

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

PROCEEDINGS HELD BEFORE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION OF BRIGHTON AT 2300 ELMWOOD AVENUE, ROCHESTER, NEW
YORK ON NOVEMBER 21ST, 2019 AT APPROXIMATELY 7:15 P.M.

November 21st, 2019
Brighton Town Hall
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON
AMANDA L. DREHER
WAYNE GOODMAN
JOHN PAGE
DIANA ROBINSON

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
Town Planner

NOT PRESENT:
JUSTIN DELVECCHIO
DAVID WHITAKER

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'd like to call the
4 meeting to order. Would you call the roll please, Ramsey?

5 MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Whitaker and
6 Delvecchio.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do we have minutes?

8 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Did anyone read them?

10 MS. DREHER: Yes. I have a couple changes.
11 These are the September minutes. Two locations where
12 destination of landmarks should be designation of landmarks,
13 that's Page 5, Line 5, and Page 15, Line 17.

14 Page 10, Lines 24 to 25, Greystones should be
15 spelled with an "E" for the grey and plural Greystones,
16 that's the name of the house.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other additions or
18 corrections? Motion to approve the agenda such as it is?

19 MR. GOODMAN: Do we want to approve the
20 minutes?

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I will do the agenda
22 first.

23 MR. PAGE: I will make that motion.

24 MR. GOODMAN: Second.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor of the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 agenda?

4 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other additions or
6 corrections of the minutes? Motion to approve the minutes as
7 corrected?

8 MS. DREHER: I'll move.

9 MR. PAGE: Second.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

11 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The minutes stand
13 approved. Was this meeting duly advertised?

14 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, it was properly advertised
15 in the Brighton Pittsford Post of November 7, 2019.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That meeting as duly
17 advertised will now be held. We have no communications, no
18 designation of landmarks, no certificates of appropriateness,
19 hardship applications none, the Public Hearings are now
20 closed. New business, any new business?

21 MR. PAGE: The updated, I don't know if that's
22 old or new business.

23 MR. BOEHNER: It's old business.

24 MR. PAGE: Okay.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any new business? Old

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 business?

4 MR. PAGE: I didn't bring it with me, we got
5 an updated --

6 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, we did for 1140 Clover
7 Street.

8 MR. PAGE: Okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's the Finucane
10 house, right?

11 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If it wasn't the Finucane
13 house, would we designate it?

14 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, we would, because it's
15 J. Foster Warner.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So that will be on
17 the -- well, is there any reason why we can't get the ball
18 rolling on that?

19 MR. PAGE: Yes, I would suggest that too.

20 MS. DREHER: I would agree.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We need a motion to send
22 a letter. Do you want to call a roll on that one, Ramsey?

23 MR. BOEHNER: Is there a motion?

24 MR. PAGE: I will make that motion.

25 MS. DREHER: I will second it.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. GORDON: The motion is to --

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Send a letter --

5 MR. GORDON: -- send an initial letter to
6 start the destination process for the property at 1140 Clover
7 Street.

8 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

10 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

11 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

12 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

13 MS. DREHER: Yes.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

15 MR. PAGE: Yes.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman.

17 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Without taking a
20 formal vote, what is -- I've yet to go by Winton Road, 1037.
21 Is that the 12 Corners, is that the brick?

22 MS. LANPHEAR: It is. It's the Buckland brick
23 house across from the high school.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. What's the general
25 feeling on that? Do we want to add that to the mix?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. DREHER: I attended the, it was actually
4 the national commission -- National Alliance of Preservation
5 Commissions training in Corning last month and I did ask --
6 one of the presenters was an attorney, and I did ask about
7 designating a religious building and her general thought was
8 that generally we would not be able to enforce requirements
9 to come for a certificate of appropriateness or against
10 demolition, but it is common practice to designate such
11 properties if they are warranted thinking that for the future
12 that if it changes hands into a nonreligious organization.
13 And also just for community awareness and often times the
14 religious organizations do want to cooperate and are, you
15 know, fine with that. So I think that our question before
16 was whether it really was worth it to pursue designation, I
17 think it is if we think that it meets the qualities.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Well, we have
19 designated religious structures in the past.

20 MS. DREHER: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I would say that should
22 probably be next in the cue.

23 MR. BOEHNER: Do we need that survey to be
24 updated?

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's a good question.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 Was it one of the original ones or was it done later?

4 MR. BOEHNER: I'm going to look right now, I
5 think it is. One of the things I did want to talk to this
6 commission about, are there any other surveys that we want to
7 have performed or other updates we want to have performed?
8 We still have money in the budget. We have one that was just
9 completed, there's a second one that's being worked on as we
10 meet, and there's still money there. And if I remember --

11 MR. PAGE: What's the one being worked on,
12 Ramsey?

13 MR. BOEHNER: That is a good question.

14 MR. GORDON: 332 South Landing Road we
15 authorized for an update and 1140 Clover Street which we've
16 now initiated the process on.

17 MR. BOEHNER: What we have money for is one
18 survey or four more updates. And we don't want to spend the
19 money --

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's a fiscal calendar
21 year?

22 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, one survey or four updates.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Does anyone know of
24 anything that hasn't been surveyed that we might want to
25 survey? I don't know, there probably is something.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. DREHER: For some reason I thought it was
4 four updates, but then we did 1140 Clover Street?

5 MR. BOEHNER: No, I have us at six.

6 MR. GORDON: Okay.

7 MR. BOEHNER: One survey or two updates, or
8 just six updates, and we've ordered two.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, we're pretty
10 certain that we need -- we should do an update before we
11 designate. I guess we should look at updating 1037 Winton
12 Road if it hasn't been updated. Has that been done?

13 MS. LANPHEAR: No.

14 MR. GOODMAN: That would be a good idea.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What else do we have? Do
16 we have room for another update or two?

17 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, we do.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We have to vote on them
19 by the end of the year, we do not have to necessarily spend
20 it?

21 MR. BOEHNER: I have to order it.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So if we order at
23 this meeting or the next meeting we'll be okay.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Best if we did it this meeting
25 just for procurement of the assessor's office.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

4 MR. GORDON: Before we leave the subject of
5 1037 South Clinton Road, I want to raise again my suggestion
6 I made at the last meeting which was in the past when we have
7 designated religious institutions we've made an effort to
8 reach out to the leaders of that religious institution in
9 advance of designation. For example, we had a great
10 cooperation from the Temple Sinai most recently in great
11 support.

12 I would suggest that we find a way to reach
13 out to the Chabad community and my suggestion at the last
14 meeting is that we tap the supervisor on the shoulder to have
15 a chat with the Rabbi over there to get at least a sense of
16 what the Chabad community is going to think about this
17 process so that we know whether we have a cooperative owner
18 or not.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Would you like to
20 make that --

21 MR. GORDON: Do you want me to make that
22 overture?

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. You see him more
24 often than I do.

25 MR. GORDON: Probably so.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. GOODMAN: Jerry, that's the same property
4 that we just ordered the update, correct? The survey?

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I guess, do we want to
6 order the update? How do we want to get the horse here?

7 MR. GOODMAN: My thought was that would be a
8 nice way to sort of maybe an entree to a discussion, we would
9 like to update the survey and then maybe educate them on the
10 process and get their feedback.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

12 MR. GORDON: I like that.

13 MS. DREHER: I agree.

14 MS. ROBINSON: I liked Amanda's statement that
15 this could be for the future. You don't know what's going to
16 happen, if it changes hands. Even if the people are not too
17 interested right now.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So if you would do that.

19 MR. GORDON: Sure.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think it would be
21 appropriate to make a motion to have the survey updated and
22 regardless of how that meeting goes, that would be good for
23 the record. So can I make a motion for the survey to be
24 updated?

25 MS. DREHER: I'll move to update the survey

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 for 1037 Winton Road.

4 MR. GOODMAN: And I'll second that.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

6 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All right folks, what
8 else?

9 MR. BOEHNER: We have 1495 South Winton Road
10 was another one we --

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't know what that
12 is.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: 1495 is the frame house, it's
14 yellow.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is that the Sears house?

16 MS. LANPHEAR: No, it's a distance away from
17 the ambulance house, just across Westfall near the ambulance
18 house. There's a blank lot and then there's the yellow house
19 and that's the 1495. I can't think of the name of the family
20 that lives there. They were part of the brickyard workers.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

22 MS. LANPHEAR: It's not a distinct architect
23 designed house by any means.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The only reason we would
25 is because somebody that worked in the brickyard lived there?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, and the fact that the
4 owner is very interested in preserving the house. He has
5 been restoring it and doing research and so forth over the
6 last three/four/five years I have been in touch with him. He
7 is kind of interested in the history of the house and I think
8 he might be amenable to having the house designated.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That raises it a notch or
10 two. I guess it's up to you.

11 MS. LANPHEAR: I have not done a lot of
12 research on it.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If we update the survey
14 and we do not designate it, is the owner going to get cranky?

15 MS. LANPHEAR: For 1495, I don't think that
16 would be a problem, but let me do some more work on the
17 place.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just as it stands I don't
19 see that as qualifying. I mean, yes, he's got his interest
20 but the house certainly has --

21 MS. LANPHEAR: It's simple.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, that's not pure.

23 MR. GORDON: I thought at the last meeting
24 that Amanda had raised the issue that there were some
25 properties she had not yet seen surveys on, they had not been

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 sent out. This might have been one of those?

4 MS. DREHER: This wasn't, no. We had this
5 one.

6 MR. GORDON: So had this one already been
7 reviewed by the Board to stay on the list?

8 MR. GOODMAN: No, I don't think so.

9 MS. DREHER: Did we talk about this at the
10 last meeting briefly?

11 MR. GOODMAN: I wasn't there.

12 MR. PAGE: We did, it was pretty much the
13 discussion we just had.

14 MR. GORDON: Was there a decision made to
15 leave it on the list?

16 MS. DREHER: I think it was a decision made to
17 talk about it again next month.

18 MR. BOEHNER: I think it was because --

19 MR. PAGE: Kick the can down the road.

20 MR. BOEHNER: I think that's exactly what
21 happened because I show to keep it on the agenda.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I guess I'd rather use
23 our funds doing something else then, if that's okay with you
24 all.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Then consideration should be

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 given to removing it from the list then.

4 MR. GORDON: If there's no real interest on
5 the Board for designating this property then it really should
6 not stay on the list.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. That's okay with
8 me. Shall we vote on removing it from the list?

9 MR. GORDON: Someone should make that motion.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Does anyone want to make
11 that motion?

12 MS. ROBINSON: I move to remove 1495 South
13 Winton Road from the list of survey properties that have not
14 yet been designated.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We're still protected
16 should someone come along and want to come knock it down.

17 MR. GOODMAN: I guess a comment I would like
18 to make is that Mary Jo says the owner has been interested
19 and he is doing maybe an elongated restoration, just maybe
20 keep in mind that at a time whenever the rehab gets to a
21 certain point we might wish to reconsider this if he's
22 actually restoring some of the integrity.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Or we say, what the hell
24 were you thinking?

25 MR. GORDON: Removing it from the list does

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 not mean that it can't get put back on the list.

4 MR. GOODMAN: Second.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do you want to record a
6 vote on that, Ramsey, or an oral vote?

7 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

10 MS. DREHER: Yes.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

12 MR. PAGE: Yes.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

14 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

15 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson.

16 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

17 MR. BOEHNER: We will remove it from the list.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, folks.

19 MR. BOEHNER: I did want to give you an update
20 on the adjournment. The property owner is at this point not
21 supportive of having his property designated.

22 MR. GORDON: Which property?

23 MR. BOEHNER: This is back to 3225.

24 MR. GORDON: The one postponed.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Yes. He had an experience I

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 believe with the property he owned in the city quite a while
4 ago and when he tried to sell it he had some problems due to
5 the historic destination with the transaction. So he is
6 hesitant to do it, but he appreciated the adjournment and he
7 will come to the meeting on December 19th.

8 MS. LANPHEAR: Would he like to meet with
9 anyone prior to that?

10 MR. BOEHNER: He did not express that. He was
11 very busy, he was trying to get out of town. Most of my
12 conversation was, I can grant you an adjournment but you have
13 to give me something in writing. And in writing you have to
14 tell me that you are not going to make any changes to the
15 exterior of the building. And I was actually talking with
16 him while he was on an airplane flying somewhere. He was
17 responsive, but I had to keep it brief and he's not in town
18 right now.

19 MR. GORDON: He did provide at least
20 electronic communication too.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, and I told him that was
22 going to be acceptable and I have communicated with his
23 attorney. And he was quite pleasant and reasonable, there
24 was no issue that way. He was not going to be in town was
25 his biggest issue.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. GORDON: Is it your sense that they're
4 going to come into the hearing with evidence to establish why
5 it should not be designated?

6 MR. BOEHNER: That, I don't know. I have not
7 talked to the attorney. I have communicated telling him that
8 we adjourned it.

9 MR. GORDON: And since we do have a pending
10 hearing on this, I would not encourage the Board or staff to
11 meet with the owners to provide additional grounds for what
12 there might be reasons not to designate it. The hearing has
13 a purpose and that's the place and the time for the Board and
14 whoever else has an interest in this property to put
15 information on the record so the Board can make a decision on
16 this destination.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

18 MR. BOEHNER: I will make sure I don't do
19 that. I don't think that's on his agenda.

20 MS. DREHER: Doesn't sound like he's seeking
21 that.

22 MR. BOEHNER: But it is good that you said
23 that, because if he wanted to meet I was going to give him a
24 meeting pretty quickly. I understand what you're saying, I'm
25 just telling I'm glad that you said that. Because, you know,

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 try to make yourself available.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

5 MR. BOEHNER: Ken, would you like me to have
6 his attorney contact you?

7 MR. GORDON: Not unless they want to talk to
8 me.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Okay.

10 MR. PAGE: Are there other properties here
11 that rise to the top?

12 MS. LANPHEAR: What do you think about
13 2369 East Avenue, the Ellison house? Across from the
14 Stone-Tolan house, it's the Ellison house. It's the one that
15 David Norbutt remodeled.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That had a lot of changes
17 to it.

18 MR. PAGE: Is that the one with the big
19 addition?

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. Did they take down
21 a carriage house?

22 MS. LANPHEAR: I met them.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's the one that had
24 the Pella window stickers on it for about six years. So we
25 would be doing that one just because of the owners?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: No -- yeah, the owners. That's
4 really, the Ellisons are really --

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. I'd say --

6 MS. LANPHEAR: I don't know about the
7 architect, the original architect.

8 MS. DREHER: Did we get the survey on that
9 one?

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Which number?

11 MR. PAGE: 2369 East Avenue.

12 MS. LANPHEAR: The front of it is brick, the
13 back is the addition.

14 MR. PAGE: That's an outside with almost say,
15 we'd need an update to make a decision.

16 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, because it's so heavily
17 remodeled since the survey.

18 MR. PAGE: The house, that has parts that
19 haven't been changed that are spectacular.

20 MS. DREHER: I don't have any going back to
21 January of last year when we first started this process, I
22 don't have any notes on that house. I don't have the survey
23 in my files. I don't know if we've discussed it.

24 MR. PAGE: Came in after somebody got fired
25 and helped manage the addition.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2

3

4

5

MR. GOODMAN: I agree with John, I think that's an excellent approach. So if we update the survey and we have more dated and make an informed decision.

6

7

MR. BOEHNER: Okay. Now is the time, order them up.

8

9

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That would be Number 2 of four.

10

11

12

13

MS. DREHER: And if we could get the original survey for that too, I think it makes sense to update based on the rest of the Board member's knowledge of what's gone on at the house, but I don't believe I have seen the original.

14

15

MR. BOEHNER: I don't think you probably have. Do we have a motion?

16

17

MR. PAGE: I will make that motion to get an update on 2369 East Avenue.

18

19

MR. GOODMAN: I'll second it.

20

21

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

22

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

23

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

24

MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

25

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. PAGE: Yes.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

5 MS. DREHER: Yes.

6 MR. BOEHNER: We will have it updated.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Glen Road.

8 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: This is the one on the
10 right?

11 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I have been through that
13 house and that had some termite problems, as you might
14 imagine being close to the water there. That was I think,
15 according to the people in the house, that was pretty much
16 hand built by the first owner.

17 MS. LANPHEAR: Gustaf.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: He was a carpenter.

19 MS. LANPHEAR: I think so. It's supposed to
20 be spectacular.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't think spectacular
22 is the right term, it's interesting.

23 MS. LANPHEAR: My other suggestion would be
24 909 North Landing Road the old cinderblock, but it's now a
25 religious property though. The building itself has some

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 history. The fact that we don't have any of the old early
4 20th century schools left except for School House Number 9 on
5 French Road, Williamson's house.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, that's make sense.

7 MR. GORDON: Who is using that property?

8 MS. LANPHEAR: That is I understand Trinity
9 Reformed Church. I think it is still the congregation there.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Sure, it's okay with me.
11 Does everyone know what we're talking about?

12 MS. ROBINSON: No, I don't.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Mary Jo, I lived across
14 the street from it.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: The building itself has been
16 added on to. The original school itself is pretty much
17 intact though and the church has been added on to the north
18 side of the property, a modern brick church. But they use
19 the original school for school religion education and social
20 events and so forth. It's pretty much intact, the interior.

21 It's the third school on that property because
22 the other two kept burning down, getting sparks from the
23 nearby railroad trains when they were coal fired, would blow
24 over on top of the school and the school would be set on
25 fire. This was built of cinderblocks specifically so it

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 would not burn down.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What do you think?

5 MS. DREHER: I don't have a survey on this one
6 either. I remember talking about it, but it could be because
7 we talked about it here and I didn't read the survey. Does
8 anybody remember if we got that one?

9 MR. GOODMAN: I don't remember.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't recall.

11 MS. DREHER: So that would be another.

12 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, send original survey to
13 members.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What's everyone think
15 about the church?

16 MR. PAGE: Update and make a decision.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's Number 3.

18 MR. PAGE: I make a motion we update the
19 survey for 909 North Landing Road.

20 MS. ROBINSON: I will second that.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

23 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

24 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

5 MR. PAGE: Yes.

6 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

7 MS. DREHER: Yes.

8 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: While we're talking about
10 schools, the other building perhaps should be looked at for a
11 survey because I don't think we've ever done it, is the
12 Allens Creek school. The building itself is a 1920s
13 colonial-style building built to look like the neighborhood
14 as the Tudor gas station was and the fire hall. And the
15 school district itself is very old, it dates to 1815 it's now
16 part of the Pittsford School District but it's physically
17 within the Town of Brighton.

18 MR. PAGE: You're saying we don't have a
19 survey on that? So that would be next year?

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: How do you feel about
22 12 Corners Plaza?

23 MR. PAGE: We decided to keep it.

24 MS. DREHER: I think that was when we sort of
25 decided to strategically keep it on the list.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. BOEHNER: We did talk about it. That's
4 all we decided to do, we didn't want to do anymore.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: They did come to us when
6 they were going to alter the bank.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: They did, yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I kind of like it. One
9 thing you remember it's sort of how Johnsons came in that way
10 and all. We see the plaza and it has been changed.

11 MR. PAGE: If we kept it it would be because
12 in theory we are hoping it would remain as a plaza of some
13 sort. I don't know how hard we would push for not doing a
14 major face lift as has happened a couple times.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: It dates from 1941 and
16 originally it had a white VitraLight covering that was unique
17 at that time.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: But that's gone.

19 MR. PAGE: It was pretty early.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: They say it was the first
21 suburban shopping plaza, 13 stores in an arc in that plaza.

22 MR. GOODMAN: Perhaps update?

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What do you think? Put
24 that on the update list? I don't know, that's the question.

25 MS. DREHER: It's easy, I mean, it's one of

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 the properties that's easier to see what's gone on. I did
4 not live here before it, it's always looked like the way it
5 looks. I moved to Rochester 12 years ago, but I don't know
6 how we'd feel if it went through a major renovation.

7 MR. PAGE: I say that the survey reflects the
8 general condition that it's in now, except for some things at
9 the bank end and around back maybe.

10 MR. BOEHNER: The back, because they did
11 demolish the back portion of the building.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: They had a Wegmans there.

13 MR. BOEHNER: That's probably what it was
14 because the building was long so they chopped off the back
15 end of the building to provide more parking, and to try to
16 allow more access from the rear. That was maybe 10 years
17 ago, maybe 15.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If nothing else, it might
19 be good to have the survey just to document it in case
20 something else goes right.

21 MR. GORDON: I think that plaza is currently
22 owned by a consortium out of New York City.

23 MR. BOEHNER: That's right.

24 MR. GORDON: It's currently managed by Stew
25 Baker's company.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MR. BOEHNER: That's right.

4 MR. GOODMAN: I think given the iconic nature
5 of that plaza, the significant historical significance, I
6 think even just to update the survey document on the record
7 would be good.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That would be Number 4.

9 MR. GOODMAN: I will make a motion that we
10 update the survey for 1940 Monroe Avenue.

11 MR. PAGE: Second.

12 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

15 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

17 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

19 MR. PAGE: Yes.

20 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

21 MS. DREHER: Yes.

22 MR. BOEHNER: We will have that survey update.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: 960 North Landing is the
24 house on the corner. Is that house on the corner of Penfield
25 Road, Mary Jo?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, it is.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The guy did come to us as
5 far as he redid the garage, he did talk to us about that
6 years ago. I don't see -- why did it make it on this list?

7 MS. LANPHEAR: I don't know. It's early 20th
8 century, one of the first houses in the neighborhood. I
9 don't know why it's on the list.

10 MS. DREHER: We must have skipped around,
11 because I don't have that one either.

12 MS. LANPHEAR: It's been amended over the
13 years too.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think it's in good
15 hands. The current owner did show us the plans for the
16 garage they wanted to redo.

17 MS. ROBINSON: What about 332 South Landing?

18 MS. LANPHEAR: That's the Headley designer.
19 Was that on the list to update the survey?

20 MS. DREHER: I wanted to ask if Ramsey could
21 send the survey for the last one we talked about, 960 North
22 Landing Road.

23 MR. GORDON: And for no other reason then I
24 also heard some doubt as to whether it should stay on the
25 list, so that will allow the Board to take a look at the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 survey.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I would say we look at
5 the survey, but I would be happy to remove it from the list.

6 MR. GORDON: Some members I don't think are
7 familiar with the property to make that decision at this
8 time.

9 MS. DREHER: You said 332 South Landing, we
10 did authorize an update?

11 MR. GORDON: We did at the October 24th,
12 meeting.

13 MS. DREHER: Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ramsey, you have not
15 heard of any requests for perhaps a change of -- ZBA change
16 of use for the gas station, have you?

17 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, I heard a number of
18 different things. Everything from a Goodwill drop off, to a
19 bakery/ice cream, to a coffee shop, to a Dunkin Donuts.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I wanted to put Pittsford
21 Dairy there, their branch office there.

22 MS. DREHER: Which gas station?

23 MR. BOEHNER: It's on East Avenue, Elmwood
24 Avenue, next to the fire station. I don't know the style.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's Tudor revival but

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 they covered up.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, but I'm sure to tell them
5 they need to come to this Board. I do explain to them that
6 their biggest issue is going to be maybe the Zoning Board of
7 Appeals. Most of the things coming in require use variances.

8 MS. LANPHEAR: I drove by the one in Mumford
9 last weekend and they've done a beautiful job of restoring
10 that gas station down there.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It certainly needs to be
12 something.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, it does.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I would love to -- well,
15 I want to keep it as a gas station, but those days are gone.

16 MR. BOEHNER: The tanks have been removed.
17 They had to get rid of the tanks.

18 MS. DREHER: Are there environmental issues?

19 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, there was. There's a time
20 line and you either put new tanks in or get them out.

21 MS. DREHER: That sometimes dissuades people
22 who are interested in starting a certain business.

23 MR. BOEHNER: I believe, that's my
24 understanding, that's all been taken care of.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Mary Jo, would you --

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 maybe I'm out of line here -- would you skim through the list
4 and see for the next meeting if there's anything that either
5 screams to be taken off the list or put on the agenda for
6 next year for doing an update?

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Might place the Houston Barnard
8 Subdivision. We have architect designed houses in there that
9 have not been surveyed and I'd like to see a little more
10 attention paid to that area.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That would raise the
12 hackles of the neighborhood.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: I know it will. We have been
14 treating it like a sacred cow.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It pretty much is, in
16 fact, no one's done anything horrible there.

17 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

18 MS. DREHER: The other two North Landing
19 properties, I don't have the survey for those either. Did we
20 ever talk about those, 434 and 602?

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We passed over the
22 school, the school is a frame structure.

23 MS. DREHER: Yes, so 909 and 960 we talked
24 about, but 434 and 602 North Landing Road, have we ever
25 discussed those? I don't have any notes or the survey.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: Is that Louie Magiulli's house?
4 He just died. He's the one who had the crazy front yard full
5 of stuff.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, Louie's fort?

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, I think that's 602.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's just an old house.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: And 434 is a very, very old
10 house. It's probably early 19th century. It's owned by the
11 people who own the former Ellison house, the summer Ellison
12 house, it was a Tudor residence that you can only see from
13 Blossom Road.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: This is between Blossom
15 and Browncroft?

16 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, it's across the street
17 from the new Tryonn house, that neighborhood.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

19 MS. LANPHEAR: There's a driveway across the
20 street and the house is set back away. It's very old, so
21 it's probably not -- I have been trying to find information
22 and the owner was not at all amenable towards designation
23 but that was maybe 20 years ago. It may not be the same
24 owner now.

25 MS. DREHER: What number was that?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: 434.

4 MS. DREHER: If there's no objection to at
5 least sending the surveys out for those two. And I have a
6 note from surveys on Elmwood Avenue that were going to be
7 sent. Did I miss those? Were those sent out from last
8 month?

9 MR. BOEHNER: If you did not get them,
10 obviously I did not send them, but I thought we had done
11 everything.

12 MS. DREHER: I just have a note, surveys being
13 sent before November for 2762 Elmwood Avenue, 3333 Elmwood
14 Avenue, and 3364 Elmwood Avenue. It looks like we had never
15 discussed those and then the two on North Landing.

16 MR. BOEHNER: So we got two, okay.

17 MS. DREHER: If we could get those and take a
18 look.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: As it looks, we've got
20 enough to blow the budget.

21 MR. BOEHNER: We have spent the budget, but
22 it's good to get going. So the four Elmwood Avenue
23 properties?

24 MS. DREHER: 3541 we already have, it's 2762,
25 3333 and 3644. And the two North Landing, 434 and 602 North

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 11/21/19

2
3 Landing.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Okay.

5 MS. DREHER: Are there any others that anyone
6 sees that we didn't talk about?

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You know, 20 years ago
8 whenever the surveys started, we went around and looked at
9 most of these. But my mind is such that it might not be a
10 bad idea for us individually to pick out the ones we have no
11 clue what they are and just drive by so we have a little
12 further information, see one way or the other.

13 Okay, any other old business? Presentations,
14 none, announcements, none. Any other business before the
15 commission? Motion to adjourn.

16 MR. GOODMAN: So moved.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

18 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

19 * * *

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;

Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

Dated this 29th day of December, 2019.

At Rochester, New York


Rhoda Collins