

B R I G H T O N  
H I S T O R I C  
P R E S E R V A T I O N  
C O M M I S S I O N

September 24th, 2020

At approximately 7:15 p.m.  
Brighton Town Hall, Zoom meeting  
2300 Elmwood Avenue  
Rochester, New York 14618

## PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON

AMANDA L. DREHER )  
WAYNE GOODMAN )  
JOHN PAGE )  
DIANA ROBINSON )  
DAVID WHITAKER )

## BOARD MEMBERS

MARY JO LANPHEAR  
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.  
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER  
Town Planner

NOT PRESENT:

JUSTIN DELVECCHIO

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter  
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC  
21 Woodcrest Drive  
Batavia, New York 14020

2

3

MR. BOEHNER: There will be two people for the open forum, one of them is Diana, and Marjorie Searl is on. I know she wants to speak so we should allow her to.

6

MARJORIE SEARL: Hi. Thank you for letting us join you tonight. So I have an explanation of why we are here. Shall I just go ahead and read it?

9

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Please.

10

MARJORIE SEARL: Regarding 124 Summit Drive, recently a painter was doing some exterior touch-up work brought to our attention that the exterior wood molding of our five-bay bow window in the south wall of the kitchen felt soft. This was the same situation that had prompted us to apply to the Preservation Board last year to replace our second story north facing window, for which we received a certificate of appropriateness.

18

The painter investigated the situation by removing the interior drywall beneath one of the windows and discovered, sadly, that water had been coming in through the windows and caused some of the wood to rot below.

22

At that time we contacted our architect, Jim Durfey, who reviewed the situation and indicated that we were going to need a contractor to do some repair work and that the windows might need to be replaced but that we wouldn't

3 know until they could see what was going on by doing further  
4 investigations.

5 At that point we made an effort to identify a  
6 contractor -- and this has all been within the last couple  
7 weeks. We made an effort to identify a contractor who could  
8 do the work and could be able to fit it into his schedule.  
9 Knowing that if it was true that the windows did need to be  
10 replaced we needed to act quickly to contact the Preservation  
11 Board in order to be in compliance.

12 Further investigation by the contractor  
13 indicated that the windows were failing and were not being  
14 well supported by the section of wall below. He removed the  
15 windows to more fully examine the situation, and we all  
16 agreed that the windows were compromised as well and we could  
17 not put them back in. At that point we contacted Rochester  
18 Colonial who provided us with the Marvin windows last year  
19 and requested that they give us an estimate for replacing the  
20 windows.

21 Our plan was and is, to get the same exterior  
22 fiberglass/interior wood windows that had been installed last  
23 year and repair the wall to match existing and paint the  
24 windows to match existing.

25 Because we were facing at least a six- to

3           seven-week wait to get new windows it was necessary to have  
4           the contractor remove any of the deteriorating wood and  
5           secure the window opening against weather, animals, and human  
6           entry. As it happened, we had just missed the deadline to  
7           apply for tonight's meeting. So we are appearing at the open  
8           forum to explain our situation and the need for us to move  
9           ahead with ordering the windows so that the contractor can  
10           complete the project before the snow flies.

12           To add to the excitement, we will be hosting  
13           our two-year old and five-year old grandchildren and their  
14           parents due to COVID circumstances over the next several  
15           months. We're looking forward to having the wall and it's  
16           point become intact. Thank you for helping us to expedite  
17           this situation.

19           CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Marjorie, can I ask who  
20           your contractor is?

22           MARJORIE SEARL: Pete Soole.

24           CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Who?

25           MARJORIE SEARL: Peter Soole.

27           CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, thank you. Well,  
28           we'll do what we can. You have already received permission  
29           to use the same type of windows elsewhere, is that right?

30           MARJORIE SEARL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Comments from anyone?

MR. BOEHNER: Give you an update of where we are. Glad that they called to set this when it happened, project's due -- I think that that occurred, the best thing you could do is call the town, which is what they did.

What I've done is I have extended the cut off for the October HPC meeting, to try to help them get an application in for a certificate of appropriateness. What we need to do now is give them an indication that the window choices they have would be acceptable to this group so they can start moving forward and would have to go through the certificate of appropriateness process in October.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ramsey, for extending the deadline. And if we approved the windows before, I certainly don't see a problem with telling them to go ahead and order the windows. Does anyone else?

MR. PAGE: So Ramsey --

MR. BOEHNER: I did explain that, but I do feel that if we approved the windows in the past, it's good.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right. John?

MR. PAGE: So Marjorie, the way I believe you explained it is, you're going to be purchasing Marvin windows

3 that will be made and match the size of the windows that are  
4 deteriorated. And you will be installing them in an opening  
5 that is the same size as the opening as the windows are being  
6 removed from.

MARJORIE SEARL: Right.

9 MR. PAGE: You're going to repair the exterior  
10 with the same materials and paint everything up the same way;  
is that correct?

12 MARJORIE SEARL: Right. Theoretically, there  
shouldn't -- whoops.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks like you got some  
firewood there.

16 MARJORIE SEARL: Theoretically -- well, not  
even theoretically, yes, that is exactly what we are doing.

18 MR. PAGE: Okay, well, understanding that, I  
19 don't see any problem. And I will just say that, we  
appreciate that you guys have been good stewards of that  
20 house. Apparently it needs that, and that the work that you  
have done prior to this has been very good. And I would  
21 expect this to go the same way.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it's a contemporary  
house with no overhang, that may have something to do with  
25 it. But the joys of old house ownership, know them well.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

So anyone else have any objection?

4

5

6

MR. WHITAKER: Based on the photographs she sent it's a serious problem and it's something that needs to be rectified.

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Absolutely.

8

9

MARJORIE SEARL: Yes, David, you are absolutely correct.

10

11

12

13

MR. GOODMAN: Reminds me a little bit of the Jane and Fran when they restored the Frank Lloyd Wright house. They started poking around a little bit, all of a sudden, uh-oh, here we go, put on the seatbelts.

14

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any ants?

15

16

17

MARJORIE SEARL: No, no. It was amazing, we did not see any. There were no insects that suddenly jumped out.

18

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's good.

19

20

MARJORIE SEARL: Yes. Wayne, you are right. You should never have somebody come over to do touch up work.

21

22

23

MR. GOODMAN: You can also look at it in the other way, it's a good thing you did, you know, or it could have been a real problem.

24

25

MARJORIE SEARL: Fortunately we have a painter who is very familiar with the house and so he's always

3 watching for any concerns.

4 MR. GOODMAN: Well, it's a beautiful house and  
5 you have done a tremendous job in being incredible stewards.

6 MARJORIE SEARL: Thank you very much. So it  
7 will be nice to try to get a wall together so the kids don't  
8 sneak out. I think we're good, I think the contractor did a  
9 very good job, you know, closing it up, so.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So any objections from  
11 anyone on inviting Marjorie to go ahead?

12 MR. WHITAKER: No.

13 MR. PAGE: Bill, as I understand it they are  
14 going to proceed that they will be back in October.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: This isn't -- I guess the  
16 question is, does anyone have an objection for them going  
17 ahead and ordering the windows?

18 MR. PAGE: Not under the criteria that's been  
19 laid out, no.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Do we need to take  
21 a vote, Ramsey?

22 MR. BOEHNER: So, no, this just happened. I  
23 just asked very quickly for them to explain what happened.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

25 MR. BOEHNER: I have to say, these things do

3 occur quite a bit. The best thing you can do is get in  
4 contact with the town and try to help them. I don't have any  
5 way to acquire this.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So, Marjorie, one more

question, who is your painter?

9 MARJORIE SEARL: Jason Maclagger, he is -- I

can't say enough good things.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great, okay, super.

MARJORIE SEARL: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you for coming in.

MR. BOEHNER: Follow up with Gretchen please,  
14 and get everything in so we can get you going.

MARJORIE SEARL: Thanks so much. Buh-bye.

MR. GORDON: Jerry, if I could just pop in  
17 here. This is Ken Gordon speaking. I will say, we do have  
18 unique circumstances like this come up every now and then.  
19 And it would be permissible under our Historic Prevention  
20 Code, in fact, the code expressly allows the Commission to  
21 establish rules or policies to determine when repairs or  
22 maintenance of landmarks will not require a certificate of  
23 appropriateness.

I don't know, Ramsey, if you want to give that  
25 a little thought or somebody on the commission wants to give

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 a little thought to what criteria, what conditions, what  
4 circumstances might lead us to allow someone in an emergency  
5 situation, repairing with materials previously approved by  
6 the Board, something along those lines, you might want to  
7 have as a process.

8 I would rather that we have an established  
9 process and not just do this in a very informal way.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You can make repairs as  
11 long as you're using like-kind materials and restoration. So  
12 considering we already have approved windows, I guess this  
13 could be --

14 MR. GORDON: It's not. And this is not  
15 strictly a like-kind repair with like-kind materials. But  
16 what I am saying is, it's permissible under your code, and  
17 you would have to have a Public Hearing to create those  
18 policies and procedures, which would in special circumstances  
19 allow work to be done, which otherwise would require a C of A  
20 to not require a C of A. And I think there are special  
21 circumstances like this one that we should probably consider  
22 create that policy or that procedure.

23 That's what I'm suggesting, rather than just  
24 do it as we've just done it, on an informal basis. Just my  
25 recommendation, it's up to the Board or up to staff to take

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 that up, but that would my recommendation.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah, it's a little  
5 difficult, because we want to make sure that we have some  
6 kind of control over what's going to go on. And in any  
7 event, I think if there was a situation like this, they would  
8 still have to come before us in some form or another.  
9 Otherwise, I think we would loose that ability to make sure  
10 that things are being done in a correct manner.

11 Now, obviously they secured the house or at  
12 least the openings to prevent any further damage, but that's  
13 going to be difficult, I think.

14 MR. BOEHNER: If you can give it some thought.  
15 I am not sure exactly the wording of that or how that could  
16 be properly implemented. Now, this thing, she had two window  
17 charts when this whole thing started. I really, I was  
18 wanting her to also be here to say, she was looking at maybe  
19 doing an Anderson window and I needed guidance, I wasn't  
20 comfortable. But I would be comfortable under a policy  
21 choosing a window.

22 It's something I have to put some thought in.  
23 See if I can do some research to see if I find policies out  
24 there that will waive our process in emergency situations. I  
25 think that's where Ken is as opposed to doing things

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 informal.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, regardless --

5 MR. BOEHNER: Then we'll have found a policy  
6 that's been established by the Board and it all becomes very  
7 clear.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right. I think  
9 regardless of the policy, I think we still need to be  
10 apprised of what's going on and have some input as to  
11 whatever --

12 MR. BOEHNER: And the policy could be written  
13 in some way for that. Because on this one, even if there was  
14 a policy, I don't know if I was going to make the windows --  
15 without coming to you guys. I just don't think I would.

16 MR. GORDON: Right. And I can -- I'm sorry,  
17 Ramsey, you and I can talk offline. We could shorten  
18 noticing periods in our policy or procedure under special  
19 circumstances, so that matters could come before the Board  
20 like this one, once you get the Board's input. And not have  
21 somebody hold off on actually ordering windows or doing work  
22 that's necessary.

23 If you look at our code there is no emergency  
24 repair balance, there's not. So if you have an emergency  
25 with your designated property and you need to fix that

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 problem with something that is not like-kind material,  
4 because maybe you can't get it, it's not available. You are  
5 going to need to get a C of A and you're going to need at  
6 least technically under the rules as they now exist, you have  
7 to get it on the agenda and wait a month and have a Public  
8 Hearing.

9 I'm suggesting that maybe we can shortcut that  
10 in a formal way with a formal policy. So Ramsey and I will  
11 talk. I saw John nodding his head or giving a thumb's up, so  
12 maybe John's got some thoughts and ideas too.

13 MR. BOEHNER: My thought is we need an  
14 emergency policy like John has said. Is there anything in  
15 the code that could help the situation? We don't have  
16 anything, and I would have loved to have something. When I  
17 first talked to her she was panicked, I felt bad. I hate  
18 having -- you want to help someone not have to be a  
19 bureaucrat with them.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, Ramsey, you did  
21 fine by extending the deadline. So, and by having her come  
22 tonight and discussing approving the windows so they can be  
23 ordered and then she can come back in October. So thank you,  
24 Ramsey, for that.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, and me and Ken will talk

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 and figure something out.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diana, I believe you're  
5 on the podium.

6 MS. ROBINSON: Right. I think there's a  
7 sketch but it doesn't really show much. We have been  
8 chomping at this idea for many years now about solar panels  
9 and solar installations. And, of course, I'm of mix. Yes, I  
10 agree for the good of the world and all that, but I really  
11 don't like to look at them. So but, he met this fellow and  
12 the proposal seems too good to pass up. So I promised him I  
13 would bring it before you.

14 The little sketch shows -- the numbers come  
15 out I was totally surprised. The total cost of the thing  
16 would be less than \$10,000 and it would give something like  
17 50 percent of the electric that we use now, based on the  
18 bills we have now, so we would save about \$1,000 a year.

19 That's really not here or there, other than  
20 the numbers did surprise me. That there's two credits, a New  
21 York State and a Federal credit, so the whole thing is less  
22 than \$10,000.

23 Then, I said I would present it. I don't like  
24 to look at them, so unfortunately this is the total south  
25 side of the main roof of the house. What I've just done is

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 every time I drive home I tried to look and see if it  
4 would -- if I was a driver in a car and as a driver, I  
5 wouldn't know. I would not have a clue, I wouldn't care, I  
6 wouldn't see it, I wouldn't even get a glimpse.

7 As a passenger looking out the window and  
8 watching the scenery go by, I might look up and say oh, look  
9 at that they have a solar roof. So I don't know, in one  
10 hand, I don't like what they look like, on the other hand I  
11 guess my argument in this direction is that they are  
12 removable. It's something that goes over the shingle roof  
13 and so essentially could be removed. So with that, similar  
14 to how a paint color could be changed, I guess that would be  
15 my argument for. That's about it.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if you had to  
17 replace your roof, I assume that you'd have to take the  
18 panels off and put new shingles on and put the panels back;  
19 is that right?

20 MS. ROBINSON: They would, that whole side of  
21 the roof would be reroofed whether it needed it or not before  
22 they put the panels on.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

24 MR. PAGE: I think in general I am a proponent  
25 in any way of good things. Good things for preservation,

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 good things for energy, good things for the planet,  
4 et cetera. Campbell-Whittlesey house didn't hesitate to go  
5 after some sunshine. So you would be in good company that  
6 way.

7 I don't think -- I mean, it might be a harder  
8 situation if it was a barrel tile roof or something like  
9 that, but given the way it, you know, a standard roof and  
10 like you said these are removable at some point if somebody  
11 didn't want them. So I have no problem with it, I think it's  
12 a nice idea if you can live with it.

13 MS. ROBINSON: I don't like when you drive by  
14 and somebody has them all on the front elevation porch where  
15 you're driving by and they smack you in the eye. So I have  
16 been looking -- unfortunately, it's a very simple roof, it's  
17 just one big rectangle and I had looked into it a few years  
18 ago just putting some on the pool house to heat the pool, but  
19 it was not feasible. The only place you can do it in the  
20 house is the south side of the roof, which is the main roof.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do they have a life span?

22 MS. ROBINSON: I don't know. That's a good  
23 question. He does say they lose a tiny percentage of  
24 efficiency from year to year, over a 30-year period. Maximum  
25 points of size per year through the year 30. So I guess he's

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 thinking they could stay there for 30 years. He's got it  
4 right here, I am right. 30-year linear performance warranty,  
5 25-year product warranty, and 30-year performance warranty.  
6 Inverter carries a 12-year warranty, I guess that seems fair.

7 I was just surprised at the cost. Also the  
8 other thing is, I don't know, they have a starting date. I  
9 don't know if the starting date is when you sign a contract  
10 or when they start work. But the Federal credit goes to  
11 22 percent next year, and then 2022 it goes away, unless they  
12 put it back again. But as of now, there's 22 percent next  
13 year and zero after that.

14 MR. BOEHNER: I want to make you aware of  
15 something else in the code. We do have a section which is  
16 207-45 which is our solar energy systems regulations, you may  
17 want to check into. I'm not sure, that's additional  
18 regulations beyond having to come see the Commission with an  
19 application [inaudible].

20 MS. ROBINSON: Okay.

21 MR. BOEHNER: I can help you with that.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Sounds like you want to  
23 do it this year for sure. Since the tax credit, the Federal  
24 tax credit decreases next year, is that right?

25 MS. ROBINSON: Well, that's my question. Is

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 signing the contract good enough to say that, you know, it's  
4 a done deal? Or because still, it's still pushing it to find  
5 a roofing contractor, and I don't know. And I guess it would  
6 formally come before you, I don't even know what the  
7 deadlines would be. We would formally have to come before  
8 the Board before we finalized it, unless we just went ahead  
9 and, you know, a winger like.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well --

11 MR. BOEHNER: Something, without a certificate  
12 of appropriateness I would not be able to issue the building  
13 permit of the installation of the panels.

14 MS. ROBINSON: Okay. So --

15 MR. BOEHNER: I think to be honest, you do  
16 need to do research just because roofers are very, very tough  
17 this time of year.

18 MS. ROBINSON: I know.

19 MR. BOEHNER: The pandemic made that even  
20 tougher, and prices have gone up, right, Amanda? So you do  
21 have some challenges ahead of you to try to get that work  
22 done this year. It's just not our time schedule. But let us  
23 know, because we do support solar in this community, if this  
24 Board gives you an approval for the certificate of  
25 appropriateness.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 MS. ROBINSON: Okay, so we can make a formal  
4 application. I guess the worst thing that can happen is the  
5 next year it's just a smaller credit or something. That  
6 would be the biggest.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It would make sense to  
8 find out if you signed the contract, would that look at the  
9 existing credit?

10 MS. ROBINSON: That's my question. But still,  
11 we have to come before you, I guess that wouldn't be until  
12 November now.

13 MR. BOEHNER: If you have drawings ready to  
14 go --

15 MS. ROBINSON: There's no drawings, this is  
16 scripted. They show you so many panels at such and such a  
17 size and there you go.

18 MR. BOEHNER: So the certificate of  
19 appropriateness would be appropriate to have something  
20 showing replacement of the actual roof area. Also, you will  
21 need drawings of showing load, and a bunch of stuff to get a  
22 building permit. And you can't have the panels too close to  
23 the top of the roof. There's some regulations that are going  
24 to have to be shown met in order for us to issue the building  
25 permit, much less the certificate of appropriateness.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 MS. ROBINSON: Is that all in this 207.45?

4 MR. BOEHNER: No, that's in our official  
5 regulations, the certificate of appropriateness also requires  
6 a plan to be submitted.

7 MS. ROBINSON: All right. Just to say, I have  
8 been kind of holding back on this. I wasn't really -- I  
9 guess I'm talking myself into it. You guys sound a little  
10 encouraging, so I guess I'm talking myself into it.

11 Okay. I will pursue the guy and get all the  
12 rest of the information and make a formal application.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diana, if you don't want  
14 to do it we can take care of that.

15 MS. ROBINSON: I just don't like looking at  
16 them, but I can't see them and the price is so reasonable.  
17 It seems a lot different than I --

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, we can't see them  
19 from our house --

20 MS. ROBINSON: So there you go. Just keep  
21 your eyes on the road and you will never see them.

22 Okay. I will get more information and we'll  
23 make a formal application in November I guess.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Good.

25 MS. ROBINSON: Thank you.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone else for  
open forum?

5

6

7

MR. BOEHNER: If they do, please raise your  
hand, it's in the share the screen portion. Is there anyone  
who wants to speak in the open forum, please raise your hand.

8

I'm not seeing any, Jerry.

9

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. I'd like to  
call the meeting to order. Ramsey, would you call the roll  
11 please?

12

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig.

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

14

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

15

MS. ROBINSON: Here.

16

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

17

MR. GOODMAN: Here.

18

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

19

MR. WHITAKER: Here.

20

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

21

MR. PAGE: Here.

22

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

23

MS. DREHER: Here.

24

MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Delvecchio.

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: May I have a motion to



1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 anyone else want to start?

4

5 MS. ROBINSON: I have a very small one,  
6 Page 45, Line 6, I was speaking and it says Mary instead of  
7 Jerry. There's no Mary it should be Jerry.

8

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

9

10 MS. DREHER: I was actually, this is Amanda  
11 Dreher, I didn't think that the open forum should be recorded  
12 in the minutes. It didn't, it wasn't when we met in person.

13

14 MR. BOEHNER: No, it does not need to be, but  
15 actually, Ken, does it? It does, the whole thing? Ken, your  
16 on mute. I think the answer is yes, it does have to.

17

MS. DREHER: Okay.

18

MR. BOEHNER: Ken, unmute it.

19

20 MR. GORDON: My fault, sorry about that. I  
21 was going through the 332 South Landing Road documents.

22

23 Yes, under the Governor's executive order we  
24 had to transcribe everything that takes place during the Zoom  
25 meetings.

26

27 MS. DREHER: Oh, so it's a different  
28 regulation.

29

30 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Most of these under, are  
31 under Amanda, so she probably will agree or disagree. But  
32 Page 3, Line 6, I think we're talking about Gilmore and it

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 said four inches, seven feet. I think it should be  
4 seven feet, four inches.

5 MS. DREHER: Seven feet, and four inches, I  
6 apologize, I didn't review the open forum comments because I  
7 didn't think they needed to be.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Stand by --

9 MS. DREHER: I'm looking at them right now.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And Page 5, Line 7, it  
11 says recorder glass. Does that make any sense, recorder  
12 glass?

13 MS. DREHER: Three quarter glass.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, three quarter not  
15 recorder, okay. And Page 10, Line 20, I think it says if all  
16 options, I think it should be of all options.

17 Page 11, Lines 4 and 5, small children are  
18 going to be struck, I think it says stretch or struck or  
19 scratched, I don't think we need all small children are going  
20 to be struck, so I'm not quite sure what that means.

21 MS. DREHER: What page was that?

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Page 11, Lines 4 and 5,  
23 small children are going to be struck, I think.

24 MS. DREHER: I don't recall what that was.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, small children --

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

MS. DREHER: Oh, destructive.

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, there you go.

5

Okay.

6

MS. DREHER: And they already are destructive.

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And Page 16, Line 8,  
elevate? Is there such a window called elevate?

8

MS. DREHER: Yes, it's the collection they  
have. It's the wood inside, fiberglass outside.

9

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. On Page 32,  
Line 18, I think it should be grain not green.

10

Page 37, Line 14, should be standing seam  
not -- steaming or something, standing seam for the roof.

11

MS. DREHER: Yes. Not scanning seam, the  
standing seams.

12

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Page 45, Line 13,  
I think it should be just one member not one number.

13

And Page 69, Line 15, moisture,  
M-O-I-S-T-U-R-E, misspelling.

14

And on Page 71, Line 12, oh no, I am sorry  
wrong one. This was Jim Keane, you're not -- are you doing  
anything with Jim Keane? No, you're not. He's a stucco guy.

15

MS. DREHER: I thought Keane was on Page 69,  
and Page 71, the references to King, I also believe they

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 should be Keane.

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes, K-E-A-N-E.

5

MS. DREHER: Per the letter that we got.

6

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. And, then, well,  
7 are you going to talk more tonight about where you are?  
8 Because you and I had a conversation off line about some  
9 changes we talked about. Are you going to bring that up or  
10 shall we continue until you're ready to go?

11

MS. DREHER: No, we are not ready to proceed

12 based on several things so, yeah.

13

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Well, if you get a  
14 chance let's talk because I have other information for you.

15

MS. DREHER: Thank you.

16

MR. BOEHNER: Let's review the minutes if you  
17 could.

18

MS. DREHER: I just have one or two more  
19 changes on the 69 and 71, the references to Keane instead of  
20 King. On Page 49, Line 21, and to Page 50, it did have a  
21 correct spelling of Chabad-Lubivitch. I believe the correct  
22 spelling was C as in cat, H-A, B as in boy, A, D as in dog.

23

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I thought that was  
24 corrected by Ken?

25

MS. DREHER: I believe the stenographer just

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 misheard Ken, just so we correct it in the record so we have  
4 the right reference.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

6 MS. DREHER: And the only one I had was  
7 Page 52, Line 22, transit I believe should be transom window.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any other  
9 corrections?

10 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, I've got a couple.

11 Page 43, Line 8, it's the Joseph Abbey house, not the Joseph  
12 Anthony house. And Page 79, Line 6, it should be Katie  
13 Eggers Comeau, not the name that's not pronounceable there.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any other  
15 corrections? Motion to approve the minutes as corrected.

16 MS. DREHER: I will move.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second, please.

18 MS. ROBINSON: I will second.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

20 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Opposed? Minutes stand  
22 approved as corrected.

23 Was this meeting duly advertised, Ramsey?

24 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, it was properly advertised  
25 in the Brighton-Pittsford Post of September 10, 2020.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That meeting as duly  
4 advertised will now be held.

5 We have two communications, the first one is  
6 from Mary Jo Lanphear dated 9/22 regarding 322 South Landing  
7 Road. And we also have a letter from Angela Pichichero,  
8 dated 9/23 regarding 322 South Landing Road.

9 First item on the agenda is Application  
10 9H-01-20.

11 APPLICATION 9H-01-20

12 9H-01-20 Application of Mary Jo Lanphear, Town  
13 Historian, for property owned by Angela Pichichero, at 332  
14 South Landing Rd, tax number 138.05-2-77, for landmark  
15 designation. All as described on application and documents  
16 on file.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And I assume there's  
18 someone here to speak on that.

19 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes, I am Angela  
20 Pichichero.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: For the record please  
22 state your name and you have the floor.

23 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Thank you. I'm Angela  
24 Pichichero and just for the record it's 332 South Landing  
25 Road.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I didn't say that  
4 correctly? I said 322.

5 ANGELA PICHICHERO: It's 332 and in my letter  
6 to you I have my own correction. And for some reason in the  
7 third line I said we are a historic reservation committee.  
8 I -- it looks like preservation, and so I can fix that. I  
9 think I did that twice. You are the preservation committee.

10 And so I am not sure exactly what it is that  
11 you might want me to do tonight or what the procedure is. So  
12 Mary Jo Lanphear wrote and I have a copy of it. And I have a  
13 statement of situation that I wrote to you. And I don't know  
14 whether you have a conversation, I don't know if you  
15 questions, or I don't know whether you want me to have  
16 questions?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ken, do you want to  
18 respond to this?

19 MR. GORDON: Sure, I'd be happy to. Ms.  
20 Pichichero, am I saying that correctly?

21 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Perfectly.

22 MR. GORDON: Thank you. Ms. Pichichero, first  
23 of all, thank you very much for attending tonight. It's so  
24 important to have our residents come to these meetings. What  
25 you are here for I hope, and I trust, is to provide your

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 input at this Public Hearing on whether your home at  
4 332 South Landing Road should be designated a landmark under  
5 the Town's Historic Preservation Law.

6                   And I think you had an opportunity to see the  
7 papers prepared by Mary Jo Lanphear, to see the cultural  
8 resources survey prepared in 2004 on the house and to see the  
9 update that was prepared this past February by the Bero  
10 Associates, all of which is before this Board tonight as part  
11 of the record on the Public Hearing. We're hearing whether  
12 your house should be designated.

13                   So the way this works is this is your  
14 opportunity to provide information, your testimony, or any  
15 other documentation you wish to present to the Board to  
16 present your side to whether you think your house should or  
17 should not be a designated landmark under the Town's Historic  
18 Preservation Law.

19                   You're welcome to present anything that you  
20 think is relevant to that issue. And the Board may have  
21 questions for you, it is a process that really is for the  
22 Board to receive your information, not so much for the Board  
23 to respond to your questions. But if you have questions, we  
24 will certainly try to address them as best we can.

25                   So with that, I hope that explains where we

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 are in the process. You may, if you wish read your statement  
4 to the Board. I think it has been circulated and it will be  
5 made part of our record and it will be considered in the  
6 Board's decision making.

7 So, in fact, there it is. Brett has just  
8 shared it on our Zoom meeting window. So with that, I want  
9 to turn it back over to the Chair of the Commission, Jerry  
10 Ludwig, and ask if, you know, you Ms. Pichichero, want to  
11 give your testimony at this time or present anything else.

12 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay, so it's Jerry  
13 Ludwig?

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's me.

15 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay. And so would you  
16 address me at this point?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Sure. Just a couple of  
18 comments. First of all, I noticed that you have used a  
19 couple of people, Jim Keane, I believe and also Charles Cook.  
20 I am very familiar with both, they've done work on our house.  
21 So I applaud you in getting the right people to do the job.  
22 And John is giving a thumbs up to that.

23 The other thing is, I guess, I'd like to make  
24 a couple statements before you go on, if that's okay. We are  
25 very interested in assisting in any way we can with help in a

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 historic house, as you have seen earlier. I don't know  
4 whether you tuned in, but there was a lady here earlier who  
5 has a mid-century modern house and she has some windows.

6                   And we all know -- and I live in a 1970  
7 house -- 1917 house, and we all know older houses need  
8 repairs and, but sensitive repair. And so one of the things  
9 that the Board tries to do is to help people in that respect.

10                  The other thing that was done several years  
11 ago was we sort of did a little research in trying to  
12 determine whether or not historic properties when they went  
13 for sale, if the historic designation had a detrimental  
14 effect on the resale value. And at that time we found that  
15 every single property that had sold went for more than the  
16 appraised value. So I don't think necessarily that historic  
17 destination is a detriment. So with those two things in  
18 mind, I'll turn it back to you.

19                  ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay. Well, thank you,  
20 Jerry. And ironically the Board is meeting, I called  
21 Marjorie Searl and told her that it was going to happen today  
22 and she laughed and she said, well, you're going to hear me.

23                  So yes, I don't know how well, but in the last  
24 year we have been in a group together. I did not know she  
25 had this historic house, and, but I did know that she has a

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 very significant knowledge base of preservation. And so I  
4 wanted to get her input in regard to what she said about this  
5 consideration of this house. It was just, you know, small  
6 town kind of situation.

7 I want to be able to clarify some issues.  
8 Some are maybe a little bit in terms of debate and other  
9 things really need to be carefully looked at. For instance,  
10 in the description of the house, Mary Jo Lanphear, she  
11 actually did follow Katie Eggers Comeau's suggestions that  
12 this house is an Italian Renaissance style house.

13 I actually called Roger Brown earlier this  
14 afternoon and, I don't know his mother's name, he designed  
15 the garage that fools everyone. Just for the record it was  
16 listed but I had changed the original door to the historic  
17 garage. I built this historic garage. So, yes, sir,  
18 Barbarino, is that Roger Brown actually designed that garage  
19 and Jim Keane built it. And Roger Brown designed my addition  
20 on the back of the house and Jim Keane built it.

21 So and Jim Keane has done all of the interior  
22 and exterior work on this house except for the roof where I  
23 did have to engage the Cook company. And things will change,  
24 he has retired. He will still come because I call him. He  
25 reminds me that he's retired.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3                   So here are the situations in regards to, is  
4                   it policy designated here in these papers, that I have  
5                   received and you have received, that Italian Renaissance it  
6                   shocked Roger Brown. Because actually it's an Amalgam house.  
7                   It is a combination of craftsman mission, an elegant center  
8                   entrance colonial, and a broad wash historical basis.

9                   You look very hard and far of an Italian  
10                  Renaissance style. By far, the furtherest removed of the  
11                  rest of the presentation, of what the house actually looks  
12                  like, which is rust stucco, as opposed to smooth stucco of  
13                  Italian Renaissance, angled and not just a front but there  
14                  are buttresses all around the house of these -- these are  
15                  very, very specific documented across the country  
16                  particularly Chicago, Michigan, of the craftsman mission  
17                  style. So we have to fix that as a description because the  
18                  description of the house should actually, no matter what, be  
19                  accurate.

20                  And then what I wanted to ask is that I have  
21                  always paid attention to this house, steward 40 years. So I  
22                  also appreciate the fact that it styled the  
23                  DeRidder-Pichichero house and I am still here. There are no  
24                  plans of departing, I am still the steward of this house. So  
25                  I'm completely engaged with it. And from day one is my MO

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 for this house.

4

5 So I don't really come to you with a yeah or a  
6 nay or a duke-out situation. I want to do and continue to do  
7 the right thing for the house. It wants to be taken care of  
8 and it deserves to be taken care of and I want that to  
continue to happen.

9

10 And when you tell me, Jerry, that there isn't  
11 a relative monetary distinction between having a historic  
12 house and its sale price versus not. There's something that  
13 has happened to this house that is relatively dastardly, and  
14 it is the cell tower. Nobody cares because you drive by. It  
15 looms over my house. When I speak to someone on the phone,  
16 now I'm in my beautiful dining room right now -- but most of  
17 the time I am in my sun room, this addition, that is world  
18 class. It looks out on a cell tower. That was nothing  
before.

19

20 This is not a small deal for this house. The  
21 duress that this house has -- am I still with you? Wow, oh,  
22 bravo, bravo, okay. So there's one duress. I'm standing in  
23 my addition inside, so I'm not even outside, and this is what  
24 I'm looking at. The picture above it is another duress and  
that is that if you go out on my wonderfully historic looking  
garage and you stick out a long arm you might get hit by a

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 car. That's a little hypothetical and maybe a little

4 hyperbolic because there's a wall there, but the point I am

5 making is that you can feel every single car go by, every

6 single truck.

7

8 And if you were even sitting here with me

9 right now you would here the single car that goes by. You

10 also hear thousands of cars go by all day long. And of those

11 trucks that stop right after, so you see my house and then

12 there's Landing Road coming at the 441 and that's my turn in.

13 About a hundred feet further to your left there, is East

14 Avenue where people stop. So everybody is stopping, so all

15 of the stop noises are there, and all of the vibrations.

16

17 And this is where I want to speak to you about

18 my stucco. My stucco shakes every day. And if you look very

19 hard, I wanted to take a picture of it for you but it is hard

20 to get the clarity of it. It's disintegrating. It's

21 powdering off of the house. So now if you look at the

22 picture on the right, you can see where I have not had Jim

23 Keane do anything recently, but you can see that probably

24 next year or the year after, that's going to be a hole.

25 Because mold gets in there and if you stare hard at it you

can see the little cilia, the little hairs sticking out from

underneath that white stuff because there's moisture inside

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 there.

4

5 So on the left, and, oh, there, okay. So on  
6 the far left -- on the far right of the picture is the  
7 beginning of my addition, and on the right side where there's  
8 the light, you can see that it wants to fall off. It wants  
9 to fall off. And the dark part is where I've had recent  
repair where there were holes.

10

11 And, so I want to rant and rave about this,  
12 but there's something called honest repair. This house has  
13 never been painted. This house has never had anything  
14 applied to it but something called exposed aggregate. That's  
15 when you mix the stone into the -- get more excited about  
16 this -- the concrete, and you apply it onto the original  
17 lathe that is underneath the stucco. This is what Jim Keane  
does.

18

19 Now, I, so now we're looking at all these  
20 different areas where in the center picture you can see that  
21 white area that needs repair, and also on the far right, you  
22 can see it's whitish where the stones have fallen off, the  
23 layer of concrete is still there. And it isn't a hole yet  
24 because I have recently -- and it's \$5,000 per trip, of  
fixing the holes on Landing Road side.

25

Prior to me being in this house, on the far

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 left side you see two lines of kind of looks like gunky  
4 concrete. That is how the previous owners fixed this house.  
5 They did not do the exposed aggregate technique, they just  
6 threw concrete into the cracks. It's not pretty.

7 So you know as well as I do that 10 Hawthorn  
8 Street is for sale. It is an Arthur Headley house. I drove  
9 there today and got out of my car and walked up to it and  
10 touched it. And you see that they have, I don't know what  
11 you call it painting or what, and nobody was there. And so I  
12 have to -- these are things that could be discovered and you  
13 might know them. That entire house including the chimneys  
14 have been covered with a coating so that the entire house  
15 looks the same. It has paint on it.

16 Jim Keane -- and so these are all of my  
17 problems that I'm looking at. And if you look very close to  
18 this one, I took it because you can see the little hairs of  
19 algae inside, which eats concrete, which makes the rocks fall  
20 out, which makes the holes happen.

21 So Ken Hawthorne fixed that problem and the  
22 sister house of this house on 25 Harwood Lane in East  
23 Rochester. Amazingly similar house, but has also some  
24 characteristics of Ken Hawthorne, they're all looking a  
25 little bit different, but also a lot the same. You know that

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 Arthur Headley built this or designed this.

4

So 25 Harwood Lane also painted itself.

5

There's something on it, I didn't have the nerve to park my car in their driveway and touch it. So anyway, we have got a scoop here that's no small deal. That is my, has been my scoop and my situation with Jim Keane, but it will change.

6

It must change because that original picture of 441 and where it sits, vis-a-vis my house has changed the tension that this house feels from the vibrations of vehicles. And so the cracks and the fissures are actually incrementally bigger and more often. Just saying, okay?

7

And, then, we have the issue of the tile roof. The tile roof is underlayment, but ice and water shield, is completely deteriorated. And you might know some people who have taken off their tile roof and put on their own tiles back, again like the house on the corner, a golf side, a parkway and Landing Road. They sold their house, they cry every day because it's impossible to do as Charles Cook very well knows, is to get all of those old tiles to fit together again in all these different configurations is nigh impossible.

8

If you have a hundred thousands dollars you can fix your roof with new Spanish tiles. You're welcome to

9

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 do it. But the house that Roger Brown told me about that  
4 happens to also be on Hawthorne Street. You haven't looked  
5 at it yet, are you nodding your head you know about it?

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No.

7 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Oh, okay. Is that it  
8 replaced its tile roof with tile roof, with tiles that are  
9 made out of steel.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, no.

11 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Now, so anyway, all I'm  
12 saying and these are the three things that I wrote to you,  
13 that are tremendous stressors on this house that are not  
14 ordinary. They're not ordinary, they're very expensive. And  
15 this house on the lot of 490, I mean you walk down to the  
16 creek, you wave the trucks along. And then you walk along  
17 the side, you can't wave to them now because they don't see  
18 you, but they're very close by on 441. And certainly it's a  
19 corner house of Landing Road. This is a particular  
20 circumstance of this house that probably doesn't play a role  
21 in most of your houses.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's right.

23 ANGELA PICHICHERO: It just needs to be  
24 understood the stress of owning this house.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I logged you for

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 hanging in there and doing what you've done. Unfortunately,  
4 we can't fix the cell tower and we can't fix Landing Road --  
5 and or I mean 441. But you have got -- and when Jim Keane  
6 has retired and that's a problem we're having. A lot of the  
7 craftsmen are at or nearing retirement age. I don't know, we  
8 probably have some other stucco people around, John may know  
9 of some. Certainly there are other roofers around that can  
10 take off the tile.

11 And I'm not sure that part of the problem with  
12 the stucco is that the roof leaked, water got down between  
13 the stucco and the sheathing, and that's what's partially  
14 causing the problem. Because there are, as I recall, pretty  
15 good overhangs on the house and I suspect that that's maybe  
16 what is causing that problem.

17 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So the leaking itself of  
18 the roof, that's the underlayment problem for sure. Because  
19 the leaks, I have an attic, a partially finished attic and so  
20 I have inside floor tarps, about over 50 percent of the  
21 house, the floor. And then in heavy rains I run up there and  
22 see, you know, if I need to move something or to do  
23 something.

24 The stucco are exterior forces that are coming  
25 from the outside. So, so, the settling, the cracks, you saw

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 the lines and it's a deep, deep overhang. Water does not  
4 necessarily really get onto the house -- I mean, rain comes  
5 this way. What happens is, that there are these cracks that  
6 are happening as I described.

7 I mean, oh, I would love to have somebody come  
8 walk around inside and out and learn this house, because what  
9 I am telling you is 40 years worth of living here. Is the  
10 essential deterioration of 110-year application, that has  
11 never had a preservation put on it. It's never been painted.  
12 It's never been varnished, it's never been never as, you  
13 know, in other wood clad homes you can replace it even if  
14 it's historic, you know, there are things you can do, and do  
15 do. Or, you can cover it with something that's a  
16 preservation material.

17 There isn't a preservation material on this  
18 house. There is on 10 Hawthorne and there is on 25 Hardwood  
19 Lane. So these are, it's just these are issues that are  
20 relatively imminent for this house. And so, we just can't  
21 ignore a flashing light here.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John?

23 MR. PAGE: I think that Angie has described  
24 the situation as it is. It's a house that has the condition  
25 that it has irrespective of what we do with it. So, we do

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 have access to knowledge on helping people make decisions  
4 when they are confronted with rehabilitation opportunities or  
5 challenges and at the time that that would come up, you know,  
6 we could participate.

7 So we are not unmindful of specific situations  
8 that relate to specific properties. And this property does  
9 have the two conditions regarding the finishes that Angie  
10 described where you have a special roof and you have a  
11 special material on the siding of the house that is --

12 The other conditions are just bad luck in  
13 terms of the road and the cell tower. The house and the  
14 other houses that she mentioned, you know, are good examples  
15 of the design, acumen of the architect. It's great to hear  
16 that Roger Brown worked on your house. He has had a hand in  
17 a number of historic homes where he has done a very nice, you  
18 know, addition or light touch. He's sort of the man about  
19 town in terms of preservation and community planning. So  
20 he's, I know him very well.

21 Anyway, so I agree with what Jerry said about  
22 how you've cared for the house, how you've stuck it out and  
23 how it's been unfortunate that 441 is such a thoroughfare and  
24 that the cell tower happened to end up there.

25 On the other hand, it's a gorgeous house. The

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 design of the house is gorgeous and Roger Brown did a great  
4 job on it. I think Ken and Jerry, based on what Angie has  
5 told us about her and Roger's opinion about the description  
6 that it would perhaps be appropriate to share this  
7 information with the consultant and attempt to get a  
8 consensus on the description on the style of the house, if  
9 you think that's appropriate, Ken.

10

11 materials and actually Cynthia Howk does mention mission  
12 style.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

30

31

33

22

24

25

Forbes Court Reporting Services, LLC (585) 343-8612

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 and Ms. Eggers Comeau would agree that it is a particularly  
4 good example of a Headley style Italian Renaissance design.  
5 And that is how I would phrase it in the resolution if there  
6 was one that this Commission asked me to put before it.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if I were to drive  
8 by the house Italian Renaissance is probably way down on the  
9 list of what I would call it. It just doesn't make -- and  
10 I'm not an architectural historian by any means, but I think  
11 of the Osborne house in Victor as an Italian Renaissance  
12 house or something like that, but not this house.

13 The other thing that comes to mind if Angie  
14 were to sell the house, I would think she would want some  
15 assurance that the future owners would do what was right with  
16 the house as she has done. And, of course, that's one  
17 protection that historic preservation would give the house.

18 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So I think you are  
19 correct. Because you would, it would attract the person who  
20 wants to participate in this type of life. It's a  
21 commitment, it's a stewardship, let's call it that. They  
22 would want to participate and the continuation I think this  
23 house will be here for another hundred years. There is not  
24 much moving it except trucks right now. But is that, the  
25 duress that the house has, and so, if you could say it's

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 unfortunate and it's bad luck and it's true. It's  
4 unfortunate what the roads have done and it's unfortunate  
5 that the cell tower is here.

6 I am very worried with another level of stress  
7 and duress, that who would chose to continue this? That's my  
8 issue. Would they prefer to continue it on Hawthorne Street  
9 or on Harwood Lane, or on some other designation of some  
10 other place, rather than here.

11 And I don't have a huge investment in this, in  
12 terms of saying, you know, it would be a shame for this  
13 designation to be here. I don't think it would be a shame, I  
14 consider it another stress level for the people who would  
15 continue to live here or who would want to live here.  
16 Because they would have a -- it's going to be expensive.  
17 It's expensive to do this work, that's the bottom line.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it would be  
19 expensive no matter what you did. I mean, it would be  
20 expensive to restucco it, it would be expensive to do  
21 whatever. It's part of the -- we have a slate roof, that's  
22 expensive. It's a part of the deal. And if people -- you're  
23 either going to find one or two types of people. One, people  
24 who want to live in a historic house or people who want to  
25 live in a new build in Pittsford.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3                   So I think it's like having an old car and  
4 people know me, we have several of those. And, yes, you can  
5 buy a new car or you can buy an old car. Well, if you have  
6 an old car you got old car problems. And if you have an old  
7 house you've got old house problems, and part of our mission,  
8 at least I hope it is, is to help those or assist those that  
9 have older homes and making sure they find the right mechanic  
10 or the right people to take care of the house.

11

12                   MR. GOODMAN: Hey, Jerry, I had a quick  
13 comment, if I could. I want to just first off to say it's I  
14 think it's obvious to -- well, certainly obvious to me and  
15 probably everyone else, that there's such a commitment and a  
16 love that Angie has for this home. I can here it, I can hear  
17 the passion, the fact that you have been here for 40 years in  
this home that you've taken such great care of it.

18

19                   That, first of all, that's what preservation  
20 is all about. It's about the human connection and the  
21 responsibility that you feel for this great resource. And  
22 so, for that I just want to say on behalf of the community,  
thank you for continuing to do what you have done.

23

24                   I would also just point that I think that some  
of the repairs, particularly the repair I think that you had  
25 included in a photograph where you showed the previous

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 owners, this is how they repaired it, you know, they put the  
4 goop in. This is how I am repairing it and the repairs that  
5 you're undertaking seem to be just spot on.

6 And to Jerry's point, once we work to  
7 designate this property, if it was going to be designated,  
8 then, yeah, there you go, thanks. So you had mentioned on I  
9 think the far left, right, Angie, about --

10 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes.

11 MR. GOODMAN: And then showing us the  
12 treatments that you used and going and utilizing the best  
13 craftsmen I think that the community can provide for this  
14 amazing resource. And that's what designation would do. I  
15 think moving beyond this year and future years, it really  
16 makes sure that the same type of care that you provided the  
17 home gets carried forward.

18 And I do believe that, you know, we see it all  
19 the time, we see people who feel connected to these  
20 structures, who feel a responsibility toward these  
21 structures, and they understand that it's not a small price  
22 tag. It happens throughout the community all of the time.

23 So that's all I have to say. I wanted to make  
24 the first point to say thank you and it's an amazing  
25 structure, it's a beautiful home.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3                   ANGELA PICHICHERO: Well, thank you, actually  
4 and I appreciate it. And you are right and I'm sure if you  
5 can hear it, is that I do truly love this house.

6

MR. GOODMAN: Right.

7

8                   ANGELA PICHICHERO: And my family loves this  
9 house, comically I didn't include it, but when they left for  
the summer they hugged it, physically. So this is good.

10

11                  What I am worried about is why Hawthorne, Ken  
12 Hawthorne is completely painted and why 25 Harwood is  
13 completely painted? Because there are circumstances where  
14 you want to have the best foot forward. And, you know,  
15 sometimes it's a monetary thing, but even if it isn't a  
monetary thing, it can be a visual thing.

16

17                  What -- is it possible that the person who  
18 wants to continue to be the steward of this house that it  
19 really calls for when you're here in it, would be able to  
make those decisions that are good for it in the future? As  
20 opposed to a committee that decides how and what you should  
21 do.

22

MS. ROBINSON: I don't know what you mean.

23

24                  CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, hopefully the two  
aren't mutually exclusive. I don't know, I mean, painting  
25 stucco or painting brick can have mixed results. Especially

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 if the paint doesn't breathe, that probably would compound  
4 issues. Would it fill in some cracks or maybe prevent  
5 some -- I don't know. I would have reservations about that.  
6 I don't know.

7

John, what do you think?

8

9 MR. PAGE: Well, each house, and each system  
10 has it's own needs. There's different ways to approach it  
11 and it isn't something that we would have an answer for now.  
12 It was something that would have to be considered as  
13 different options based on what your goals are.

14

15 And so, I can't say that painting it is the  
16 right answer. I can't say that painting it is the wrong  
17 answer. It's something that would be evaluated when it was  
18 desired to make a decision about it and it would be  
19 investigated at that time.

20

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I can pretty much assure  
22 you we would not approve putting vinyl siding over it.  
23 Believe it or not, what just happened to a Tudor on Highland  
24 Avenue, between East Avenue and 590. You'll see a Tudor  
25 there with vinyl siding and it's --

26

27 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yeah, you know, there are  
28 sad stories, there are sad stories, and so far truly in the  
29 history of this house, and you feel it when you walk in the

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 door, that this house has been loved. And it loves you back,  
4 it really does give a lot.

5 And, and I would just, I have this worry that,  
6 that if it feels mandated, that as we've seen in some houses,  
7 then nothing gets done.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I don't think we  
9 would mandate that nothing gets done. I think if there was a  
10 particular issue that came up, we would look at it and  
11 hopefully if we don't know we would research it to the point  
12 where we would know.

13 I think that the biggest mandate is to do no  
14 harm. So we have to be very careful about what we say yes  
15 and no about, because in the long run, it might look like a  
16 good idea to start with, but in the end run if it is harmful  
17 to the house then it's not a good idea.

18 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No harm is I think a good  
20 mantra.

21 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes. So I, you know, I  
22 put forth and, you know, I appreciate having this time to  
23 tell you the important things that I think and the important  
24 things that the house has spoken.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if I could reach

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 throughout the Zoom thing and pin a gold star on your  
4 sweater, I would do it. I can't say enough about your  
5 fortitude and your perseverance in taking care of this  
6 special house.

7

8 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Well, thank you. And then  
9 I would ask if there is anything else on the table that I can  
contribute to?

10

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I'm fine, thank  
12 you. You contributed far more than we expected and I thank  
13 you for that. That's not a derogatory thing at all. I  
14 really appreciate your taking the time, A, to put it in  
15 writing. And also, B, putting -- or coming here -- or coming  
16 there and putting it, spending your time explaining  
everything. We appreciate it.

17

18 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes, thank you, thank you  
19 for saying it, but as you know, because you do this, it's  
20 very important. It's hugely important, and so I don't think  
21 it should be done lightly. I don't think that it should be  
22 done rubber stampy. I think it deserves a serious  
consideration.

23

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I agree, I agree.  
25 And I don't think anyone here takes their duties lightly. We  
all try to spend as much time as possible and we're here if

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 you need us.

4

5 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So, great. I think, fine,  
6 and if anybody is inclined, and probably many of you are  
7 inclined to drop by here, because everybody does. Seriously,  
8 ask yourself that somebody who has the wherewithal and the  
time and the energy, would they chose this house?

9

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I think that  
11 applies to pretty much any historic house. I mean, everybody  
12 says location and that's certainly one thing, but that would  
apply to any house that was there.

13

14 So, and we have to drive slowly because of the  
15 speed bumps, so we will cruise by it. I used to live on  
16 North Landing Road, so I will go by it again, and again, and  
if you are out in the yard we will stop.

17

18 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So, you know, so, good.  
19 Thank you for giving me this opportunity. I don't know  
20 whether it's a necessary given to have this platform to  
21 explain, so I appreciate that. And I'm very, very happy to  
22 speak again to Cynthia Howk for example, because Roger  
23 Brown -- and I think Roger Brown would like to speak to  
24 Cynthia Howk and have a clarification as we go forward in any  
25 permanent description of this house so that it isn't a jaw  
dropper in your sense, it should make sense.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I hear you.

4

ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay, so, thank you.

5

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

6

Okay. Comments anyone? Nobody?

7

8

MS. DREHER: Do we need to put the -- I'm just  
wondering, Amanda Dreher, do we need to put the matter over  
to allow for a possible amendment to the application?

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

wondering, Amanda Dreher, do we need to put the matter over  
to allow for a possible amendment to the application?  
Because the application Mary Jo submitted does state  
architectural style or period, Italian Renaissance. So I  
think perhaps we need to -- the matter needs to be adjourned  
until next time to make clarification of that.

But otherwise, I support the application. I  
think the house falls within the category as Mary Jo  
described. And it is a wonderful house, and I think by  
designating it we will ensure that every future owner takes  
the same care and time with the house with our support and  
help as needed over the years, as has been done by Angie.

MR. GOODMAN: And, Jerry, I would support if  
we needed to, I would certainly as Amanda suggested, I would  
support if we needed to table this to look at the  
definition --

MR. GORDON: Could I just step in here on a  
procedural matter please? I have been sort of waiting to

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 jump in, but maybe I waited too long. So let's talk about  
4 where we are procedurally folks. Right now we're in the  
5 middle of a Public Hearing. We're not discussing a  
6 resolution, no resolution has been put forth before this  
7 Commission. No motion has been made, no motion's been  
8 seconded. We're in the middle of a Public Hearing.

9

10 As a matter of this Public Hearing, certainly  
11 this Commission could keep the Public Hearing open until its  
12 next meeting. This Commission does not need to make any  
13 decision or have any resolution decided tonight. There's no  
14 requirement or time limit with the code that says you have to  
have a decision made.

15

16 You could close the Public Hearing, but for a  
17 additional submission by Katie Eggers Comeau, to clarify the  
style of the house. You can leave it open in that way or you  
18 could leave it generally open and take the matter up.

19

20 There's no reason to table anything, tabling  
something would be if there was a motion or resolution before  
21 the body, which there is not. So since we are in the middle  
22 of the Public Hearing, it would be really the Chair's  
23 prerogative to leave the Public Hearing open, or to close the  
24 Public Hearing with submission of a clarification memo from  
Katie Eggers Comeau. Relative to the style, the

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 architectural style of this home.

4

5 I leave that to you to discuss and then decide

6

what you want to do with the Public Hearing.

7

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I would suggest the  
9 latter that we clarify -- we close the Public Hearing with  
10 the exception of clarification by Katie as to the style of  
the house. I don't know, how do, John, how do you feel? How

does everyone else feel on that one, please.

11

12 MR. PAGE: Yeah, I would like to close the

Public Hearing and move on to seeking a clarification.

13

MR. WHITAKER: I agree.

14

MS. DREHER: I agree.

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diana? You're muted.

16

17 MS. ROBINSON: I agree. I'm just choking, I

turned my mute off.

18

19 MR. GOODMAN: That's fine with me. I guess  
one point I was just going to make is, when I look at this  
20 house and I guess I can actually, maybe I'm the odd ball out,  
21 I can actually see a little bit of the Italian Renaissance  
22 style in this.

23

MR. PAGE: It's there.

24

25 MR. GOODMAN: It is. And I can see where a  
definition is used. It's certainly a unique style. It's

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 unique I'm sure to the architect which is one of the reasons  
4 it's so incredibly, I think, significant. But certainly, I  
5 see a lot of mission hanging around that style too. So I'm  
6 certainly not opposed to getting clarification on that and  
7 revising it.

8 MR. GORDON: Ramsey, I think you have a chat  
9 to check. And the only other comment I was going to make was  
10 there's absolutely no problem with keeping this matter on the  
11 agenda for your next meeting, and then you could take this  
12 matter up -- no need to table it, as I said there's nothing  
13 that has been moved -- we could take it up as a matter of old  
14 business at the next meeting to make a decision. So that is  
15 what I think would be procedurally what we would do.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Would you like a motion  
17 to that effect?

18 MR. GORDON: No, I think it's the Chair's  
19 prerogative to simply declare that the Public Hearing is  
20 closed, except for the submission of a memo of clarification  
21 from Katie Eggers Comeau with respect to the architectural  
22 style of this home.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Then I suggest that's  
24 what we do.

25 MR. PAGE: Okay.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

4 MR. WHITAKER: Thank you very much for the  
5 presentation.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, yes, thank you,  
7 Angie.

8 ANGELA PICHICHERO: You're welcome. And thank  
9 you for the opportunity, and so I'm going to cut out. I'm --

10 MR. GORDON: Right. We will not be taking  
11 action tonight.

12 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay, thank you.

13 MR. PAGE: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We have no certificates  
15 of appropriateness, no hardship applications, Public Hearings  
16 are closed.

17 New business, any new business?

18 Old business, 909 North Landing Road. We had  
19 some clarification on that, Mary Jo, I think. That there are  
20 basically the original school house, then there was the  
21 addition, and also the -- Parish residents, and do we want to  
22 proceed with that? Have we sent a letter?

23 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, we did send a letter, met  
24 with representatives of the church today via Zoom. Got a  
25 bunch of questions about issues of maintenance, landscaping,

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 their roof, replacement of a window. I'm just trying to  
4 understand how the process works. They also were thinking  
5 about maybe selling off the home, and wanted to know if  
6 designation would impact that. The report does say that the  
7 home is not a distinguishing feature of the property.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

9 MR. BOEHNER: But if you subdivide it you  
10 would be altering the property. So there's a number of  
11 things they brought up. They do have to go back to their  
12 congregation and the larger congregation in the Rochester  
13 area just to get approval. They have no position at this  
14 time because they were not in a position to say they support  
15 the application or not. But they will be talking about it  
16 and following back up with us.

17 So we are in a position if you did want to  
18 schedule this for a Public Hearing, we could do that for the  
19 October meeting, if you like. I don't see a reason why not.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

21 MS. LANPHEAR: I did tell them about the  
22 sacred sites program of the New York Landmarks Conservancy  
23 and that was another thing that might be helpful to them.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Have you met with them,  
25 Mary Jo?

2

3

MS. LANPHEAR: We met today, Ramsey and I  
met --

5

6

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, you were a part of  
that meeting. Great.

7

8

9

10

11

12

MS. DREHER: Did it seem like they would have  
enough time to go through the channels they were talking  
about to get feedback? Is a month going to be enough time  
for them if we set the Public Hearing for next month? I  
wouldn't want to prevent them from doing their due diligence  
and they need to talk to with the congregation?

13

14

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it's common for  
people to ask for an extension whenever we put something on  
the agenda.

16

17

MS. DREHER: Okay. So if they need it they  
will ask for it?

18

19

20

MR. BOEHNER: And with our policies of adopted  
by the Commission, I do have that authority to grant those  
adjournments once for reason, if it pops up.

21

MS. DREHER: Okay.

22

23

24

25

MR. BOEHNER: I did tell them, Amanda, that it  
is the next step would could be that the Board could schedule  
the Public Hearing for the October meeting. I did say that  
to them. I did explain to them that it was if you felt that

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 the property was worthy of designation, it was really your  
4 obligation as a Commission to designate it. We understand  
5 the powers that you have.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Maybe we should go ahead  
7 and set the Public Hearing, and then if there's a reason to  
8 postpone it for a month, we can do it, otherwise we can move  
9 ahead.

10 MR. BOEHNER: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What do you think about  
12 that?

13 MS. DREHER: Sounds good.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John, David, okay.

15 MS. ROBINSON: Sounds good.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do you want to call a  
17 vote on that, Ramsey?

18 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, let me just write a note.

19 This is to schedule a Public Hearing to consider designation.

20 Did I have a motion on that?

21 MS. DREHER: I will move.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second.

23 MR. WHITAKER: Second.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: David seconds.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020  
2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

5 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

6 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

7 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

8 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

9 MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

10 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

11 MR. PAGE: Yes.

12 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

13 MS. DREHER: Yes.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes. We will get the  
15 item scheduled for the October meeting.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: At one time on 1037 South  
17 Winton, Bill, I think was going to speak with someone of the  
18 congregation. I don't know if that has happened or not. Do  
19 you know, Ramsey?

20 MR. BOEHNER: Last time I talked to him it had  
21 not, and I don't think it's happened since because they are  
22 in the holidays.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. I guess I would  
24 like to have --

25 MR. BOEHNER: And there was something else I

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 wanted to talk with him about and he just said right now is  
4 not the time to go be talking to them. That is the latest, I  
5 did bring it up to him again.

6

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. I would --

7

MR. BOEHNER: Ken, do you have any update on  
8 that by any chance?

9

MR. GORDON: No. I have the same knowledge  
10 you do. What I might suggest, Ramsey, is maybe make a note  
11 for yourself to bring it up at one of your Friday meetings.  
12 Maybe not this Friday as it is the Friday before Yom Kippur  
13 but maybe the following Friday.

14

MR. BOEHNER: I think you're right. I think  
15 if I brought it up again he would wonder if I'm not hearing  
16 him, I brought it up last Friday.

17

MR. GORDON: I can pester the man like a  
18 champ.

19

MR. BOEHNER: Oh, I'm good at pestering him,  
20 I'm just saying I will pass this Friday and I'm going to put  
21 it on for a Friday a couple weeks down the road. I have to  
22 be careful in using my pestering to a minimum.

23

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I suggest we hold off on  
24 that until Bill's had a chance to --

25

MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 MR. GORDON: He has a lot going on and a lot  
4 of his attention has been focused the last month, not just on  
5 COVID, but the budget. And that's been a huge burden on him  
6 and they finally pulled together a budget that will work, as  
7 ugly as it is. But so, yes, it's not -- I don't think he is  
8 disinterested, I don't think that it's that he doesn't see  
9 the importance of this matter, I think it's just there are  
10 other things that have been in the way.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, that's fine.

12 Any other old business?

13 May I have a motion to adjourn?

14 MS. ROBINSON: I move to adjourn.

15 MR. GOODMAN: I will second.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

17 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

18 \* \* \*

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3 REPORTER CERTIFICATE  
45 I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did  
6 report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in  
7 the above-entitled matter;8 Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and  
9 accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at  
10 the time and place hereinbefore set forth.11  
12 Dated this 20th day of October, 2020.13 At Rochester, New York  
14  
1516 Rhoda Collins  
17 Rhoda Collins  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25