

B R I G H T O N
H I S T O R I C
P R E S E R V A T I O N
C O M M I S S I O N

August 27th, 2020

At approximately 7:15 p.m.
Brighton Town Hall, Zoom Meeting
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON

JUSTIN DELVECCHIO)
AMANDA L. DREHER)
JOHN PAGE)
DIANA ROBINSON)
DAVID WHITAKER)

BOARD MEMBERS

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
Town Planner

NOT PRESENT:

WAYNE GOODMAN

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'd like to start the
4 open forum. Amanda, you're on.

5 MS. DREHER: Okay. So talking about my garage
6 project again. Ramsey, do we want to put up the architects
7 drawings first?

8 MR. BOEHNER: Sure. We have something up. I
9 think we started with maybe --

10 MS. DREHER: Whatever is first, that's fine.
11 We have settled on a design for now. This is the, what you
12 are seeing, the east elevation is the entrance into the
13 mudroom. We decided to go with a bit up, a door that is a
14 little bit more reminiscent of a front door because that's
15 how we use the house and this is the back of the house. This
16 is not going to be anything fancy. We are talking to Jim at
17 Honeoye Falls Millwork about --

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great person.

19 MS. DREHER: Yes. So we're waiting for a
20 quote from him to make a door that is very close to our front
21 door and our vestibule door, and to make a window that would
22 be, you know, almost an exact match of the rest of the
23 windows in our house. So I believe that's the way we're
24 going to go.

25 We're doing the side lights to let a little

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 bit more light in there. And one of the questions I had for
4 you folks was that Jennifer, the architect, is recommending
5 an eight-foot door. As a back door we currently only have an
6 80-inch door. The front door is four inches, seven feet,
7 she's recommending an eight-foot door because the ceilings in
8 there are high and the entrance to the kitchen is elevated up
9 three steps so when you look out of the kitchen you would see
10 more of a door and more of the outside. Jim will be making
11 the door most likely.

12

13 Thoughts of that are very large and I'm really
14 torn with whether it should be an eight-foot door. That
15 seems very large for a back door even though it will let in
16 more light, but my husband and I are really not sure. But
17 the drawing she has there is an -- she's put in an eight-foot
door.

18

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: One option, Amanda, is to
20 go with a, like a seven-foot door and a transom or something
like that.

21

MS. DREHER: Oh, okay.

22

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You would not -- it's
24 going to be difficult if you want a storm door or a screen or
25 anything like that. An eight-foot door is expensive and it's
big.

2

3 MS. DREHER: I haven't had the chance to look
4 underneath the closed overhang that we're doing.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I think the amount
6 of light would be very similar to, if you just lower the top
7 of the door say a foot, make it seven-foot instead of
8 eight-foot, you would just have a transom across the whole
9 thing that would let in light, and you would still be able to
10 see out at that height. And yet if you went with a storm
11 door or anything else it would be considerably cheaper to
12 build.

13 John or anyone else, welcome your thoughts on
14 it.

15 MR. PAGE: So I would go with 6'8" door with a
16 transom that gives you more of a -- a little more of a
17 transom. I think what's potentially nice about this is that
18 the height of the head of the door or the head of the transom
19 is common with head of the window in this particular
20 instance.

21 I have some feelings about the door and the
22 side light that I can share with you at some point. I would
23 tend to go with either a bottom style that's taller than
24 that, they're typically more like ten inches traditionally.
25 The transoms look very modern to me -- excuse me, the side

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 lights look very modern to me as a single tall light. But I
4 can give you a sketch of my thinking on that then you can,
5 you know, chose to go which route that you want to go.

6

7 MS. DREHER: I actually was thinking for the
8 side light at the door to do recorder glass. So that's the
first --

9

10 MR. PAGE: I would actually prefer that with a
panel on the bottom, would be wonderful.

11

12 MS. DREHER: Well, I think they should match,
like, the door and the side light.

13

MR. PAGE: Agreed.

14

15 MS. DREHER: That's what Jim's actually
working up, so that will be one option.

16

17 MR. PAGE: I also think you could consider a
single side light instead of a double side light, just have
somebody sketch it and look at it.

18

MS. DREHER: Okay.

19

20 MR. PAGE: And, again, if you want, if you
send this to me I will do a hand sketch of some thoughts that
21 I have.

22

MS. DREHER: That would be very helpful.

23

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John, you mentioned a
25 wider style at the bottom, you mean wider rail, right?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MR. PAGE: I do mean a wider rail, I
4 absolutely do.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

6 MR. PAGE: As you said earlier, Jerry.

7 MS. DREHER: Okay. Can we scroll down to
8 the -- unless there's any other comments on that part? Go
9 down to the next, the garage. This is our floor plan.
10 Actually, let's go down a little bit further so you can see
11 what it's going to look like, that might be easier.

12 MR. PAGE: You flipped it.

13 MS. DREHER: We did, we did.

14 MR. PAGE: Good idea.

15 MS. DREHER: I let my husband decide where the
16 garbage toter should be, as it is his responsibility. As you
17 all know we are a ways from the road, so every 20 feet
18 matters.

19 So we are putting them on the south side.

20 We're doing the nine-foot garage doors. We did decide on the
21 north elevation we are doing this one standard height door
22 and then doing two double hung windows. And they were placed
23 in a way that if we wanted to do something, if we wanted to
24 do some kind of a canopy or something freestanding or
25 attached to the garage for shade, because we will get a lot

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 of sun in that area. But the window placement would be
4 that -- we thought that was where the window placement should
5 be for that. If you scroll down a little bit further you can
6 see that.

7

8 For the, you know, the east and the west
9 elevations we're just going with a double hung and the gable.
10 And we are keeping the band, the architect gave us a couple
11 different renditions and that's what we decided. We'd like
12 to stick with that.

13

14 And then if you scroll up a little bit --
15 thank you, Brett, for getting all this -- if you scroll up to
16 the floor plan. So we are doing a whole staircase. We do
17 need a variance for the height and the zoning planner warned
18 us that an attic area that is accessed by a staircase and a
19 good head room up there, but is not preferred. But we, this
20 is really what we would like to do. My husband would like to
21 be able to stand up there, we would like to be able to use it
22 for storage.

23

24 The concern apparently is that it could be
25 used as living area, a loft or whatnot in the future. But
that's what the Zoning Board doesn't like to see. This is
the way we'd like to build it, so we're going to proceed with
this. The ports are -- speaking of a variance by any legal

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 argument we have and to make, so this just functions the best
4 for us.

5 And the real important questions that I have
6 for you guys, just for some feedback, is the type of
7 materials for the garage. We are going to do board and
8 batten siding. We don't have a contractor yet, we're waiting
9 to do the construction drawings with a contractor, finalize a
10 contractor. But Brett, the siding is not in there so you can
11 just start at the top of the materials.

12 But, yes, either board batten, a metal roof
13 which we have not looked at roofs yet. We're waiting for the
14 one contractor we're pretty certain we're going to go with,
15 is going to give me some recommendations for a metal roof. I
16 like the style in the picture that you are seeing, but I
17 don't -- a metal roof is totally new to me, so I don't know
18 if the Board has any feedback, any suggestions.

19 What I'm looking at in a metal roof, I liked a
20 little bit of a wider style, other than that I haven't looked
21 at anything yet. So if you have any feedback for that,
22 otherwise I don't have any clear path to show you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, a couple of
24 questions, unless you have more to present.

25 MS. DREHER: I can go -- why don't I go

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 through the rest of the materials.

4

 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great.

5

 MS. DREHER: So I originally thought we were
6 going to do wood, lots of wood, everything, and however, that
7 has proved to not be the best option for a new build. So I
8 wanted to discuss what kind of materials the Board would
9 think were appropriate for something that's a new build,
10 which I have not been on the commission long enough to have
11 seen a new building. We haven't had any new build since I've
12 been on the commission, so.

13

 Garage doors, steel was recommended to us. We
14 have two different sort of levels here, what's shown now is a
15 sort of a mid-range steel. You can get the carriage styles,
16 comes in a wood grain look. It can be painted, but it comes
17 in a wood grain look, and seems to be a good option. The
18 downfall is you can't replace parts of them. If they get
19 dented by say, small little boys that may be running around,
20 they basically have to be replaced if they get pretty
21 damaged, so one downfall.

22

 If you scroll down, we have another option
23 which is a less expensive option that doesn't give us,
24 doesn't give us a -- as far as, like, a carriage style look,
25 it doesn't have as good of a design, but it does have, it's

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

3 more -- sufficient and is also able to be repaired and
4 replace a section of it. Which is, when we went to Felluca
5 to look at garage doors that was one benefit.

6 So how does the Board feel about a garage
7 door, you know, a steel garage door as opposed to a wood
8 door?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, are the wood doors
10 really wood or some compost material?

11 MS. DREHER: The ones you are seeing are steel
12 and composite. I did look briefly, talked briefly about a
13 solid wood door. It is very expensive and a lot of
14 maintenance. So as far as solid wood with, you know, no
15 steel, no composite, it's very expensive and high
16 maintenance. So we would prefer to go this route, which is
17 not what I was intending to do until I started researching
18 and learning about all these materials, so one of these
19 options would be our preference.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if all options, I
21 mean, if -- either one, which would you prefer? One that you
22 could fix if it gets dented?

23 MS. DREHER: I am leaning toward the carriage
24 style right now. We would pick a final option to present,
25 you know, to put in our application. The really appealing

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 thing about the other one is that it can be, parts of it can

4 be repaired. We do have two very small children and I'm sure

5 they're going to be struck. They already are. But I really

6 like the carriage-style look, but it is a composite and is

7 steel and it certainly can dent. And the folks I've spoke

8 with at Felluca said they have tried for years to be able to

9 find a way to fix them, replace parts or pieces and they just

10 can't do it. They can't piece them together. But we would

11 prefer either one of these options over solid wood.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

13 MS. ROBINSON: Can I ask, is it true that

14 these doors are often damaged? I don't think I see the --

15 MS. DREHER: To be honest, I've never, I

16 haven't really had a garage with this kind of door, ever.

17 I've lived in a lot of old houses, but never had a garage, so

18 this is new to me. I have seen garage doors with dents in

19 them, but I don't know. I'm hoping -- I don't think it's

20 more of an issue, like, you throw a baseball at it. You

21 know, he said soccer ball, basketball, fine; baseball, hockey

22 puck, my husband was inquiring about, he was hoping the kids

23 play hockey. It's going to dent it. Is it going to be bad

24 enough that we would want to fix it? I certainly hope not.

25 Which is why I'm leaning towards this, the

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 one, the carriage style. It's more of a traditional carriage
4 style. But my main question is, are you okay with the steel
5 composite option with the wood grain look, or even a flat
6 painted look. I'm not sure what's going to look best with
7 the siding. I have to kind of mull that over, both of them
8 come in those options.

9 MR. PAGE: I'm okay with it, it just depends
10 on the style, right?

11 MS. DREHER: Right.

12 MR. PAGE: If you ended up coming in with a
13 modern style, then I wouldn't be okay with it.

14 MS. DREHER: Well, what you are --

15 MR. PAGE: If it has a bit of a traditional
16 style to it, a little character, then I would be okay with
17 it.

18 MS. DREHER: What you're looking at right now
19 is where the arrow is on the left, for this less expensive
20 model, this is, I think that's the look that we thought would
21 look the best.

22 MR. PAGE: That's lovely.

23 MS. DREHER: So if we went with the less
24 expensive option, the one that was repairable, it would be,
25 that would be the look we would be going for.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diane, the SQ 22?

4

MS. ROBINSON: SQ 22, yes.

5

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. I see two arrows,
that's why I was asking.

7

MS. ROBINSON: I prefer the SQ 22.

8

9 MS. DREHER: Yes. That has basically the grid
10 on the windows is removable. So we think we prefer that, but
11 if we don't then we can always take it off and get the option
of both.

12

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is the grid on the
outside?

14

MS. DREHER: It is, yes.

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

16

17 MS. DREHER: As opposed to the top option is
18 the four windows, there's actually four windows, and so I'm
19 still mulling that over. But I'm leaning towards the one,
the lower one with the arrow.

20

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I like that better.

21

MR. WHITAKER: I do too.

22

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Although probably if you
24 are trying to do something with the vintage of the house,
probably would not have had windows in it any way.

25

MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If you do want windows,
4 probably the SQ 22 is more the one, or the one below it
5 whatever that is. It has the, yes, the divided lights there,
6 the SQ --

7 MS. DREHER: I think the one with the arrow on
8 it is REC 14. That has the removable grid.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

10 MS. DREHER: The SQ 22, is separate windows
11 with removable grids in them.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

13 MS. DREHER: So --

14 MR. PAGE: I'm fine with any of those.

15 MS. DREHER: Okay. And the carriage style
16 that we looked at before was the more expensive door. I
17 believe we've talked, yes, so that style as well, we would be
18 putting windows in it, but that's --

19 MS. ROBINSON: Is it the 22 or 23?

20 MS. DREHER: 22, I believe is our preference.

21 MS. ROBINSON: 23 is not correct.

22 MS. DREHER: No, the X goes to 22. 21, we
23 thought about but we're thinking about doing that maybe on
24 the toter doors, which, why don't we scroll down and we'll go
25 to the next, I don't know if windows or doors are next.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 Let's see. You can go ahead and pass all the garage doors.

4

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Amanda, where did you get

the bids for the door from?

6

MS. DREHER: Felluca.

7

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You might want to try
Alliance Door.

9

MS. DREHER: Okay.

10

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And Roly-Door. And
12 Roly-Door has just put opener -- well, the one they just
13 installed on our carriage house and they did the other one.
14 But you might just want to see if they have anything that you
15 like better and it might cost less, or more susceptible to
baseballs and hockey pucks, just a thought.

16

MS. DREHER: You said Alliance Door?

17

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Alliance Door, yes, and
the residential department is called Roly-Door, R-O-L-Y door.

19

MS. DREHER: Okay, thank you.

20

21 MR. WHITAKER: We have very old doors, very
22 heavy, but I would be concerned about the dents with the kids
also.

23

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. The idea if you
have to replace a whole door, that's not -- I would stay away
25 from that.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MS. DREHER: Okay, thank you. I will
4 definitely take a look at that.

5 So windows, I looked at Anderson at Morris and
6 I looked at Marvin at Rochester Colonial. So the Marvin, I
7 think the Marvin option we would like to go with for the
8 garage is the Elevate collection. And just, you know, one of
9 the ones they are fiberglass, they're wood with fiberglass, I
10 believe that's the right description. So the interior is
11 wood not clad, and then the exterior is clad in fiberglass.

12 It comes in colors and I think what would be
13 appropriate, probably looking at a grayish beige, I think you
14 can see with my arrow and the pebble gray I'm not entirely
15 certain that all the garage door color and look and the
16 siding and the windows all have to sort of be decided. But
17 that's the look we're going for.

18 So it is a fiberglass window and I believe it
19 is the lower end of Marvin's. I would think explaining,
20 there was the solid -- the wood top of the line, which we
21 were initially looking at to put in the mudroom until we
22 found out about Jim's, and we prefer to have to make the
23 window.

24 And then there's an aluminum option from
25 Marvin that's all aluminum, I believe. And then there's this

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 Elevate collection which is a fiberglass. So we think this
4 is a good option for the garage, and some feedback of what
5 you both think.

6

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: They would not have

grills; is that correct?

8

MS. DREHER: That's correct.

9

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just one over one?

10

MS. DREHER: Just one over one.

11

MR. PAGE: I'm fine.

12

MR. WHITAKER: Me too.

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Amanda, I do have a
14 couple other thoughts, maybe you want to go through the whole
15 thing and then I'll throw those out.

16

MS. DREHER: Sure. Well, I think the last
17 thing is if you scroll down, the last thing is we have doors
18 or we have -- oh, we have the patio. So we will skip over to
19 the patio. The patio will be next to the garage and we
20 looked at RT Masters, we looked at Blue Stone, this is the
21 pattern that Mark has recommended, the random rectangular
22 pattern. We would do with the blue stone or these are two
23 different concrete paver options.

24

For cost purposes, we have quite a bit of
25 walkway and we have a big patio we would like to do -- or

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020
2

3 terrace as Mark would say, I'll call it a terrace. And we
4 can save quite a bit with going with concrete pavers. We
5 actually thought they looked a little bit more interesting.
6 However, my husband is a geologist so he was always favoring
7 the stone, but we think that this is the better option.

8 I know it is something that maybe in 20 years
9 we'll want to redo in blue stone. But for, you know, it's
10 hard to tell, but I think this is one area where we would
11 like to save money because it's a very large project and we
12 really like the options. We didn't -- I know that stone,
13 natural stone would be, obviously, more appropriate for the
14 time period of the house, but this is what we are favoring.

15 MR. PAGE: You're just going to look lovely
16 and it's on the ground, it's not part of the main stretch, I
17 don't really see it as an issue.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Be prepared to by some
19 extra RoundUp, you're going to have little weeds between
20 every joint in those.

21 MS. DREHER: Well, I don't know. There's no
22 other option I mean, there's nothing else I think we could do
23 that would look good.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: There's concrete.

25 MR. PAGE: If you are working with Mark, he is

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 going to recommend a section that has a weed barrier and, you
4 know, other -- and crusher run and sand and things that are
5 going to discourage that.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Let me just explain that
7 our front walk is, it's brick pavers and there was a weed
8 barrier and all that, but weeds tend to grow between. They
9 put sand usually between the --

10 MS. DREHER: Yeah, the primary sand.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And that's where the
12 weeds grow. They don't come up from below, they come up from
13 the top.

14 MR. PAGE: Charming at that point.

15 MS. DREHER: Well, we have a DIY patio that my
16 husband and our landscape guy did from left over materials
17 from one of the granite places and it's full of weeds. But
18 the joints are very wide and, you know, apparently polymeric
19 sand isn't all equal, so there are better versions of it than
20 what my husband bought from Home Depot.

21 So with professionals and the proper base and
22 sand, we don't want to go for a concrete look. I know the
23 standard concrete is going to achieve somewhat of a look but
24 it's not recommended for the northeast as far as I know
25 because it's going to crack.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I wouldn't recommend that
4 either. You have two young children, they can take care of
5 the weeds.

6 MS. ROBINSON: I have a solution for your weed
7 problem. We have the rugged stone with wide joints and if
8 you put moss, RoundUp will not kill the moss and it's slowly
9 filling in the cracks. Eventually we will have no more
10 weeds.

11 MS. DREHER: Interesting, I hadn't thought
12 about that.

13 MS. ROBINSON: We just found out that RoundUp
14 doesn't kill moss. That's how we learned that.

15 MS. DREHER: Well, that's much preferable to
16 weeds. The -- we were thinking concrete for the parking
17 area, in front of the garage. Our original plan was to do
18 all crusher run for the driveway and the parking area.
19 However, we recently learned that if we then decide a year or
20 a couple years down the road to pave or to put in concrete,
21 they need different bases. So we do think we are going to
22 want -- we have no hard surface. Without anything in the
23 parking area, around the driveway, we have no hard surfaces.

24 I don't like the look of anything other than
25 gravel from the road, so the driveway portion will likely

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 always stay gravel. But in the parking area we thought maybe
4 we should have a hard surface, and perhaps we should make
5 that decision now.

6 So Mark has, you know, suggested that concrete
7 was a good look. We could even do an exposed aggregate. I
8 don't have it here, that's something I have to look into,
9 probably for next month, but we might end up doing concrete
10 in the parking area after all. But, again, it's going to
11 come down to cost and where we are and everything else.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just a thought on
13 concrete, if you bring your cars and they're loaded with
14 salt, you want to make sure the concrete is sealed because
15 otherwise salt and concrete don't go well together.

16 MS. DREHER: Yeah, Mark was talking about a
17 certain kind of sealer and having it resealed professionally
18 every five or six years.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Good.

20 MS. DREHER: That's, yeah, we would definitely
21 do it right. And it's not a final decision, but I am going
22 to ask the contractor about that. We're waiting to hear back
23 from him on the roof.

24 I think the only other thing that is next is
25 the doors for the toter, the garbage toters, and the door on

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 the north side that we would enter into from the house.

4 These are -- they are true and these actually were the doors
5 recommended by both Morris and Rochester Colonial. They are
6 a fiberglass with a wood look. You can see all of the
7 different architectural characteristics there. They're made
8 to be a nice door.

9 So rather than a wood door, because we are not
10 doing a screen, a storm door, but it's not covered. It's
11 hard to come in and out of a storm door and a main door. So
12 I want to limit -- so coming from the car I have to only go
13 through three doors as opposed to four if I don't do a storm
14 door on the garage. So I would like to go with this
15 fiberglass composite door.

16 I was thinking about the arrow, that design, I
17 am not 100 percent sure if I want it to be divided. But I do
18 think for this we wanted to go with not a three-quarter
19 glass, but less glass on this. But any thoughts on this type
20 of a door? Again, I'm not using a solid wood door.

21 MR. PAGE: Any of those are fine.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

23 MS. ROBINSON: I think you maybe want to mimic
24 your exterior door a little bit.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes. Whatever window

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 pattern you have on the overhead door, you might want to
4 carry out to the --

5 MS. DREHER: Oh, okay, on the garage door,
6 okay. Yes, that could be -- there's an option in the second
7 row, yes, a couple options in the second row that could match
8 that. Okay.

9 So, and if you scroll down a little bit
10 more -- thanks, Brett, you're doing great -- for the doors to
11 the toters depending on exactly what we pick for the overhead
12 doors, these are some of the options. A solid panel, most,
13 you know, do a carriage style, whichever -- something, one of
14 these that would look appropriate, on the same side with that
15 you're going to see both of them.

16 MS. ROBINSON: Are you going to make them the
17 same as your garage doors? Make similar, different size,
18 different shape by similar. There's too many different
19 things happening.

20 MS. DREHER: You think the same pattern. If
21 you scroll down a little bit more, Brett. So here you have
22 the similar patterns.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What about the ones you
24 showed earlier? Couldn't they go on the toter doors too?

25 MR. PAGE: Not without the glass. There were

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2
3 some there that looked just like your other door, except no
4 glass.

5 MS. DREHER: These actually are. These are
6 the same types of doors, just no glass.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, why wouldn't you
8 put glass in the other door?

9 MS. ROBINSON: No.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No?

11 MS. DREHER: I don't know if we want to see
12 the toters. Although it might be above the toters, but I
13 don't know. We never really considered it. I always was
14 just assuming it would be solid.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. If all three doors
16 are on the front of the -- the two overhead doors and this
17 door, they're on the front of the garage, I didn't think --
18 well, you could always hang curtains or something inside the
19 door. I would, you know, my first inclination would be to
20 make them all the same, the same type of light pattern.

21 MS. ROBINSON: Can we look at the elevation
22 again?

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, I see what you're
24 doing.

25 MS. ROBINSON: The totter doors are a different

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 size.

4

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, right. Okay, I

stand corrected.

6

7 MS. DREHER: Okay. I think as far as the
doors go, Jerry, did you have any suggestions or comments on
8 the metal roof? We were talking about that at the beginning.

9

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Let's start, if no one
11 else wants to jump in here, let me fill my four and a half
12 sections. One, I really think you might want to add at least
13 towards the end away from the house I would add a couple of
14 windows on the gable, at garage level. Simply because, in
15 keeping with the house if you are trying to mimic the same
16 vintage of the house, the garage has always had windows on
17 the first floor as well, so that is one suggestion. I think
18 if you put a couple windows on the gable away from the house.

19 Secondly, I would consider an entry from the
20 house that would go into the garage that would be covered
21 because if it's raining or something, and you want to get
22 into the garage you don't necessarily want to have to come
23 out, go around and get into another door. That would be a
suggestion.

24

25 MS. DREHER: So I think right now we have them
covered at the mudroom, the door entering the mudroom.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

4

5 MS. DREHER: And then, you're about, oh, ten
6 to 15 feet I think to the door on the other side of the
7 garage and we don't have that door covered. We looked into
8 making -- we thought about doing a covered walkway. We nixed
9 that plan because of the cost and we brought the garage much
10 closer than we originally were planning, and eliminated the
driveway.

11

12 So I would love to be covered the whole way,
13 but we just don't have the budget for it. We don't have the
14 money for anything that would be any sort of covered walkway
that would require tiers of the sort.

15

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What if you just had the
17 garage opposite the one kitchen, even if it wasn't covered,
around the corner.

18

19 MS. DREHER: If you -- I'm trying to see where
20 you could see the -- if you, do you, Brett, do you have the
21 color drawings from the landscape architect that show the
corner of the garage is at about the corner of the house?

22

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

24

25 MS. DREHER: Here we go, okay. The door,
wherever you place the door you're about the same distance.

26

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, I stand corrected

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 again, yes.

4

5 MS. DREHER: Trust me, I wanted to do it
6 covered, I really did. But once we get into, you know,
7 sinking tiers and whatnot, it was expensive and we just don't
have the funds for it.

8

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I didn't realize the

10

garage. Okay, this helps. This would have helped earlier.

11

12 MS. DREHER: This is my big sacrifice, my big
13 sacrifice was not being covered.

14

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That makes sense. And
16 they do sell umbrellas, from what I understand.

17

18 MS. DREHER: I can run, it's good for me now.

19

20 MR. WHITAKER: I have a question. Amanda, you
want a metal roof, right?

21

22 MS. DREHER: Yes.

23

24 MR. WHITAKER: Is there trees over the roof?

25

26 MS. DREHER: No, nothing at all. This is the
area in my backyard that there's no trees whatsoever.

27

28 MR. WHITAKER: Okay. We have a metal roof on
29 the barn and there's a walnut tree and it makes a lot of
noise.

30

31 MS. DREHER: I would imagine that. We
32 actually have a walnut tree by the actual barn. This is

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 going to kind of be like a barn, but our actual barn we have

4 a walnut tree over by there. And, but, no, we don't have

5 anything -- Mark is suggesting he could see putting in a tree

6 there, as well as my husband dreaming of an outdoor kitchen,

7 but that is definitely Phase 2, 3 or 10.

8 MR. WHITAKER: Just don't have a walnut tree

9 over a metal roof.

10 MS. DREHER: I agree, that would not be a good

11 idea.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Even an oak tree, we had

13 one over our cottage and we knew when the acorns were

14 dropping. But, you know, to get back to the metal roof, the

15 house has an asphalt roof; is that correct?

16 MS. DREHER: It does and it needs to be

17 replaced I'd say within the next five years.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So why not do an asphalt

19 roof on the garage?

20 MS. DREHER: So this is, you know, a

21 conversation we've been having, you know, we had with

22 architects, we had with Mark, we had with the contractors,

23 that we believe we're going to go with. The thought was part

24 of the timing is an issue. If we do an asphalt roof on the

25 garage and don't do the house for five years, is going to be

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 an issue with it matching, and because they're so close the
4 garage will have faded. I don't know how much because I, you
5 know, I've put a new asphalt roof on my last house and then
6 sold it a year later, so I don't really know how much it
7 faded.

8

9 So the metal roof was thought to be -- the
10 contractor, Mark and Jennifer, their vision was an out
11 building of a sort, not necessarily like an animal barn, but
12 an out building of a sort that would have been a farm. This
13 was a farm at the time period that we're looking at.

14

15 And so they thought the contrasting material
16 along with the fact that we weren't sure what we were going
17 to do with the house, was a suggestion.

18

19 I like the way a metal roof looks. I've
20 heard, as far as the house goes, I know there are options
21 that we haven't gotten into of different kinds of metal roofs
22 that look like asphalt roofs, that don't, that can go over
23 original cedar shake and -- it's something we haven't
24 explored yet.

25

26 And so if you folks think that's a good idea
27 for us to get into, I mean, we could do that. I just -- I'm
28 not -- we're not ready to do the roof on the house, so we are
29 trying to squeak as much out of it as we can.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: A couple of thoughts.

4 First of all, who is the contractor you are leaning towards?

5 MS. DREHER: Shane Schumann.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So what's the name?

7 MS. DREHER: Shane Schumann.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: How do you spell his last
9 name?

10 MS. DREHER: I have it up right here, it's
11 S-C-H -- oh, let me get it for you. It's, there's no L, it's
12 S-C-H-U-M-A-N-N. Yes, S-C-H-U-M-A-N-N, Schumann
13 Construction. We also had a quote from Lazaro, which is a
14 family member on my husband's side and we're getting a quote
15 from JB Sterling in the first week of September because the
16 quotes are very far apart.

17 So we are opting not to do construction
18 drawings until after we get the variances and the
19 Preservation Commission's approval. So without construction
20 drawings the contractors are not saying this is an exact
21 estimate. But I am -- I know we are going to pick the
22 materials we're going with, the doors and windows, so we will
23 have those costs pretty set. But we decided to get a third
24 quote because they were just so far apart.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, John may have some

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 suggestions, I may have some suggestions on contractors once
4 you get to that stage.

5 MS. DREHER: Okay, yeah, I would definitely, I
6 can reach out to you guys about that. But I don't know, are
7 there any other -- for the roof, we thought if we went with a
8 contrast then we would have more flexibility as far as the
9 house goes to do what we would like to do when we do it. But
10 if we went with asphalt, then we would be trying to match
11 that, would that be limiting.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any thoughts?

13 MR. PAGE: I'm fine either way, not a big
14 issue either way for me. I like a metal roof, fine, asphalt
15 roof is fine. Not concerned about them looking like the same
16 thing.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So as far as siding goes,
18 probably looking at composite cement board, whatever siding
19 you're -- whether it's board and batten or preference,
20 whatever?

21 MS. DREHER: No, we are going to go with cedar.
22 I think it's cedar, yeah, we're doing wood.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Really? Okay.

24 MS. ROBINSON: Good choice, Jennifer.

25 MS. DREHER: I was going to say --

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MS. ROBINSON: I didn't mean to call you
4 Jennifer.

5 MS. DREHER: No, Jennifer is the architect. I
6 was just talking about her.

7 That was what we thought we would go with. I
8 mean, I grew up with a board and batten building in our
9 family campground. I told my mom, much to her dismay, I
10 would not paint the same cabin brown color from Sherwin
11 Williams.

12 But to me, I would want wood. I mean, we can
13 save money on the doors and the windows and the garage doors
14 and the patio, but I would like to go with wood.

15 MS. ROBINSON: We did the Hardy Plank and I
16 wish we hadn't.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Well, if you go to
18 cedar get white cedar, if possible, vertical green also, if
19 possible.

20 MS. DREHER: We're thinking a semi-transparent
21 stain. Jennifer, the architect, has pictures of Monroe
22 County some park buildings that, pictures she wanted to show
23 us of semi-transparent stain or before they were stained or
24 something. She'd give us a look, but I went to Sherwin
25 Williams to get an idea of the differences because I am only

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 familiar with an opaque stain that we've done at the family
4 business.

5 But I think we're going to go for probably a
6 semi-transparent to see more of the wood. And so the garage
7 doors, you know, I think there's got to be a contrast. Color
8 wise, I'm just not sure what I want to start with materials
9 that, there is material the way we are going that composite
10 would be an option. Then we'll get to the next level of
11 color and settling on a style.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We don't have any
13 dictation over colors, and if you go with semi-transparent
14 and you don't like it, you can go over it with a solid color
15 at some point.

16 MS. DREHER: That's true. We're thinking a
17 lighter color with darker windows, and darker doors, and
18 garage doors. More kind of like the color of our barn. Our
19 barn, the wood on our barn, we don't have very much wood at
20 all, because we just have the stone level, but there's some
21 wood on it and it's gray, brown, barn wood. Exactly what you
22 would expect, but that's the sort of tone we are going for, I
23 think.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, again, we don't
25 have any authority over colors. So you could paint it pink

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 and green. Hopefully not, but that we do not control.

4 MS. DREHER: So I think that is it for I'll
5 say this month because I'll probably be back next month with
6 some more questions. And we're going to submit our
7 application for the October meeting, and Jennifer and Mark
8 will be with us and we'll be able to answer any questions
9 there are. I'm sure you folks will be tired of hearing about
10 this, but we will be on our way. And then we're going to
11 build as soon as we can in the spring.

12 MS. ROBINSON: Amanda, what's the name of your
13 door carpenter, Jim?

14 MS. DREHER: I don't know what his last name
15 is.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Jim Turner.

17 MS. ROBINSON: Thank you.

18 MS. DREHER: I reached out to Steve Jordan to
19 see if his sash maker would make me a window, and his sash
20 maker has retired. He pointed me to Jim and Jim said, great,
21 as long as he can build it over the winter and I didn't need
22 it in the next, you know, couple months.

23 MS. ROBINSON: There's also David Young, if
24 you need to have a second choice.

25 MS. DREHER: Is it Young?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MS. ROBINSON: Dave Young, he does all our
4 windows and doors.

5 MS. DREHER: Okay. I will reach out to you
6 for contact information because I was just -- this is a new
7 process to me, so I think it can never hurt to see what we're
8 looking at.

9 But I think that's the best way to go for the
10 house so we can get matched and we can stick with the type of
11 materials that would have been used on the house. Even
12 though this is an addition that was done, we're not entirely
13 sure, but the last addition on the house. So and by the
14 aluminum outside, maybe '50s to '60s, so I think on my list
15 that's all I had.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: One other question. What
17 were you planning on for gutters and downspouts? Haven't
18 gotten that far?

19 MS. DREHER: Haven't gotten that far. That's
20 a very good question. I'm sorry, there's so many moving --
21 this is a project of a scale that's new to me. So that's a
22 very good question. I --

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, that's why we are
24 here.

25 MS. DREHER: Yes. Do you think, I would say

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 probably five inches are fine.

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, material.

5

6 MS. DREHER: Oh, yeah. I'm not sure. On our
7 house we have, I think we have aluminum, but we are going to
8 replace them when we do the roof. They're terrible and they
9 are not well placed. But for the garage, because it's a new
build, I'm not sure what would be recommended.

10

11

MR. PAGE: Jennifer will give you a good idea
on that.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. DREHER: Okay. But, yeah, we haven't
talked about that yet. I thought I had everything. We're
actually good. Does anyone know where I can go to look at
metal roofs?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I probably could send you
a couple of, I don't know whether B&L Wholesale sells them?
Do you know, John?

MR. PAGE: I don't know.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Let me do a little
research and I can see what I can come up with.

MS. DREHER: It's tough without having locked
in a contractor yet. I don't want to burden them into
sending me things if -- until we've made a final decision.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: There's a couple of

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 resources, I will see what I can find.

4

5 MS. DREHER: Okay. We are waiting to hear
6 back from Shane because I did have a couple of questions for
7 him. One of them was what do you recommend for a metal roof.
8 So I will be back next month with an example for the metal
9 roof and some gutters.

10

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just a couple thoughts on
12 the metal roof before you go. Make sure that the fasteners
13 are concealed, and they don't have any screwed through with
14 gaskets on the outside of the face of the roof. So if it's a
15 the scanning seam, normally they will put a clip under the
16 same part and then bend it over and put another section on.
17 So make sure the fasteners are concealed.

18

19 MS. DREHER: Okay, all right. I think we're
20 good to go. Thank you so much, Brett, for showing us all
21 that.

22

23 MR. GORDON: Jerry, this is Ken, if I could
24 chime in here?

25

26 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

27

28 MR. GORDON: So just, I know that we don't do
29 too many new constructions these days and I know Amanda
30 hasn't made her application yet. Just in anticipation of
31 when she does make her application and it does come before

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 the Board formally, the issues for new construction are the
4 same as any alteration issues. It's not a matter whether
5 it's a look you like, dislike, or whether it's convenient or
6 inconvenient for the homeowner, or whether it costs more or
7 less, the certain materials.

8 What the issue really is, is the new
9 construction compatible with the historic character of these
10 existing structures, and it would include the grounds. The
11 grounds as you know, at least a certain percentage or a
12 certain number of feet of the grounds are included in the
13 designation. So what is done with the patio is relevant,
14 what is done with the roof is relevant. But it has to do
15 with the consistency of the rest of the structure and
16 compatibility with the historic character of the building.

17 I heard a lot of other subjective terms being
18 thrown around during this discussion that wouldn't
19 necessarily be appropriate under the criteria that we have.

20 MS. DREHER: I appreciate the Commission
21 feedback. For me, on the sorts of style issues that would,
22 that, you're right, that would not be normally part of an
23 application.

24 My main goal tonight was to find out as far as
25 the materials go, using steel composite garage doors for

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 example, if the Commission would agree that that would be
4 compatible with the historic character of the property.

5 Because we haven't seen something like that while I have been
6 on the board. So, thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We have to measure
8 historic relevance, appropriateness with practicality. And
9 so, the garage doors you mentioned are certainly, would
10 certainly be historically appropriate, but if you have to
11 replace the whole door if it gets dented, that's not
12 practical. So we try to look at both sides of the issue.

13 MS. DREHER: I did have one further question.
14 Given that we are doing Zoom, I assume we are still doing
15 Zoom in October, the sheets that I have pulled from the
16 brochures and the books that were given to me, are these
17 sufficient evidence of the materials, or would you like me to
18 obtain samples and have them for you in front of the camera
19 at the time we make the application? Or is what we've shown
20 sufficient?

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I think what you
22 have shown is okay, but I'll listen to John and the rest of
23 the Commission, what do you think?

24 MR. PAGE: This would represent a good
25 submission.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3

MR. WHITAKER: I'm still undecided.

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think you're okay.

5

MS. DREHER: Okay. That's all for me.

6

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

7

8

MR. BOEHNER: We have another speaker for the open forum. Jerry, let me unmute her.

9

Elizabeth, are you there?

10

11

ELIZABETH SHANNON: I am. Can you hear me okay?

12

MR. BOEHNER: I can, yes, we can.

13

14

ELIZABETH SHANNON: Okay, and now my video's going.

15

MR. BOEHNER: Yes, your video's going.

16

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Hi.

17

18

ELIZABETH SHANNON: So I have never done one of these before, what's the best way to start explaining why

19

I'm here?

20

21

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just explain why you're here.

22

23

ELIZABETH SHANNON: Okay. So my husband and I just purchased 394 Edgewood and we're very excited to be living in a historic home. And I believe in the past this home was reviewed for possible designation and then it was

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 not -- part of the reason it didn't go further is I believe
4 the aluminum siding.

5 And I was curious what other factors might be
6 coming into play as a barrier? Because if it's only the
7 siding, we're not fans of aluminum siding either and we would
8 probably want to move forward pursuing designation. But if
9 there's a laundry list a mile long of reasons why this house
10 would not be considered or approved, I would like to get
11 started on some projects that would make this place more
12 livable.

13

14 deep down I love old buildings. We got married at the
15 Genesee Country Museum for a reason. And it's something I'd
16 love to do, but I feel like it's a quality of life and the
17 mountain ahead of us if we did want to pursue designation.

18

19 Diana who lives across the street and also Mary Jo. I don't
20 have the original survey in front of me, but I believe there
21 were several things that were changed since we first looked
22 at the house.

23

24 not, I believe we were about to either ask to have the survey
25 updated, I think that's what it was. And just a week before

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 they ripped out all of the double hung windows. And I
4 remember Jerry's statement, have you driven by the house,
5 have you seen what they've done? And that kind of put a
6 damper on everything, even though I was probably the only one
7 who voted the opposite way.

8 So it's the windows and siding, and I believe
9 other people were concerned the shrubbery, but that, I'm not
10 sure about that. I think the only really important
11 characteristic I can see of the house is, one, it's history.
12 That it belonged -- there was in the family with our house,
13 number one. And, number two, the little gingerbread front
14 porch. Other than that it's just a house.

15 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Right.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Mary Jo?

17 MS. LANPHEAR: I have nothing to add really, I
18 concur with Diane.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Did they take -- the
20 porch has some bric-a-brac on the front porch, is that still
21 there?

22 ELIZABETH SHANNON: It is.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So basically, it
24 was probably the shrubbery, which can be replanted, no big
25 deal. So it was the windows and the siding, I think were the

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 two deciding factors of why we did not proceed with
4 designation.

5

ELIZABETH SHANNON: Okay.

6

7 designated aluminum siding on Edgewood already, one of the
8 first houses, the Joseph Anthony house.

9

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So --

10

11 probably combining. The windows are the biggest deal for
12 sure. Siding, is actually somewhat reversible.

13

14 because they were all loaded up against a tree in front of
15 the house. And, this is very personal, but I called my
16 husband to go get the windows, and he do not do it. Is a
17 very personal story.

18

19 windows, were they divided light?

20

21

22

23 Marvin simulated divided light, or true divided light. We
24 had a group, a similar situation in the past. So that would
25 be one thing, which would not be inexpensive for sure. And

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 the siding you could probably just take off and find out what
4 was underneath it.

5 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Yeah. Okay. Getting the
6 windows addressed does sound like a very big undertaking.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it's probably worth
8 a call just to find out what's involved.

9 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Yeah, yeah. One question
10 that is also important for us to know as we're considering
11 this or not, there are other pieces of this house that
12 clearly are not original. The garage that was added on at
13 some point and it needs work. It's not really a two-car
14 garage. Off the back of the house there used to be a deck,
15 now it's just a six-foot drop out of the kitchen. Are those
16 the kinds of things that would fall under needing approval if
17 we would be able to get designated status?

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If you wanted to change
19 the garage, sure. We would certainly be open to that, as
20 long as it was, you know, appropriate. Sure, we would be
21 open to that. So if you wanted to just tear what you've got
22 and rebuild it, providing you would do it zoning code-wise,
23 we would not have a problem with that.

24 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Okay. We would like to
25 put both our cars there honestly.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I can understand why.

4

5 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Living in Rochester a

minute, it makes sense.

6

7 MS. ROBINSON: Mary, I have a question, have
8 we ever -- I have never heard of this, but would we be open
9 to some of the windows being replaced? Maybe the most
visible windows? Just an idea.

10

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I think any of the
12 windows that get replaced we would be open for. Whether or
13 not that would affect designation or not, I can't say. I'm
14 just one number, but I don't think we have any windows better
than probably what's there, so.

15

16 MS. DREHER: Can you describe what the
17 windows, what they were replaced with? What are they like
now?

18

19 ELIZABETH SHANNON: I believe they are just a
standard, modern, vinyl window.

20

MS. DREHER: Okay.

21

22 MR. GORDON: Jerry, it's Ken Gordon, if I
23 could just again make a couple quick comments. So it's my
understanding that this property is neither currently
24 designated, nor is it any longer on the list of surveyed
25 properties awaiting designation. So currently this property

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 does not really fall under the Historic Preservation

4 Commission's jurisdiction in any way. And the question that

5 you're asking is a very difficult one, because what you are

6 asking is, if I do certain work will my property be

7 designated? And I can tell you that we could not possibly

8 give you an answer. We cannot make a decision until it had a

9 full record and a full hearing before it.

10 So perhaps one of the ideas would be for you

11 to speak with the architectural firm that does the historic

12 surveys for the town. An idea from them as to what they

13 would see about your property and what improvements you could

14 make to the property to get the architect to have an opinion

15 that it is worthy of designation or at least worthy of

16 preservation under the criteria that we have in our Town

17 Code.

18 I don't think the Commission today or frankly,

19 at any point could give you an opinion in advance as to what

20 work you should do in order to make your house designated.

21 ELIZABETH SHANNON: That's really helpful

22 feedback, thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ken.

24 ELIZABETH SHANNON: How can I get the name of

25 the architecture firm?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We can supply it.

4 Perhaps Ramsey can send you that after we're offline.

5 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Okay, great. And my
6 husband --

7 MR. BOEHNER: If you could just e-mail me, you
8 have my e-mail. Thank you.

9 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Yes. My heart's not set
10 on getting designation, but I would be very unhappy with
11 myself if I let an easy enough opportunity slip by. So this
12 is really good starting information. It might be more
13 trouble than the historic value is worth, but it is certainly
14 worth double checking before I start doing things that will
15 get us further away from historical consideration.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Good idea. Thank you for
17 coming.

18 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Thank you for having me, I
19 really appreciate it. I will e-mail for the architecture
20 information.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great, thank you.

22 ELIZABETH SHANNON: I do have to run, but
23 thank you so much for your time.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You're welcome. Thank
25 you for coming.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 ELIZABETH SHANNON: Take care, bye.

4

MS. LANPHEAR: Bye.

5

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Anyone else here to speak

7

8 MR. BOEHNER: I don't think there's anyone

else.

9

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Then I would like

11 to call the meeting to order. Ramsey, would you please call

the roll.

12

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

14

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

15

MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

16

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio.

17

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

18

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman? Not present.

19

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

20

MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

21

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

22

MR. PAGE: Yes.

23

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

24

MS. DREHER: Yes.

25

MR. BOEHNER: All present except Goodman.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That meeting will now be
4 held.

5 May I have an approval of the agenda please?

6 MR. WHITAKER: I make a motion.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, may I have a
8 second?

9 MS. ROBINSON: Seconded.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

11 ALL COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Agenda is
13 approved.

14 Minutes of July 23rd.

15 MS. DREHER: I didn't have any changes to the
16 minutes. There were a couple mentions where there was
17 feedback in the conversation, but I think that was properly
18 indicated in the record. I don't think there were any other
19 substantive changes.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: I did see one on Page 45, Line
21 19, we need to get the spelling of Chehaead Lubivitch
22 correct.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Which is?

24 MS. LANPHEAR: The 1037 South Winton Road.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Which is the correct

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 spelling?

4 MS. LANPHEAR: Somebody that's a little more
5 knowledgeable than me. H-A-B-A-D I think is the first part
6 of it --

7 MR. GORDON: C-H-E-H-A-E-A-D
8 L-U-B-I-V-I-T-C-H.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ken won the spelling bee
10 on this.

11 MR. GORDON: I think I may be the only one who
12 went to Hebrew school.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I had a couple of
14 corrections. On Page 11, Line 11, it should be either it was
15 the house with the -- we were talking about the carriage
16 house at 2300 East Avenue. It should be either
17 Bragdon's-Design or Bragdon, E-D Design, a small thing.

18 And then on Page 37, Line 11, Landmark should
19 be a capital L.

20 And on Page 53, Line 2, we're talking about
21 the house, we just talked about it, on Edgewood Avenue, it
22 should be the former tenant house for Diana's house, it's not
23 the tenant house anymore, former tenant house. That's it.

24 Any other additions or corrections? Motion to
25 approve.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3

MS. DREHER: I will move.

4

MR. WHITAKER: Second.

5

6

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second David, all in
favor?

7

ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

8

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Stands approved.

9

Ramsey, was this meeting duly advertised?

10

11

MR. BOEHNER: Yes. It was properly advertised
in the Brighton-Pittsford Post of August 13, 2020.

12

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That meeting that was
duly advertised will now be held.

14

15

No communications, no designation of
landmarks.

16

17

First item, certificate of appropriateness,
7H-01-20, 7H-01-20 - Revised.

18

APPLICATION 7H-01-20, 7H-01-20 - REVISED.

19

20

7H-01-20 Application, and 7H-01-20 - Revised
Application of 2290 East Avenue, tax number 122.20-1-1.1, for
a certificate of appropriateness to renovate an existing
carriage house for office space. All as described on
application and documents on file.

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So that meeting, that
certificate of appropriateness will now be held.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 Who is here to speak on that? Gary and Troy?
4 Once again, for the record please state your
5 name.

6 TROY BECKWITH: Troy Beckwith.

7 GARY LEDGERWOOD: Gary Ledgerwood.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Troy, would you spell
9 your last name please?

10 TROY BECKWITH: B-E-C-K-W-I-T-H.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Very good. Gentlemen,
12 you have the floor.

13 TROY BECKWITH: Go ahead, Gary.

14 GARY LEDGERWOOD: So we took all of the
15 comments that we received last time and sent in some revised
16 contents. I worked back and forth with John and we came up
17 with something that he felt was appropriate, which is what
18 you are seeing on the screen right now. Trying to remember
19 what were some of the major changes.

20 We pushed the overhang over the door up to be
21 an extension of the roof and put in some brackets. We put a
22 transit window over the doors, per John's comments, added
23 some trim work to the dormers.

24 What else? Oh, yeah, I have to look at the
25 letter. I think that pretty much sums up what we did from

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 the last time. We made sure that we're keeping the existing
4 cornice and repairing where necessary.

5

6 have been updated to reflect the existing opening?

7

8 version, I did not have the correct window sizes. So I went
9 out and measured the windows and this now represents the
10 correct length and width -- or height and width.

-1

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John?

- 2

MR. PAGE: Yes?

- 3

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Your comments, please?

- 4

see from the additional submission was a carriage house that had -- a building that had the characteristics of the original carriage house, modified to work better with the program that they were hoping to achieve. To that end, it was recommended and what they have worked out here is replacing the original roof and extending it over the entire building instead of building a second floor with a new roof on it.

23

24 mansard with large shed dormers that are laid out
25 symmetrically around the building. They've created a simple

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 entrance. There, you can see that original design is an
4 attractive design, but relative to the original building it's
5 a significant difference.

6

7 And, so those things will work out and there's
8 some minor detail things about the trim around the windows
9 and on the main floor, and working out the entrance and
10 things that were requested. And I appreciate the willingness
11 to consider a different approach and, you know, with the same
program goals in mind.

12

13 So I'm pleased with this. I think it actually
14 represents a good blend of preservation and accommodation for
15 adaptive reuse. That, if I was on the preservation side of
things I wouldn't want to see this happen to the building.
16 If I was on the development side I would be worried about not
17 getting more out of it. I think it's from my standpoint, a
18 good compromise for the building.

19

20 So I'm appreciative and happy with the way
it's turning out so far, personally.

21

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, John. Any
other comments?

23

24 MR. GORDON: Jerry, Ken Gordon. I saw, I
think, on the design that we were presented with at the last
25 meeting a tenant sign for Tree of Hope on the facade of the

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 building. I see a tenant sign on this new design building,
4 but I assume that one will be there and I think you will need
5 to approve that operation as well. As part of the --

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, Ken, I believe at
7 the last meeting I asked about Tree of Hope and was told
8 there was no hope. And so, the Tree of Hope is not going to
9 be there, there's going to be another office building. So as
10 far as I know, there will be no sign. I believe we talked
11 about that at the last meeting, I may be wrong.

12 MR. BOEHNER: That's correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. So there's no hope
14 anymore.

15 TROY BECKWITH: And gentlemen and ladies,
16 originally when we did the building up front, as you recall
17 there is a place over the top of the main entrance to the
18 door where we were going to put a sign, but we decided not to
19 it. And we probably won't do it with this building, I just
20 think it takes the character away from the building to have
21 more signage out front.

22 There's some signage if you look at the two
23 entrance ways going into the property, but at this point in
24 time, I don't think it's necessary to actually to a sign on
25 there to designate what that building is used for. It just

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 doesn't fit the character of the building. May have to do a
4 small placard or something. We would come forward at that
5 time to do any signage on the building.

6 I don't think it is necessary at this time,
7 Ken.

8 MR. GORDON: Right. That was my point, was
9 simply not that it had to be the Tree of Hope or any
10 particular tenant. But if there was to be signage placed on
11 the exterior of the building that you would need that to be a
12 part of the -- and you said that if you decided to do that in
13 the future that's what you will do.

14 TROY BECKWITH: Correct, thank you.

15 MR. BOEHNER: Thank you.

16 TROY BECKWITH: Other than that, I think we
17 met everything. Gary, did the cornice bracket there in the
18 entrance. We will match them like we did the front house. I
19 sent him away to match the original ones. I think it's going
20 to be a great project.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great. Looks good. Any
22 other comments from anyone?

23 MR. WHITAKER: It looks good.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Gary or Troy, any other
25 comments?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 TROY BECKWITH: No, I think Gary come through
4 for us. Both of us or all of us, actually and I think we met
5 all of your criterias and I want to thank you guys very much
6 with letting us get started with the demo and we're almost
7 done inside. So get ready for step two.

8

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John, I have to thank

10

11 GARY LEDGERWOOD: Thank you, absolutely.

12

13 MS. ROBINSON: Have we seen a window and door
14 submissions? I think we asked for those last time for the
15 submittal for the actual doors and windows.

16

17 TROY BECKWITH: We are going to do the same
18 thing that we presented out front. Gary has them right
19 there. The only difference in the shingle, the color of the
20 shingle sample obviously they are matched to the rest of the
21 property, they're all the Braylor Maynard shingles. There's
22 Marvin windows, the simulated divided lights, five of each
23 to, you know, match the original.

24

25 Obviously, you guys know what we did in the
26 past, we don't chintz on anything. So when they say the
27 window's going to match what's there, it's going to match
28 100 percent.

29

30 MS. ROBINSON: No, this is good. This from

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 the first job.

4 TROY BECKWITH: Correct. Everything, all
5 through that whole project we've done the thing, you know,
6 the same stuff, so, yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks good.

8 TROY BECKWITH: We will use the restoration
9 board, the Hardie board wherever necessary. The crown
10 molding putting it up eave to eaves, they sent it away, we
11 matched the house up front, we matched it, custom made.
12 Everything, you know, will be just what you see.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great, thank you very
14 much for your presentation.

15 Any other comments or questions? Ramsey or
16 Ken, would you like to prepare a motion?

17 MR. GORDON: Sure. I take it that the Public
18 Hearing on this matter is closed?

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes, it is. The Public
20 Hearing is closed.

21 MR. BOEHNER: I don't know if there's anyone
22 who wants to speak on the matter? I don't see anyone else on
23 the participants list. If there is, please raise your hand.
24 I am not seeing anyone.

25 MR. GORDON: So with the Public Hearing

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

3 closed, I would ask that the following resolution to the
4 Board for consideration of the Commission. Whereas,
5 Application Number 7H-01-20 is being submitted for a
6 certificate of appropriateness under the Town's Historic
7 Preservation Law for improved property located at 2290 East
8 Avenue, in the Town of Brighton, County of Monroe, owned by
9 2290 East Ave Property LLC, to perform work which is
0 described as renovation of an existing carriage house for
1 office space.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 factors set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code that the

4 proposed above described work to the subject property was

5 consistent with the purposes of the Town's Historic

6 Preservation Law and compatible with the property's

7 character. Based upon its review of the application and

8 documents on file and received at the Public Hearing and

9 presented with the Hanlon Architects transmittal of

10 August 12, 2020, and presented at the Public Hearing, it is

11 hereby resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission

12 hereby receives and files the above described application and

13 amendments in the transmittal dated August 12, 2020.

14 And is further resolved that the Historic

15 Preservation Commission hereby approves Application Number

16 7H-01-20 for a certificate of appropriateness for the above

17 described work to be performed at the property located at

18 2290 East Avenue in the Town of Brighton.

19 Subject to the conditions that the work

20 performed is consistent with a transmittal dated August 12,

21 2020, and the materials and plans described in the packet

22 thereto and subject to the other conditions that the above

23 described work be completed by one year of the date of this

24 approval.

25 And be it further resolved that pursuant to

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 Chapter 224 of the Town Code the above described work
4 qualifies for the exemptions set forth in Real Property Tax
5 Law Section 444-A.

6

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ken. Any
8 additions or corrections? Ramsey, would you like to -- first
9 of all --

10

11 MR. BOEHNER: Can we have a motion and a
12 second, I'm sorry.

13

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We need someone to put
15 forth a motion.

16

17 MR. PAGE: I will make the motion.

18

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, John. Someone
20 to second it please.

21

22 MS. ROBINSON: I will second that.

23

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Diana.

25

Discussion? Okay, Ramsey, call the roll.

26

27 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

28

29 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

30

31 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

32

33 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

34

35 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

36

37 MS. DREHER: Yes.

38

39 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

5 MR. PAGE: Yes.

6 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio.

7 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

8 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

9 TROY BECKWITH: Thank you. John, are you
10 still there?

11 MR. PAGE: Yes.

12 TROY BECKWITH: We would encourage you to stop
13 by during the project and if you have any questions or
14 concerns, you know, obviously we are really dedicated to the
15 historical value of the Brighton community, as well as we
16 are. So I really encourage you to stop by and chat with us
17 and show you what we are doing.

18 MR. PAGE: Thank you, I would like to do that.
19 I won't stop by to nitpick, I will stop by to see the
20 improvements being made.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I assume that applies to
22 all of us, not just John.

23 TROY BECKWITH: Certainly.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's okay. We won't
25 ride in the same car. It's all right. Thank you, take care.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MR. BOEHNER: Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That Public Hearing is
5 closed. Now we have 8H-01-20.

6 APPLICATION 8H-01-20

7 8H-01-20 Application of John and Elaine
8 Rogers, owner of property located at 2585 Ease Avenue, tax
9 number 122.20-3-30, for a certificate of appropriateness to
10 install a four-foot aluminum fence, to match existing fence,
11 in rear yard. All as described on application and documents
12 on file.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Who is here to speak on
14 that application?

15 MR. PAGE: You need to unmute yourself.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John, is that you?

17 MR. PAGE: No.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, I mean John Rogers.
19 You need to unmute your Zoom. There you go. You there?

20 JOHN ROGERS: Can you hear me now?

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Absolutely. Just, John,
22 if you would please just state your name for the record and
23 what you want to do.

24 JOHN ROGERS: John Rogers, we live at
25 2585 East Avenue and we are installing a four-foot decorative

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 fence, in one third of the backyard that mirrors the
4 existing. So in the rear of our backyard on East Avenue, we
5 have a stone wall. The -- when you're looking at the
6 backyard, on the right-hand side, we have a black decorative
7 fence that actually mirrors the front, right on East Avenue.
8 And we are just looking to enclose it on the left-hand side
9 when you're looking in the rear of our backyard for the dogs.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And, John, what kind of
11 dogs do you have, just out of curiosity? I am a dog lover.

12 JOHN ROGERS: We have a Bassett hound and a
13 rescue, terrier.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Why have one breed
15 when you can have them all.

16 So this was part of Ron Reed's property, for
17 those of you who may not remember. And he sold his house and
18 this adjacent property, so we've seen the fence. And any
19 questions, from anyone?

20 MR. WHITAKER: Is this fence new to the house?

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It was a Barrett house.

22 JOHN ROGERS: That is correct, and our family
23 purchased the mansion next door.

24 MR. PAGE: It's a good submission and the
25 fence is the same fence that we approved previously for the

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 property, so I'm fine.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Correct. Any other
5 questions, concerns? Ken, it's up to you.

6 MR. GORDON: Are you going to close the Public
7 Hearing?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't know if there's
9 anyone out there in Zoom that wants to comment.

10 MR. BOEHNER: I don't see anyone else that
11 could possibly be for this.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Then this Public
13 Hearing has closed. Ken, would you prepare a motion?

14 MR. GORDON: Certainly. Thank you, Jerry.

15 I would propose the following resolution for
16 the consideration of the Commission. Whereas, Application
17 8H-01-20 has been submitted for a certificate of
18 appropriateness under the Town's Historic Preservation Law
19 for improvements to property located at 2585 East Avenue,
20 owned by John and Elaine Rogers, to perform work described as
21 the installation of a four-foot aluminum fence to match the
22 existing fence in the rear yard. And whereas, the Historic
23 Preservation Commission duly called a Public Hearing to
24 consider the matter on August 27, 2020. And whereas, the
25 necessary legal notice was published and the required sign

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 | posted pursuant to the Town code.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

34

35

Forbes Court Reporting Services, LLC (585) 343-8612

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 to the condition that the above described work be completed
4 within one year from the date of this approval.

5

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ken.

6

MR. WHITAKER: I make the motion.

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, David. A
8 second please.

9

MS. ROBINSON: I'll second.

10

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Diana. Any
11 comments?

12

MS. ROBINSON: No.

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Ramsey.

14

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

16

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

17

MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

18

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

19

MS. DREHER: Yes.

20

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

21

MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

22

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

23

MR. PAGE: Yes.

24

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio.

25

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

4

5

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. John, sorry
you had to wait a while.

6

JOHN ROGERS: Not a problem.

7

MR. BOEHNER: Thank you, John.

8

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any new business?

9

Okay. Any old business, other than where are
we, we were going to send a letter to 332.

10

MR. BOEHNER: 332 South Landing Road. We did,
Mary Jo and I did speak with the property owner for quite a
long time. She's very dedicated to the house. She did not
want to be designated though, and we knew that going into it.
There were previous discussions many, many years ago. She
will give you a very articulate reason why. She speaks well
and she plans to come in here and give her reasons why that
she does not think it should be designated.

11

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

12

MR. BOEHNER: Mary Jo, do you have anything
else to add?

13

MS. LANPHEAR: Just that the house is 110
years old and it's being badly damaged by the impact of the
traffic on 490. That the particular stucco with which it is
made is all being mold underneath, she said, and it is very

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 expensive to get this repaired. She literally is spending
4 everything she has to do that.

5

6 I don't know whether there's a way around
7 this. If any of you know a way to fix this problem, but she
8 is quite upset about the whole thing as you can imagine.

9

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it's an interesting
11 conundrum.

12

13 MS. LANPHEAR: It is.

14

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Mold underneath the
16 stucco?

17

18 MS. LANPHEAR: Let me see if I can find my
19 notes. Mold gets into the cracks of the stucco and then the
20 moister gets behind it, I guess, and she has a man named Jim
King who has been her restorer. And it's -- the problem
began in 1982, I guess, but they put the third lane for the
left-hand turn for 590, or after that. Anyway, the problem
began in 1982. The house rattles, she said it is falling
apart. Megan McKenzie is her gardener.

21

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I know Megan and Jim.

23

24 MS. LANPHEAR: The 13 McKenzie kids. Somebody
from Syracuse, to remove sections of a place and a time, oh
the roof, I guess, replacing it with tarpaper and then
25 putting the tiles back on. So that's a consideration also

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 that she has.

4

5 She's very passionate about the house. It
6 appears she and her husband are divorced and she is living
7 there on her own, and has been there alone since the
isolation began and --

8

MR. WHITAKER: What's her name?

9

MR. BOEHNER: Angela.

10

MR. WHITAKER: Pichichero.

11

12 MS. LANPHEAR: The widening of Linden Avenue
13 took out a three-bay carriage house and she built the garage
14 that's existing on the property now.

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: This is a tough one.

16

MS. LANPHEAR: It's a very tough one.

17

18 MS. DREHER: I was just looking at the code
19 and Ken can probably tell me faster, but when we look at the
old surveys there's an indication about the risk, and threats
20 to the property. What is our consideration of that, those
21 factors like under the code when we're designating a
22 property?

23

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ken?

24

25 MR. GORDON: Had to get to my mute button
there. It's a criteria, if we take a look at Section 224-3,
the threat to the property is not spelled out as a specific

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 criteria. I know that becomes a rating factor in the surveys

4 that are done, as to whether it is threatened or not.

5 Certainly, I don't know what this survey says, if this is a

6 red property.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, well, we can find

8 that. I guess my main concern is, I don't -- this woman has

9 undergone some personal issues and she's got some issues with

10 the house. I don't want to make life worse for her, or more

11 complicated. I would like to help her, but she's got the

12 great stucco guy, Jim King, so I'm not sure what to do here.

13 MR. WHITAKER: Jerry, I'm sure it was the

14 situation here and she wants to sell the house. So she

15 probably doesn't want anything that might affect that.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

17 MS. LANPHEAR: She did say that the other day.

18 That she didn't want to compromise, have a new owner

19 compromised by having restrictions put on him or her. But

20 she didn't mention she was going to sell the house.

21 MR. WHITAKER: Yes, she was --

22 MR. BOEHNER: I don't remember her mentioning

23 that.

24 MR. WHITAKER: She does.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I guess my initial

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 thought is to hold off on this. I don't want to make her, as
4 well as yes, the Commission is to designate historic
5 properties, it's also not to make life miserable for anyone
6 in the house. I don't know, I guess I would like some
7 further input from other members.

8

9 MR. PAGE: Well, I will say the house is a

10 slam dunk as far as designation is concerned.

11

12 MS. DREHER: I agree.

13

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I agree too.

15

16 MR. PAGE: It's pretty bad precedent if we
17 start to look at outside, you know, into emotional issues,
18 so.

19

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We've done it in the
21 past, John.

22

23 MR. PAGE: And I've always regretted it,
24 Jerry.

25

26 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I guess, how we're
27 perceived is part of what we do. And, yes, I would like some
28 other input here. I'm inclined to pass on this at the
29 current time, but what do the rest of you think?

30

31 MS. DREHER: I agree with John, any argument
32 or any consideration having to do with the sale of the
33 property, to me, I mean, things do change rapidly, but this

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 is Brighton in 2020. And even though it would most likely be
4 a more expensive house, they're still selling. And I don't
5 think this sort of house, there's no secret of the history.
6 It's not a typical house. And I don't think that any
7 consideration of the fact that it may be sold and worries
8 about that should play into it at all.

9 And if anything, you know, looking to ensure
10 that the house remains in the future is something we can
11 consider.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I was more
13 concerned with her personal situation, not just selling a
14 house.

15 MR. GORDON: If I could just interject here on
16 the discussion of any matters of a personal nature, I really
17 think that is not an appropriate discussion. Please remember
18 that we are on a public platform here, and discussing this
19 owner or any owner's personal life or marital status, for
20 example, is simply not appropriate.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

22 MR. BOEHNER: I agree with that, it has no
23 place.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Diana.

25 MS. ROBINSON: If we put it off, can we pick

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 it up in the future, a year from now?

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I don't know why not.

5

MR. WHITAKER: Yes, we can.

6

7 MR. BOEHNER: I think the question sometimes,
8 this has happened before when someone says, why did I, when I
9 just bought the house, and now you want to designate it, why
did you wait so long to designate it?

10

11

Mary Jo, were you on that call when I got hit
with that question?

12

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Probably.

13

14

15

MR. BOEHNER: So, you do need to think about
if it should be designated. You need to give it strong
consideration.

16

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any other thoughts?

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. GORDON: My only other thought I wanted to
add was, and I really am uneducated when it comes to
maintenance of historic houses altogether, but if I followed
the discussion that you are having regarding the mold causing
problems for the stucco, it is because of cracks appearing in
the face of the stucco, which sounds like a failure to
maintain the face of the stucco in the first place, is
because of the problem. And so if the property was
designated, then the Commission would have more control

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 slightly over insisting that the property be maintained and
4 preserved.

5 We certainly have seen properties in our
6 community that had deteriorated to the point that they are no
7 longer worthy of designation because of structural or other
8 disabilities, if you will, of the property. So just
9 something to keep in mind if that is what is causing it, it
10 is the owner's failure to maintain the stucco --

11 MR. BOEHNER: I don't think it is. I think
12 her position is it's cracking because of the truck vibrations
13 off the expressway.

14 MR. GORDON: After 105 years?

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think it's probably --

16 MR. BOEHNER: They got closer and actually
17 lowered the road to reduce the vibrations on the house.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I suspect it may be due
19 to the roof leaking and because the house has relatively wide
20 overhangs. I would suspect that maybe the roof is leaking
21 and going down between the frame wall and stucco. That might
22 be and maybe the vibration, I don't know what's causing it.

23 MR. BOEHNER: It's just what she had said.
24 She did talk about the cost of redoing the roof too.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MR. PAGE: So when we find ourselves in this
4 position, I always think that, and it's hard, I feel for the
5 vibration too. But in my opinion, we're supposed to be
6 dispassionate about it and be an advocate for the house.

7

8 And then the situation will arise when
9 somebody is confronted with having to replace the roof, let's
10 say, and we will -- and they will have the opportunity to go
11 for hardship if there's a hardship case to be made.

12

13 We found ourselves in the position with the
14 Litman's property where they wanted to replace the roof with
15 something -- I mean, that's, there's someone who came at it a
16 wrong way in a lot of ways. And then told what the condition
17 was and that was easy to determine the condition was actually
18 not what was being said.

19

20 So anyway, we helped that project. So there's
21 instances when we're at our best, I think we actually help
22 the people through the rehabilitation process. And this, you
23 are right, this could end up being a difficult property
24 because of the unusual nature of the stucco and the unusual
25 nature of the roof. Which also make it -- it's part of the
defining characteristics of the property and the uniqueness
of it.

26

We basically, I don't think, have another

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 building like this in Brighton, practically. And this is a
4 good architect. So I'm sad to hear that this -- that there's
5 these other things that are mitigating the way you think
6 about it, because otherwise the building on its own is just
7 fantastic.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No argument there. So a
9 motion to proceed?

10 MR. PAGE: I will make a motion.

11 MR. BOEHNER: We need to schedule the Public
12 Hearing, September 24th, is that a motion of Page?

13 MR. PAGE: Yes.

14 MS. DREHER: I will second.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any discussion? Ramsey.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

19 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

20 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio.

21 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

22 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

23 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

25 MR. PAGE: Yes.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

4

MS. DREHER: Yes.

5

6 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes. I send out the

notices to notify the property owner.

7

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Well, let's
9 on that 909 Landing Road, as I recall we had an initial
10 survey done, but we had another set and was all of the
buildings done?

11

12 MS. LANPHEAR: The church has been surveyed,
13 the property has been updated and I submitted an application
14 for both of those properties together the last couple days
ago.

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Shall we send out --

16

17 MR. BOEHNER: Sorry, Mary Jo, did we have a
survey covering --

18

19 MS. LANPHEAR: I gave it to Gretchen on
Tuesday.

20

21 MR. BOEHNER: That's probably why, I wasn't
here.

22

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So motion to send a
letter?

24

MR. PAGE: I will make a motion.

25

MS. DREHER: Do we need to see the survey

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 covering the church building?

4 MS. LANPHEAR: It was sent out to you. That
5 was my mistake last month in thinking that there wasn't a
6 survey, but there was. It was done by Icazia Griscomo.

7 MS. DREHER: The update, okay.

8 MR. PAGE: Yeah, the update which does cover
9 the other building.

10 MS. DREHER: I didn't know.

11 MR. BOEHNER: I didn't know that, Mary Jo.

12 MS. LANPHEAR: That was my mistake, it went to
13 my folder.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Okay. I was under the
15 impression we didn't have it.

16 MS. LANPHEAR: We do.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So we have an updated
18 survey and that should be in our mailboxes soon, if it's not
19 there already. Any other comments? Okay. I think we had a
20 motion and a second.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Did we have a motion and a
22 second, I'm sorry.

23 MR. PAGE: I made the motion.

24 MR. BOEHNER: And second by?

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do we have a second?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 MR. WHITAKER: Second.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: David, second. Any
5 discussion?

6 MR. BOEHNER: And this is a motion to send the
7 first letter?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

12 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio.

14 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

15 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

16 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

17 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

18 MR. PAGE: Yes.

19 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

20 MS. DREHER: Yes.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And I think we'll hold
23 off on South Winton Road until Bill has had a chance to speak
24 with them about that.

25 Any other business for tonight? Motion to

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 08/27/2020

2

3 adjourn? John says yes, a second?

4

MS. ROBINSON: Second.

5

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

6

ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you very much.

8

*

*

*

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;

Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

Dated this 22nd day of September, 2020.

At Rochester, New York

Rhoda Collins
Rhoda Collins