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Any other questions? Okay.

5

Anything you would like to add?

6

CHRIS GIONTA: No.

7

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Could we have a motion?

8

MR. GORDON: No. Are you closing the Public

9

## Hearing?

10

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: The Public Hearing is now closed.

12

MR. GORDON: Would you like a motion?

13

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Please.

14

MR. GORDON: I would ask one of the members to make the following motion, whereas Application 9H-01-19 has been submitted for a certificate of appropriateness under the Town's Historic Preservation Law for improvements to property located at 124 Summit Drive, owned by Marjorie, M-A-R-J-O-R-I-E, Searl, S-E-A-R-L, to perform work as described as the replacement of two wood-framed twin casement windows on the northwest corner of the second floor with Integrity fiberglass window frames to match the look of the existing windows. And whereas the Historic Preservation Commission duly called the Public Hearing to consider the matter on September 26, 2019. And whereas the necessary

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 legal notice was published and a required sign posted  
4 pursuant to Town Code. And whereas the Public Hearing was  
5 held and all persons having an interest in such matter having  
6 had an opportunity to be heard therein. And whereas the  
7 Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines pursuant  
8 to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code  
9 that the proposed above described work to the subject  
10 properties consistent with the purposes of the Town's  
11 Historic Preservation law and compatible with the property's  
12 historic character based upon it's review of the application  
13 and documents on file, and received at the Public Hearing and  
14 the testimony presented at the Public Hearing.

25 MS. ROBINSON: Painted.



1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

4

MS. DREHER: Yes.

5

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes with conditions.

6

Thank you for coming.

7

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: There's no hardship applications, the Public Hearings are closed.

9

There's no new business listed. Is there any new business from the members? Old business, 3225 East Avenue, this is the house that's been updated and is sort of in the cue. And so I'd suggest that we start the process, is there any opinion on that?

14

MS. DREHER: I think it's definitely worthy of the designation, so I believe we move forward with the sending of the letter.

17

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Would you like to make that motion?

10

MS. DBEHER: I would-

30

MR. GORDON: Do you want a formal motion or do you want an informal motion?

22

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Let's do it informally

22

MR. GORDON: That's fine.

34

MS. DREHER: I would move to send the owners, the Gravstones, a letter indicating that we are considering

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 designation as a landmark.

4 MR. GOODMAN: I will second that motion.

5 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

6 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

7 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

8 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

10 MR. PAGE: Yes.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

12 MS. DREHER: Yes.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So I'm not sure what we  
15 have in the cue at this point. Anybody have any thoughts on  
16 that? We ought to be putting something in the cue. I think  
17 Ramsey, can you confirm that we don't have any other new or  
18 updated?

19 MR. BOEHNER: I was just wondering myself.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: August 28th, we have a list  
21 from August of this year, surveyed but not designated.

22 MR. GORDON: Did we designate 30 Stoneham?

23 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, and they will be back in  
24 next month.

25 MR. GORDON: What's the cutoff for that

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 meeting. Bamsey?

4 MR. BOEHNER: I don't have a calendar with me,  
5 it could be this week?

6 MR. GORDON: Are no applications in yet?

13 MR. BOEHNER: It's a C of A meeting, it's not  
14 a designation.

15 MR. GORDON: I'm fibbing, I will be here.

18 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I think we completed that  
19 process of going through the ones, agreeing, 80 percent of  
20 the group that we had.

21 MR. GORDON: So the list I have is as of  
22 July 25, 2019? Do you think that is the --

23 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Yes, except the Glen  
24 Road --

25 MS. LANPHEAR: The Stan house?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

MR. GORDON: 69 Glen Road?

4

5 been removed, it would have been after that time, but don't  
6 take my word.

2

MS. LANPHEAR: I don't remember.

8

9 further updated?

10

10 MR. BOEHNER: I don't know, I don't have that.  
11 I have older ones, I cleaned out my binder. I think this is  
12 probably the last one, to be honest with you.

13

14

15

5

1

20

2.

23

23

2

2

the minutes and they would have been in the minutes for the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

August meeting I believe.

4

MS. DREHER: The three on Winton Road --

5

MR. GORDON: Do we have the August minutes?

6

MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

7

MS. DREHER: The last three on the list on Winton Road, I don't have notes on those.

9

MS. LANPHEAR: We didn't talk about those, I don't believe.

11

MS. DREHER: I have everything through the Westfall Road which is the Jalna house.

13

MR. GOODMAN: I don't remember the Winton.

16

MS. DREHER: I don't think we got to those.

18

MS. LANPHEAR: The 1356 I believe is an arts-and-crafts looking house. They got a new porch on it recently. 1495 is across the road is almost to the corner of Westfall, it's a very old wooden house associated with the brickyards.

20

MR. GORDON: Your point is that maybe the surveys should be sent out for those last three so the Board can look at them?

2

MS. DREHER: Yes.

2

MS. LANPHEAR: 1037 is owned by the religion  
congregation.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Right.

4 MS. DREHER: I have a note on that, it is rare  
5 Buckland brick, is that correct, 1037?

MS. LANPHEAR: That's a Chabad Lubavitch.

MS. ROBINSON: Across from the high school?

8 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. It's an interesting  
9 looking house, it sits quite a ways back from the road.

10 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: How are we on funds? Have  
11 we expended our funds for the year to the point where we  
12 shouldn't consider anymore?

13 MR. BOEHNER: I'm sorry?

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I was wondering if we had  
15 expended as much money as we should for this time of year.

16 MR. BOEHNER: I can check that. We saved some  
17 money, and I believe it would have been for a destination. I  
18 believe we might have been running a little tight.

19 MR. GORDON: My recollection would be that we  
20 have enough money to do one full survey. I assume all of  
21 these if you pick one off of this list will simply be  
22 updated. So we certainly have enough to pick up one of  
23 these. You are almost at October.

24 MR. BOEHNER: We need to order that up before  
25 the end of the year.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 MR. GORDON: Yes. I think you ought to be  
4 considering if there's money to do one, you do one; if  
5 there's money to do two updates, you do two updates. But you  
6 ought to do that perhaps make that decision if not now, at  
7 the October meeting at the latest.

8 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So I'd be happy if we  
9 picked two properties, at least one or two off the list. So  
10 that we could work on the list a little more. And if anybody  
11 wanted to put -- there's a couple on the list that we are  
12 keeping on the list even though there's a hesitation to have  
13 them on the list. I would suggest not going after those.

14 MS. LANPHEAR: What's the status of  
15 2133 Westfall, Jalna house. Is that one that was kept on the  
16 list or discarded?

17 MS. DREHER: I think it was kept on the list.  
18 I was going to look up the minutes because that day there was  
19 one I said on the record that I thought would be worthy of an  
20 update. I don't recall which one.

21 MS. ROBINSON: I think we didn't have enough  
22 people, so I said no.

23 MS. DREHER: I don't think it came off the  
24 list. I don't remember which one.

25 MS. ROBINSON: Something procedural.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3 MS. LANPHEAR: 3333 Elmwood Avenue is, I think  
4 it was kept on the list too. That's the one on the corner of  
5 Elmwood and Clover, southeast corner of Elmwood and Clover.  
6 Ray Burchfield house, which may be a bit of controversy.

7

8 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I believe we kept the Jalna  
9 house. We also -- there was maybe one house that -- no, that  
10 1890 to 1940 was the one I have listed here as retained.

11

12 for you to grab copies of the minutes from August and July?

13

14 of these on here you say you think are not particularly  
15 controversial? The Chabad, I think we've sort of decided we  
16 wouldn't push that since it's a religious organization and  
17 they were reluctant.

18

10

30

81

8

Forbes Court Reporting Services, LLC (585) 343-8612

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

3 initial conversation with us was, we don't really have to  
4 come to you but we are as a courtesy. And we've talked to  
5 Arlene, and they sort of made the decision for instance to go  
6 with the addition with clapboard instead of brick to  
7 distinguish it. I think they thought that was a great idea  
8 because it was less money.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: And --

11 MR. GORDON: So not August, how about July?

12 MR. BOEHNER: What are you looking for?

13 MR. GORDON: Looking for Amanda's comments.

14 MS. DREHER: We talked about the nursery  
15 school. There's some I believe that might have been one.

16 MS. LANPHEAR: I believe we kept it.

17 MR. BOEHNER: No, we took the nursery school  
18 off.

19 MS. DREHER: That was the one I was talking  
20 about. There was -- you felt strongly about that and I think  
21 you felt strongly the other way. So I said, I'm kind of  
22 thinking we keep it on the list and if the budget allows, get  
23 an updated survey, unless you get some additional information  
24 in making a decision. So I said I would keep it on the list  
25 for that purpose. I don't know how we feel today about that.



Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

7. *What is the best way to increase the number of people who use a particular service?*

MS. LANBHEAR: Yes, please.

5 MR. GOODMAN: So is Ramsey going to check and  
6 see if the survey has been updated and if that survey has not  
7 been updated, is that one we would like to pursue?

13 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So be thinking about --

14 MR. BOEHNER: I'm also going to be sending  
15 surveys out for 1037, 1356, and 1495 Winton Road.

16 MS. DREHER: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: -- be thinking about any  
18 other properties in case we have the money for updates, for a  
19 second update.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So we can keep some things  
22 in the cue moving forward.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

MS. DREHER: I will move.

4

MR. GOODMAN: Second.

5

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: All in favor.

6

ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

7

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Thank you all.

8

\* \* \*

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1

1

6

35

1

2

## 3                   REPORTER CERTIFICATE

4

5                   I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did  
6 report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in  
7 the above-entitled matter;

8                   Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and  
9 accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at  
10 the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

11

12                   Dated this 28th day of October, 2019.

13                   At Rochester, New York

14

15

16

  
Rhoda Collins

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25