

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 PROCEEDINGS HELD BEFORE THE HISTORIC
2 PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF BRIGHTON AT 2300 ELMWOOD
3 AVENUE, ROCHESTER, NEW YORK ON JANUARY 23RD, 2020 AT
4 APPROXIMATELY 7:15 P.M.

5

6

7 January 23rd, 2020
8 Brighton Town Hall
9 2300 Elmwood Avenue
10 Rochester, New York 14618

11

12

13 PRESENT:

14 JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON
15 JUSTIN DELVECCHIO
16 AMANDA L. DREHER
17 JOHN PAGE
18 DAVID WHITAKER
19 DIANA ROBINSON
20 WAYNE GOODMAN

21

22 MARY JO LANPHEAR
23 Town Historian

24

25 KEN GORDON, ESQ.
26 Town Attorney

27

28 RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
29 Town Planner

30

31

32

33 REPORTED BY: ALEXANDRA K. WIATER, Court Reporter
34 Forbes Court Reporting Services, LLC
35 21 Woodcrest Drive
36 Batavia, New York 14020

37

38 **Edith E. Forbes**
39 **Court Reporting Services**
40 **(585) 343-8612**

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'd like to call the
2 meeting to order. Call the roll please, Ramsey.

3 MR. BOEHNER: Delvecchio?

4 MR. DELVECCHIO: Here.

5 MR. BOEHNER: Page?

6 MR. PAGE: Here.

7 MR. BOEHNER: Whitaker?

8 MR. WHITAKER: Here.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Dreher?

10 MS. DREHER: Here.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Goodman?

12 MR. GOODMAN: Here.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Robinson?

14 MS. ROBINSON: Here.

15 MR. BOEHNER: Ludwig?

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

17 MR. BOEHNER: All present.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Motion to accept the
19 agenda?

20 MR. WHITAKER: So moved.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: David made a motion.

22 Can I have a second, please?

23 MR. GOODMAN: Second.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All right. All in
25 favor?

**Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612**

1 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

2 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Minutes? Do we have
3 minutes from November 21st and December 19th? Amanda?

4 MS. DREHER: So, from December, Page 6, Line
5 1 says, little fuel. I believe that was little
6 futile. And Page 7, Line 15, the name should be
7 Claude Bragdon. And I have a couple more that Mary Jo
8 also had and gave to the stenographer.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Mary Jo, are you going to give
10 her something?

11 MS. LANPHEAR: I have Page 18 -- Page 18,
12 Line 25, the early 1900s not 1980. Page 22, Line 14,
13 it's Greystone. It's all one word. Spelled,
14 G-r-e-y-s-t-o-n-e. On Page 26, Line 19, inviolate,
15 not in violet. And Page 26, Line 20 austerity, and
16 not prosperity.

17 MS. DREHER: The one I have, also, the in
18 violet mistake was also made on Page 28, Line 19.

19 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other corrections?

21 MR. WHITAKER: I do for the last one.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Pardon?

23 MR. WHITAKER: The last one.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, this is just for
25 November 21st. A motion to approve?

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 MS. DREHER: Oh, this is for December.

2 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, okay.

3 MR. BOEHNER: Why don't we just do November.

4 Are there any changes for November?

5 MS. DREHER: Yes, I have a few.

6 MR. BOEHNER: Okay. Why don't we do that.

7 MS. DREHER: Okay. On Page 5, Line 6,
8 destination should be designation. And Page 19, Line
9 14, I do not understand what this means. John Page
10 said, "There is an outside with almost say. We need
11 an update to make a decision." Does anyone recall
12 what that means? It didn't make any sense to me.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Read it again.

14 MS. DREHER: "There is an outside with
15 almost say. We need an update to make a decision."
16 It's talking about 2369 East Ave. The front of it is
17 brick. The back is the addition. Does anyone recall
18 what that means? I think there might be a mistake
19 there, but I don't know what they are.

20 MR. PAGE: I'm not sure if it's -- whatever
21 the -- that's listed that needs to be updated. That's
22 the -- that's the sort of key to that sentence.

23 MS. DREHER: Okay. So we can just leave
24 that one. And then the other change I have is Page
25, Line 24, when should be one, o-n-e.

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Mary Jo --
2 MS. LANPHEAR: I'm sorry?
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: -- anything from the
4 November minutes?

5 MS. LANPHEAR: No.
6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Anyone else? Okay.

7 Motion to approve November and --

8 MR. BOEHNER: With corrections.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: -- December minutes
10 with corrections?

11 MR. WHITAKER: I have one in December.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: December? Okay.

13 MR. WHITAKER: I'm not listed as attending.

14 MR. PAGE: He's not listed as attending in
15 December and he was attending. That's his correction.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other corrections?
17 Motion to approve those minutes?

18 MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: A second, please?

20 MS. DREHER: I'll second.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. All in
22 favor?

23 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Then it stands
25 approved. Thank you.

Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 Was the meeting duly advertised?

2 MR. BOEHNER: Yes. It was properly
3 advertised in the Brighton-Pittsford Post on January
4 9th, 2020.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That meeting was duly
6 advertised and will now be held. We have no
7 communications.

8 The first item on the agenda is designation
9 of landmarks. 1H-02-20, Application of Mary Jo
10 Lanphear, Town Historian for property owned by David
11 E. Lee, at 1140 Clover Street, tax number 137.08-1-34,
12 for landmark designation. Anyone here to speak on
13 that?

14 MS. LANPHEAR: I put a memo in each of your
15 folders about the house stating that the architecture
16 is not unique in this town, but we certainly have
17 enough examples of it, but this is a special house and
18 a standard example. And because it was a J. Foster
19 Warner house also. And it's architecturally
20 significant. It's an outstanding example of the Tudor
21 Revival architecture. It's a noted example of the
22 work of J. Foster Warner. It's associated with a
23 prominent family, the Finucanes. And with its
24 connections to the cultural, economic, political and
25 social group in the area, it fulfills all four

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 criteria for the Town of Brighton's Historic
2 Preservation Law for designation as a town landmark.

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Ramsey, did you
4 have any contact with the owners on this?

5 MR. BOEHNER: They were here last month.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's right.

7 MR. BOEHNER: They were opposed to
8 designation.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Got it. That's right.
10 That's right.

11 MR. BOEHNER: But they did come last month.
12 We did talk with them. I have not heard since last
13 month from them.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other comments from
15 anyone? Public Hearings are now closed. Will someone
16 put forth the motion to --

17 MR. GORDON: Certainly. I would propose
18 that the following motion be made: Whereas
19 Application 1H-02-20 has been submitted for
20 designation of 1140 Clover Street in the Town of
21 Brighton, County of Monroe, State of New York, tax
22 parcel number 137.08-1-34 as a landmark under the
23 towns Historic Preservation Law. And whereas the
24 Historic Preservation Commission duly held and
25 appropriately noticed Public Hearings to consider such

Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 application that the Public Hearing was held, and
2 concluded, on January 23rd, 2020. And all persons
3 having an interest in such application had an
4 opportunity to be heard therein.

5 And whereas, based upon the application
6 prepared by Town Historian Mary Jo Lanphear, dated
7 November 26th, 2019, and the Cultural Resources Survey
8 of said property by Cynthia Howk, H-o-w-k, dated 2004
9 and the update to the survey by Katie Eggers Comaeu,
10 C-o-m-a-e-u, dated November 5th, 2019, and memorandum
11 to be prepared by the Town Historian, Mary Jo
12 Lanphear, dated January 23rd, 2020, of the material
13 submitted to The Board in connection with the
14 application and the testimony presented at the Public
15 Hearing and other materials submitted to the Historic
16 Preservation Commission in advance of and at the
17 Public Hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission
18 finds that the referenced property possesses such
19 historic value based upon the fact that it is
20 architecturally significant is an outstanding example
21 of Tudor Revival architecture in Brighton. And is a
22 noted example of the work of J. Foster Warner,
23 W-a-r-n-e-r, a noted designer and architect. And is
24 associated with a prominent local family, the
25 Finucanes, F-i-n-u-c-a-n-e-s. And therefore meets all

Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 four criteria in the Town of Brighton's Historic
2 Preservation Law for designation.

3 It is hereby resolved that the Town of
4 Brighton Application 1H-02-20 for designation as a
5 landmark of the property located at 1140 Clover Street
6 in the Town of Brighton, tax parcel ID number
7 137.08-1-34, together with all of the above-referenced
8 materials submitted in advance of and at the Public
9 Hearing be received and filed.

10 And be it further resolved that the Historic
11 Preservation Commission hereby designates the above
12 referenced subject property located at 1140 Clover
13 Street in the Town of Brighton as a historic landmark
14 pursuant to Chapter 224 of the Town Code based upon
15 informations above articulated finding regarding the
16 historic value of the subject property and its
17 association with the social, cultural, political, and
18 economic history of the town.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Will someone make a
20 motion to approve?

21 MR. WHITAKER: I'll make the motion to
22 approve.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second, please?

24 MS. ROBINSON: I'll second that.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any discussion?

Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612

1 MR. PAGE: It's a great house.

2 MS. DREHER: I would just note that the
3 owners -- when they came in -- were opposed. But
4 after the decision, they seemed open to designation.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, the proof is in.
6 It seems like, you know, a lot of people have
7 misconceptions about what we do. But, I think, we
8 prove that we're not that bad. Okay. Ramsey, would
9 you like to call the roll, please?

10 MR. BOEHNER: Dreher?

11 MS. DREHER: Yes.

12 MR. BOEHNER: Page?

13 MR. PAGE: Yes.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Goodman?

15 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Delvecchio?

17 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Ludwig?

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

20 MR. BOEHNER: Robinson?

21 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

22 MR. BOEHNER: And Whitaker?

23 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes and it's
25 designated as a landmark.

1 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Certificate of
2 Appropriateness 1H-01-20, Application of 1832-1840
3 Monroe Ave, LLC, owner of property at 1832 Monroe
4 Avenue, tax number 137.10-1-49, for a Certificate of
5 Appropriateness to install an a/c unit out south side
6 of building. Is there anyone here to speak to that?
7 You're here, you just don't want to speak?

8 JOHN NICASTRO: Yeah. Just checking to see
9 if it's okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Great. The
11 Public Hearing is now closed.

12 MR. GORDON: Hold on.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone else
14 here to speak? Let's make the motion first and then
15 ask for comments.

16 MR. GORDON: To make it apart of the public
17 record, let's have comments.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

19 MR. PAGE: This is a minor mechanical
20 improvement that will have a minor impact on the side
21 of the building and not the most prominent side.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think it goes well
23 with the architecture of the side.

24 MR. PAGE: Me too.

25 MR. WHITAKER: That is the main entrance to

1 the roadway?

2 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

3 MR. GOODMAN: From the roadway, it seems
4 like the placement is -- it seems like it's a decent
5 place but it's behind the stairs.

6 MR. DELVECCHIO: I have a question, will the
7 unit be on a concrete pad?

8 JOHN NICASTRO: Most likely. It's the only
9 way you can put it in. I'll tell you, to be honest
10 with you, like I told Ramsey --

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Are you a developer?

12 JOHN NICASTRO: I am. I own the building.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Would you --

14 MR. GORDON: Just for our stenographer, can
15 you tell her your name?

16 JOHN NICASTRO: My name's John Nicastro. As
17 far as what's going on with the property, and the
18 developer, I'm limited to what I know. I received
19 notice of this so I just wanted to see what was going
20 on. And the a/c unit really has to be put on some
21 type of pad. I can tell you that for sure. I'm not
22 sure what they're proposing.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, from the amount
24 of paperwork, we should probably give it a thought.

25 MR. BOEHNER: They don't have a lot for the

1 a/c unit itself. Most of the paperwork is on interior
2 improvements.

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

4 MS. DREHER: It says nine square footpads
5 for proposed a/c unit. It does not say whether it is
6 concrete.

7 MR. BOEHNER: So it's three by three.

8 JOHN NICASTRO: Yup. Yup. Three by three.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

10 MR. PAGE: And you want it on the pad?

11 JOHN NICASTRO: You have to have it on a
12 pad.

13 MR. DELVECCHIO: To save money somewhere,
14 I'll put in -- you can buy a -- they have it at any,
15 you know, supply house, a plastic pad.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah.

17 MR. DELVECCHIO: Right. And then after a
18 few years, the unit settles.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it will do that
20 with concrete too.

21 MR. DELVECCHIO: Well, yeah. So -- but it's
22 going to be in a much more sturdy position --

23 JOHN NICASTRO: On a concrete pad. So...

24 MR. DELVECCHIO: That will be my only
25 concern.

1 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, let's make that
2 part of the --

3 MR. GORDON: We can make that condition that
4 the approval is that it goes on a concrete pad.

5 JOHN NICASTRO: I don't see a problem with
6 it. I don't know what they proposed. Like the
7 gentleman said, there are plastic pads available for
8 those units. It makes no difference to me.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any others?

10 MS. DREHER: Actually, it is here: "Unit
11 will set on 30 inches by 30 inches by 2-inch height
12 prefabricated pad." That's on the photo of the --
13 where the air conditioner is.

14 JOHN NICASTRO: I assume it's concrete or
15 does it --

16 MR. BOEHNER: No. It's just prefab.

17 MS. DREHER: Prefab.

18 JOHN NICASTRO: But it could be prefabbled
19 concrete.

20 MR. DELVECCHIO: Right. I mean, it's
21 prefabbled as long as its got a proper base.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I think we're
23 limited in our rights to say concrete instead of the
24 prefabbled concrete.

25 MR. GORDON: You certainly can make that a

1 condition.

2 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If someone hits the
3 plastic with a weedwhacker, and all of the sudden the
4 plastic starts to chip away and you can see underneath
5 it. So I think we can make it a concrete pad I
6 suppose. Any other questions or concerns? Anyone
7 else to speak?

8 MS. ROBINSON: It's a sizeable amount of
9 money they'd probably spend on this, I think.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I'm sure the --
11 you could answer it.

12 JOHN NICASTRO: Quite a bit. They realized
13 that it's -- actually, the reason they have to do it
14 is because of New York State's pharmaceutical
15 requirements of a cleanroom. So it's the only way
16 they can do it.

17 MS. ROBINSON: Okay. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any other
19 comments? The Public Hearings are closed. Will you
20 put forth a motion?

21 MR. GORDON: Sure. Whereas Application
22 Number 1H-01-20 has been submitted for a Certificate
23 of Appropriateness under the towns Historic
24 Preservation Law for improvement to property located
25 at 1832 Monroe Avenue, in the Town of Brighton, County

1 of Monroe, and State of New York, to perform work
2 described as the construction of a new, approximately,
3 90 square foot modular cleanroom in the existing
4 pharmacy suite, including placing an air conditioning
5 unit out on the south side of the building.

6 And whereas the Historic Preservation
7 Commission duly called a Public Hearing to consider
8 the matter on January 23rd, 2020. And whereas the
9 necessary legal notice was published and the required
10 sign posted pursuant to Town Code. And whereas the
11 Public Hearing was held and all persons having an
12 interest in such matter having had an opportunity to
13 be heard therein.

14 And whereas the Historic Preservation
15 Commission hereby determines pursuant to the factors
16 set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code, that the
17 above proposed described work to the subject property
18 is consistent with purposes of the towns Historic
19 Preservation Law and compatible with the property's
20 historic character based upon its review of the
21 application and documents on file and received at the
22 Public Hearing, and the testimony presented at the
23 Public Hearing.

24 It is hereby resolved that the Historic
25 Preservation Commission hereby receives and files the

Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612

1 above-described application and supporting materials.

2 And it is further resolved that the Historic
3 Preservation Commission approves Application Number
4 1H-01-20 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the
5 above-described work to be performed at the property
6 located at 1832 Monroe Avenue, in the Town of
7 Brighton.

8 Subject to the condition, that the
9 above-described work be completed within one year from
10 the date of approval. And subject to the further
11 additional condition that the air conditioning unit to
12 be placed on the south side of the building be placed
13 upon a concrete pad.

14 And be it further resolved that pursuant to
15 Chapter 224 of the Town Code, the above-described work
16 in improving the property with the placement of the
17 air conditioning unit and pad on the outside of the
18 building qualifies for the exemptions set forth in New
19 York Real Property Tax Law Section 4404-A.

20 MR. GOODMAN: I'll make that motion.

21 MR. DELVECCHIO: Second.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I have one thing that I
23 don't if we should add or not, but we might want to
24 say a minimum of two inches thick or some --

25 MS. ROBINSON: Three or four.

1 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What?

2 MS. ROBINSON: Three or four inches outside.

3 Four would be minimum for the sidewalk -- or pad.

4 MR. PAGE: I wouldn't want to limit it to
5 something that's available. So if you can get a
6 precast unit that's three inches or so, then I would
7 not what to force them to have to buy a four.

8 MS. ROBINSON: Precast would be different.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, should we say a
10 minimum of three inches?

11 MR. WHITAKER: Sure.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Should we put that in
13 there?

14 MR. GORDON: I can put it in there.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I would feel better
16 about that or am I out of control here?

17 MS. ROBINSON: Well, like John said, we
18 don't want to limit them to something when they can
19 get a prefab at two and a half or something --

20 MR. DELVECCHIO: But we don't want to put it
21 on pavers, right?

22 MS. ROBINSON: Right.

23 MR. DELVECCHIO: Prefabricated pavers are --

24 MS. ROBINSON: I guess we can say three
25 inches then.

1 MR. DELVECCHIO: I mean, I can go get
2 prefabs from Weider's Hardware -- right next door --
3 with a wheel barrel and mix it up and put it in.

4 JOHN NICASTRO: Well, how about this, how
5 about if we're going to pour it a minimum of three
6 inches, hard to say what the prefab concrete might be.
7 So I agree, don't limit -- maybe two and a half inches
8 for a prefab, it's going to work okay. If you're
9 going to pour it, you're going to probably pour it
10 three inches anyways.

11 MR. GORDON: Get a bunch of eight-inch
12 cement blocks.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All right. Let's say a
14 minimum of three inches.

15 MR. DELVECCHIO: I think a minimum of three.
16 It makes sense. The fact that they have to pour --
17 you know what I mean, it's not a big deal to pour a
18 three by three. I mean, if they can buy a prefab,
19 then it's substantial enough.

20 MS. DREHER: So the picture says two. So...

21 MR. DELVECCHIO: Two inches?

22 MS. DREHER: Yeah, that's what the picture
23 says. 30 by 30 by 2.

24 MR. GOODMAN: Amanda, are you -- where is
25 that? Is that, like, a notation or --

1 MS. DREHER: It's this one.

2 MR. DELVECCHIO: Oh, I don't think that's --

3 MS. DREHER: It was in the e-mail and that's
4 what it said.

5 MS. ROBINSON: It says prefabricated, yeah.

6 JOHN NICASTRO: If it's prefabricated, I'm
7 sure it's more than adequate. If they're going to --
8 I mean, if that's what it's designed to be, then
9 that's what you're going to put.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, it's not like
11 you're -- like they're --

12 MR. DELVECCHIO: I guess prefabricated may
13 imply --

14 MR. PAGE: I think we just want to confirm
15 that it's concrete; right?

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah.

17 JOHN NICASTRO: Well, there are plastic
18 ones. I know what you're talking about. That, I
19 agree, I don't want concrete. But I would ask not to
20 limit them to --

21 MS. ROBINSON: That's just -- they have
22 everything here -- two inches -- prefabricated.

23 But --

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Why don't we just say
25 concrete?

1 MR. WHITAKER: Yeah.

2 MR. BOEHNER: Ken, that was a minimum of two
3 inches thick.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Just put in
5 there concrete pad. Minimum of two inches thick.
6 There's not a lot of weight on it either. How does
7 that sound?

8 MS. ROBINSON: But don't take out the
9 prefabricated part.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Pardon?

11 MS. ROBINSON: But don't take out the
12 prefabricated part.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. If you can find
14 a prefab one, that's fine. It can't be fiberglass or
15 whatever. Okay. So let's just put a minimum of two
16 inches thick -- a concrete pad two inches thick.

17 MR. GORDON: So the resolution that I've
18 already proposed says concrete. I believe that the
19 additional amendment and what you actually want it to
20 say is that the construction and conformance of the
21 plans and drawings submitted to the Historic
22 Preservation Commission. It's generic and it already
23 says that it's going to be two inches.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Great.

25 MR. BOEHNER: It's not concrete.

1 MR. GORDON: Right. Concrete is the
2 condition.

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We just put concrete
4 in.

5 MR. GORDON: Didn't I already say that as an
6 additional condition?

7 MR. PAGE: Yes.

8 MR. DELVECCHIO: You added that on.

11 MR. GOODMAN: So we'll make a motion for the
12 amendment?

21 MR. GOODMAN: Absolutely.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Does it say concrete?

23 MR. GOODMAN: It already says concrete.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Okay. It
25 already says that.

1 MR. GORDON: And Mr. Delvecchio seconded the
2 motion. Are you okay with that?

3 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

4 MR. GORDON: Okay. So that is now your new
5 motion.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Someone make a
7 motion, please?

8 MR. GORDON: It's already made. Ask if
9 there's any further discussion.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any further discussion?
11 Okay. Ramsey?

12 MR. BOEHNER: Dreher?

13 MS. DREHER: Yes.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Page?

15 MR. PAGE: Yes.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Ludwig?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Robinson?

19 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

20 MR. BOEHNER: Delvecchio?

21 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

22 MR. BOEHNER: Goodman?

23 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Whitaker?

25 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

1 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

2 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Public Hearings are now
3 closed. New business? Any new business? There being
4 none, any old business that we want to talk about?

5 MR. PAGE: We've got a list of --

6 MS. DREHER: The first one that we got today
7 actually is an older version. I don't know if you
8 realize this. The December version is more updated
9 than the version we got today.

10 MR. BOEHNER: What version?

11 MS. DREHER: This one says -- the amended is
12 not kept up to date. But this is what you gave us
13 today, 1/23. This was December's version. And this
14 is -- these things that we already had taken off or
15 weren't correct on the December version. I think we
16 just got a November version.

17 MR. BOEHNER: It's the list of the date
18 of --

19 MS. DREHER: Yeah, but it's the list of
20 stuff that we've taken off.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Okay. Thank you.

22 MS. DREHER: 30 Stoneham Road was
23 designated. 1356 and 1495 Winton Road South were
24 taken off the list.

25 MS. ROBINSON: The date that we got today is

1 7/25/19.

2 MR. GORDON: I have one in my pocket that
3 was dated as a designated list 1/23/20. And then I
4 have one in my pocket that's dated in the bottom
5 left-hand corner 1/2/3/20 amended 6/5 of '19.

6 MS. DREHER: I don't think the amended
7 phrase has --

8 MR. BOEHNER: Has been updated. I'm going
9 to talk with her about that.

10 MS. DREHER: But the day on the left has
11 been updated each month. We've received it. So if
12 you look at it -- I have a December version but has
13 fewer properties on it than this January version. So
14 I think it was just an error. But we have --

15 MR. GORDON: Yes, I would agree.

16 MR. BOEHNER: So you're saying that you
17 believe that this is the correct list?

18 MS. DREHER: Yes. The list with the -- I
19 still have it in my house from last time. It's dated
20 December, in the left corner, is the updated list. So
21 the only change, I think, to that is that we
22 designated 1140 today. 1140 Clover Street. So that
23 can be taken off.

24 MR. GORDON: And moved over to the
25 designated list?

1 MS. DREHER: To the designated list, yes.

2 And I think we ordered a bunch of surveys. And we
3 have a few more to talk about at some point.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think what we should
5 do is go through the old business ones here, decide
6 once and for all what we're going to do with those.

7 MS. DREHER: I think that -- I can start.
8 The Number 7 School, 909 North Landing Road, I think
9 that's worthy of designation.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We talked about that
11 and we said that we were all in agreement there.

12 MR. PAGE: So I'm just looking -- you're
13 talking about on here? On our agenda? Not the --

14 MS. DREHER: Oh, right. Okay. So did we
15 order the update for that one?

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We did.

17 MS. DREHER: You're right, yes. Okay. I'll
18 look at my notes for the other ones.

19 MR. GORDON: So on November 21st, The Board
20 authorized a Public Hearing to be set for 909 North
21 Landing Road. I don't know if that Public Hearing --
22 if any letters have gone out.

23 MR. BOEHNER: Say that again? I'm sorry.

24 MR. GORDON: I'm sorry. I have a note that
25 says on November 21st, 2019, The Board authorized the

1 setting of a Public Hearing for designation of 909
2 North Landing Road.

3 MR. BOEHNER: I think we held off on it,
4 Ken.

5 MR. GORDON: I could be wrong.

6 MS. ROBINSON: I have those properties and
7 only two of those four were talked about and were
8 updated.

9 MS. DREHER: I have that 960 was to be
10 updated.

11 MR. BOEHNER: We said it would be
12 designated.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I didn't think we're
14 going to update it.

15 MS. DREHER: Oh, no. It might be number
16 909.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: 909 was the one -- I
18 think there were four there. It was 909 and another
19 one that, I think, we were going to pursue. At least
20 that's my understanding and I could be wrong.

21 MS. DREHER: Should we just go through them
22 in order then? We'll start with 434 North Landing
23 Road.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. We're going to
25 hold off on that from what I understand. 602 North

1 Landing Road, I have no idea what that is.

2 MS. LANPHEAR: 602? 702 is the North
3 Landing School.

4 MS. DREHER: I suggest we take 602 off the
5 list and not make it a designated.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Fine -- well, do we
7 know what it is?

8 MS. ROBINSON: This. 602.

9 MS. DREHER: This -- is this the Klink --

10 MS. LANPHEAR: There is a Foursquare House
11 on the corner of Klink and North Landing Road but --

12 MS. DREHER: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: 602 North Landing Road
14 is what?

15 MS. DREHER: The Klink Farmhouse.

16 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay. That's Louie's House.
17 All right.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Which one is that?

19 MS. LANPHEAR: It's the one that's -- it's
20 listed as the Klink Farmhouse. He never lived in it.
21 He owned the property. He probably had a tenant
22 farmer living in the house. John Brad Klink was in
23 the Civil War.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Was he Kernel Klink?

25 MS. LANPHEAR: Kernel Klink. He was a

1 Kernel, yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And that's 602?

3 MS. ROBINSON: It says Klink House.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So let's -- a motion to
5 -- or the condition to -- all in agreement we should
6 take 602 off the list? So we have a motion?

7 MR. GOODMAN: I think that would be a good
8 idea.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do we have a motion to
10 do that?

11 MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

12 MR. PAGE: I will make that motion.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Can I have a second?

14 MS. ROBINSON: I'll second that.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any further discussion?

16 MS. ROBINSON: It only had a yellow rating.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yellow?

18 MS. ROBINSON: Yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

20 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Now, what's 434? What
22 happened to the other side of --

23 MS. LANPHEAR: That's that little old house
24 that's near the corner of Blossom Road and Landing
25 Road. It's on the driveway that leads into what used

1 to be the Ellison House and the Tudor House. It's all
2 framed siding now. It's kind of ugly. But that house
3 was kind of, like, a -- an auxiliary building to that.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So you don't have any
5 information?

6 MS. LANPHEAR: I don't have any information
7 other than what's in the survey.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So is there any
9 need to keep that on the list?

10 MS. DREHER: I thought that can be removed.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All right. A motion to
12 move?

13 MS. DREHER: I'll move to remove 434 North
14 Landing Road from our list of surveyed properties that
15 I've gotten.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Second?

17 MR. GOODMAN: I'll second.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any further discussion?
19 All in favor?

20 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. 434 is gone.
22 960, which is the house on the corner of Penfield Road
23 and North Landing Road.

24 MS. LANPHEAR: I'd like to make a case for
25 that one. I've been doing some digging into it and

1 it's not -- it's pretty old. It's been linked to the
2 20th century probably. I have not pinned it down yet.
3 But it wasn't just -- the house on the property, the
4 Curtis Barn, that later became Beverly Hills. But it
5 was the house of Dr. William Sawyer for many years.
6 And Dr. Sawyer was an early pioneer of tuberculosis.
7 He worked out of Idaho Sanitarium and so forth. But
8 then he also became the medical director of Eastman
9 Kodak Company. And he did a lot of traveling back and
10 forth to England to the Kodak's Harrow England plant.
11 And he had a lot of important positions. I kind of
12 think that he was a connection to a fairly important
13 person in that timeframe -- in that 1940s, 1950s
14 timeframe.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I would be -- not
16 designating it. But I don't have a problem with
17 leaving it on the list. The owner came in when he
18 wanted to do the garage --

19 MS. LANPHEAR: Yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: -- because he was on
21 the list.

22 MS. LANPHEAR: Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So it's okay to leave
24 it on the list. I'm not gung-ho about designating it.

25 MS. LANPHEAR: I'd like to research more on

1 it and see if I can find more about him.

2 MR. PAGE: Let's revisit it at some point.

3 MS. DREHER: That's a good idea because the
4 detailed information that you gave us about Dr. Sawyer
5 is not in the survey, it just mentions his name. So
6 it would be good to get more information.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. 2762 Elmwood
9 Ave.

10 MS. LANPHEAR: That's just a little old late
11 19th-century house that looks like a modern suburban
12 house because of the way that it's been kind of
13 remodeled over the years.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Remodeled?

15 MS. LANPHEAR: It's remodeled and it looks
16 nice though. It's not a badly remodeled place. But
17 it was part of a pet farm. The pet farm extended from
18 almost Highland Avenue to and including the triangle
19 in the twelve corners area. Big huge fruit farm.
20 Apples and pears and so forth. And that was not where
21 he lived though. Mr. Peck lived in Brighton Village
22 on East Avenue where he was an alderman when the
23 village was annexed by the city. The house that is
24 there was probably a tenant farmhouse that was used by
25 his overseer or something like that. So that's the

1 house. It's associated with a person that's important
2 to Brighton history but he didn't live there.

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well --

4 MR. PAGE: It doesn't have much left of
5 its --

6 MS. LANPHEAR: It almost looks like a
7 split-level.

8 MR. PAGE: Right.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Should we leave it on
10 the list or not on the list?

11 MS. LANPHEAR: Not on the list.

12 MR. PAGE: I'll make the motion to have it
13 removed.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John moves. Do we have
15 a second?

16 MR. DELVECCHIO: Second.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

18 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: 3333 Elmwood. This was
20 the Lindsay house; right?

21 MS. LANPHEAR: It was. It's the one that
22 was moved from the property that belonged to Isaac
23 Moore at 1496 Clover Street. It was part of the
24 Clover Street Seminary. The house was moved across
25 the street to Elmwood Avenue and it was a very simple

1 looking farmhouse and somebody gussied it all up and
2 so it has changed appearance but it's still, you know,
3 an old, old house.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, the owners
5 certainly were rather -- checking to see -- to our
6 committee -- when they came in with the Johnson House.
7 And Johnson house is designated adjacent to that -- or
8 behind that?

9 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't -- every time I
11 go by it, all I can think of is them.

12 MS. ROBINSON: I went through it when it was
13 up for sale.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Was it recent?

15 MS. ROBINSON: Somewhat recent. It really
16 seemed to be a two-family home, not separated but two
17 main entrances, two main stairways.

18 MS. DREHER: It was rated at red back in the
19 original survey.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: It's associated with a
21 prominent local family, the Lindsay's, too. So that
22 has some weight to it.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'm not excited about
24 pursuing it at this time so we leave that on the list
25 then.

1 MR. GOODMAN: I would suggest that. It does
2 seem to retain exterior character. It certainly has a
3 unique history. So I agree with you. Just leave it
4 on the list.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All right. That stays.
6 And then 3644 Elmwood. That must be down at the end.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: 3644? 3500 is Kenneth
8 Keating's house. The brick house. 3644, it's got to
9 be closer to the country club.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, yeah. Yeah. It is
11 the one adjacent. It's right there. We talked about
12 that -- yes. We talked about that earlier.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: Is that the cottage? The
14 blue cottage?

15 MS. DREHER: It says Country Club of
16 Rochester.

17 MS. LANPHEAR: I don't know anything about
18 that house. So...

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Should we leave it on
20 the list?

21 MS. LANPHEAR: Leave it on the list, yeah.

22 MS. DREHER: It was rated a green minus back
23 in the -- when the original survey was done.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't see a great
25 deal of it so --

1 MS. LANPHEAR: Can I get back to you, like,
2 next month on that?

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Sure. We'll leave that
4 on the list. Let's go back to the school.

5 MR. GORDON: Yeah. So an update was -- and
6 we're talking about -- that was just the misreading of
7 my own notes. An update was ordered. Ramsey is
8 ordering it.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, so that's as far as
10 we've gone?

11 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So we'll walk
13 for the update.

14 MR. GORDON: Asterisks and stars -- I have
15 asterisks and stars next to it.

16 MS. DREHER: And I wrote update next to 960
17 instead of 909 in my notes.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, we don't
19 necessarily have to pay for an update. I think we
20 need to let Mary Jo dig a little more.

21 MS. DREHER: Yeah. I just have my notes
22 from last time. I wrote update and it looked like it
23 was next to 960. That's why I was confused at the
24 beginning of the discussion.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So we don't need

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 01/23/20

1 this old business list for a little while. We can
2 eliminate all the properties on our old business list.
3 They can stay on and --

4 MR. PAGE: We should carry 960.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: 960 needs to be old
6 business -- or no. 909 needs to be old business.

7 MR. PAGE: 909 is -- we're going to get an
8 update on it?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

10 MR. PAGE: Mary Jo asked to do more research
11 on it?

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

13 MR. BOEHNER: I'm sorry. On the old
14 business, what number do we want to leave on?

15 MR. PAGE: 960 North Landing.

16 MR. GORDON: 960 North Landing. And I think
17 John suggested that the add is old business 909.

18 MS. DREHER: Would that go on --

19 MR. BOEHNER: Or go on when we get the
20 survey?

21 MR. PAGE: Correct.

22 MR. GORDON: Would it go under new business
23 or old business?

24 MR. BOEHNER: It would go under old business
25 because we already talked about it.

1 MS. DREHER: Is 3644 going to stay because

2 Mary Jo --

3 MR. BOEHNER: That was going to stay on the
4 list.

5 MS. LANPHEAR: At least another month.

6 MS. DREHER: But under old business, Mary Jo
7 asked --

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So that's good enough
9 for this. Anything else we want to proceed with?

10 Okay. Motion to adjourn?

11 MR. WHITAKER: So moved.

12 MR. GOODMAN: Second.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

14 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

15 * * *

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 REPORTER CERTIFICATE
23 I, Alexandra K. Wiater, do hereby certify that I
4 did report in stenotype machine shorthand the
5 proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;6 Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true
7 and accurate transcription of my said stenographic
8 notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set
9 forth.

10

11

12 Dated this 23rd day of February, 2020

13 At Rochester, New York

14

15

16 _____
17 Alexandra K. Wiater

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Edith E. Forbes
Court Reporting Services
(585) 343-8612