

B R I G H T O N
H I S T O R I C
P R E S E R V A T I O N
C O M M I S S I O N

October 28th, 2021

At approximately 7:15 p.m.
Brighton Town Hall
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON

JUSTIN DELVECCHIO)
AMANDA L. DREHER)
WAYNE GOODMAN)
JOHN PAGE)
DIANA ROBINSON)
DAVID WHITAKER)

BOARD MEMBERS

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
Town Planner

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'd like to call the
4 meeting to order. Mr. Secretary, will you call the roll
5 please?

6

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

8

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio?

9

MR. DELVECCHIO: Here.

10

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

11

MR. GOODMAN: Here.

12

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

13

MS. DREHER: Here.

14

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

15

MR. PAGE: Yes.

16

MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Robinson and Whitaker.

17

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ramsey.

18

May I have motion to approve the agenda?

19

MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion, John Page.

20

MR. DELVECCHIO: Second, Justin.

21

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

22

ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

23

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Approval of the minutes.

24

I have a few. Amanda, you probably do too.

25

MS. DREHER: I have a few.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 MR. BOEHNER: What's it say, Jerry?

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I didn't print them out.

5 Page 22, Line 9.

6 MS. LANPHEAR: Fader, F-A-D-E-R.

7 MR. GORDON: Let me see, so it was the
8 discussion, during the discussion of the gas station on East
9 Avenue and Lou was talking. Did he have somebody with him?10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: He did, but I don't
11 think --12 MS. DREHER: He did have somebody with him,
13 was it the seller?14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah, but I don't think
15 the seller said anything.

16 MR. PAGE: He might have had a one liner.

17 MR. GORDON: He might have had this one line.

18 MS. DREHER: When I saw it, that's what I
19 thought that.

20 MR. GORDON: My guess is it's who that is.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Very good.

22 And then, Page 26, Line 15, I think it should
23 be quickly, L-Y, not L-E-E.

24 MR. BOEHNER: I think that's how it's spelled.

25 MR. GORDON: It is, L-E-E.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I know, but it says,
4 going to do it quickly.

5 MR. BOEHNER: I was thinking Quickele's.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And then, Page 30,
7 Line 20, should be arena not marina.

8 Any other additions or corrections?

9 Motion to approve.

10 MS. DREHER: I will move.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. All in favor?

12 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

14 Was this meeting duly advertised?

15 MR. BOEHNER: Yes. It was properly advertised
16 in the Daily Record of October 14, 2021.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. That meeting
18 as duly advertised will now be held.

19 We have no communications, no designation of
20 landmarks. We do have two certificates of appropriateness
21 APPLICATION 10H-01-21.

22 10H-01-21 Application of Trinity Reformed
23 Church, owner of property at 909 North Landing Road, tax
24 number 123.17-1-44, for a Certificate of Appropriateness to
25 replace the aging existing sign with a new sign. All as

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 described on application and documents on file.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone here to
5 speak on that? Would you come up please and state your name.
6 Take down your mask so we can hear you.7 CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Yes. My name is Chuck
8 DiPiazza, D-I-P-I-A-Z-Z-A, I'm a deacon at Trinity Reformed
9 Church.10 Our current sign has been repaired at least
11 two or three times, to the point it's deteriorating and it
12 can't be repaired anymore.13 So anyways, you know, we thought we'd take on
14 a new sign in replacement of it, and we talked to Joe over at
15 Turning Point Signs in Fairport, whose done a lot of signs in
16 the Fairport area and I think the Brighton area as well, all
17 of the towns and schools are using him.18 And anyways, he came up with a design which I
19 think we shared with you, and it kind of mimics the church
20 itself the way it's got the peak, okay? And the rooster that
21 sits up on our -- there as well, and we've done all of the
22 things required, we took away the web page and we checked and
23 we had 33.5 percent of the sign itself is, you know, the
24 logo. We have the Reformed Church of America logo plus the
25 rooster, you know, so I think we've --

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

4

5 MR. BOEHNER: I can say that the sign does
6 meet code, been reviewed by the Planning Board and
7 recommended approval as presented. I don't know if that
helps this Board at all.

8

9 MR. GORDON: Subject to the review of the

conditions of this Board.

10

MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

11

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any questions?

12

13 MR. PAGE: The sign looks good. I thank you
for that presentation.

14

MR. GOODMAN: It's a good design, thank you.

15

CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Do we get funding?

16

MR. BOEHNER: No, nice try.

17

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do we get an invitation
to the strawberry social?

19

20 CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Hopefully we will get that
back next year, you know, it's been -- I'm hoping.

21

22 We miss doing that and we missed a couple
things this year. We did have the chicken barbecue and it's
23 the kind of things that we are hoping to get back once things
24 settle down some, so.

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If there are no

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 questions, Ken, do you have a motion?

4 MR. BOEHNER: You just have to ask if anyone
5 would like to speak.6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone in the
7 audience who wants to speak? Okay.8 MR. GORDON: So, you're closing this Public
9 Hearing?10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I am closing the Public
11 Hearing.12 MR. GORDON: Then, I will propose the
13 following resolution.14 Whereas, Application Number 10H-01-21 has been
15 submitted for a Certificate of Appropriateness under the
16 Town's Historic Preservation Law for improvement to property
17 located at 909 Landing Road North, owned by Trinity Reformed
18 Church to perform work described as the replacement of an
19 existing sign with a new sign.20 And whereas, the Historic Preservation
21 Commission duly called a Public Hearing to consider the
22 matter on October 28, 2021.23 And whereas, the necessary legal notice has
24 been published and the required sign posted pursuant to Town
25 Code.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

6 And whereas, the Historic Preservation
7 Commission hereby determines that pursuant to the factors set
8 forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code, that the proposed
9 above described work to the subject property is consistent
10 with the purposes of the Town's Historic Preservation Law and
11 compatible with the property's historic character based upon
12 its review of the application and documents on file and
13 received at the Public Hearing and the testimony presented at
14 the Public Hearing, it is hereby resolved that the Historic
15 Preservation Commission hereby receives and files the above
16 described application.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 that are on file.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. Someone
5 please put forth the motion.

6 MR. GOODMAN: Jerry, I'll make that motion.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Wayne.

8 MR. PAGE: I will second.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, John.

10 Ramsey.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

12 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio?

14 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

15 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

17 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

18 MR. PAGE: Yes.

19 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

20 MS. DREHER: Yes.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

23 You're all set.

24 CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you for coming too.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 Okay, the next application.

4 APPLICATION 10H-02-21

5 10-H-02-21 Application of Amanda and Michael
6 Dreher, owners of property at 1300 French Road, tax number
7 150.09-1-8, for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct
8 a detached garage and other renovations. All as described on
9 application and documents on file.

10 MR. BOEHNER: For the record, I want it to say
11 that this application of Member Dreher is being presented by
12 her. She will not be participating in the review of this
13 application. She will not be procedurally making any
14 decisions on this application. I just want to put that on
15 the record.

16 Ken, is there anything else?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Folks, you can take your
18 masks down please, and for the record please state your
19 names.

20 AMANDA DREHER: Amanda Dreher.

21 MICHAEL DREHER: Michael Dreher.

22 AMANDA DREHER: Okay. So, multipart project
23 here. We will just take it one element at a time.

24 The first is the three-car garage. Building
25 that, we currently do not have a garage. The goal was to

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 have it resemble an outbuilding or a barn that may have been
4 on the property at the time. It's placed about 12 feet from
5 the house. And three-car, a reasonable size for today. We
6 have two cars and lots of toys and yard things for our
7 family.

8 Any questions, or should I just keep going?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Keep going please.

10 AMANDA DREHER: All right. The second piece
11 would be the driveway and parking area. We currently have a
12 circular driveway that goes behind the house, with the length
13 of it being gravel and asphalt, older asphalt in the back.

14 We went through many variations with our
15 landscape architect as to where we could place the garage,
16 close enough to the house so it's functional, but allowing us
17 to preserve that driveway, circular driveway. There just
18 wasn't a good option, so we made the decision to use one side
19 of the driveway. We're going to pave that and there's a
20 parking area in front of the garage allowing for guests and
21 sufficient turnaround for our cars so that we can always be
22 heading out onto French Road. It's not a road that you want
23 to back out onto.

24 The other side of the driveway for the time
25 being we're going to leave it as gravel and leave the curb

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 cut. We're going to live with the one, using the one side of
4 the driveway for a year or two. It is a little bit more
5 difficult to plow that side, I think we might have to trim a
6 few branches, it will be easier.

7 But, if we feel like we do not like pulling
8 out of that side, we really are missing the element of having
9 the circular drive, we do have an alternative plan to put a
10 circular drive in front of the house. Now, that's not part
11 of the application, but it is an option that we talked about
12 with the landscape architect. So, we are going to leave the
13 curb cut for now, and give ourselves a year or two to make
14 sure that we're really satisfied with the one driveway before
15 we, you know, regrade and put grass over the other side of
16 the driveway. But, for now, it will remain gravel.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's easier to leave it
18 than ask for another one.

19 AMANDA DREHER: Yes, that is what I have been
20 advised. And we really believe this will be the ideal
21 situation. We won't have any trouble using the one side, but
22 we do have the other curb cut so we want to live with it and
23 make sure that it's the right, the best option for us.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah. If you abandon that
25 access portion now, you might not get it back very easily, so

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 way up to the back of the house, as you can see in the
4 photos, which, is not attractive or desirable effects at all.
5 So, the pavers will have a walkway up to the house.

6 And, the next piece being the back entrance
7 and the mud room. We believe the mud room was really
8 renovated in the late 70s when the prior owner took ownership
9 of the house. It's got, you know, casement windows, aluminum
10 awning, I don't know, late-mid century something to that
11 effect. Not really within character of the rest of the
12 house.

13 So, our mud room also doesn't have a great
14 configuration for a family. We'd like to get some more space
15 for a bench and sitting down and putting on shoes, and also,
16 we need some sort of utility closet in that area.

17 So, in doing this we decided to redo the back
18 entrance to make it more in line with the character of the
19 house and overall more useful for us. So, we're doing double
20 hung windows on either side of the door, and adding a
21 overhang, a simple overhang over the door rather than the
22 large metal aluminum overhang, with just a hung light. That
23 would better reflect the historic character of the home, but
24 also we are putting -- opting to put a metal roof on the
25 overhang as a nod to the effect that it isn't a modern

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 addition. That was one of the design choices that was
4 suggested and we agree it's a good look. But, we are eager
5 to hear your feedback on that, if there's any feedback.

6 And, the next piece we have two steel exterior
7 doors on the south side of the house replaced again some time
8 in the 70s era we believe. They are somewhat deteriorating,
9 they are unattractive inside and out, and there's a lot of
10 air gaps and some safety concerns -- some security concerns,
11 I'm sorry.

12 So, we thought we would take the opportunity
13 while purchasing windows and doors and whatnot to replace
14 those doors. So, they are not protected in any way, we do
15 not want to put storm doors on them. One of them is used
16 frequently, well, somewhat frequently, the other goes into
17 our basement.

18 So, we are opting for the fiberglass, wood
19 grain look to have a nod to the -- what originally were wood
20 doors facing there, but also to be appropriate for the
21 weather that they will certainly be affected by.

22 And there is in front of the door that we do
23 use on the side of the house to get out to that side, there's
24 actually no pad or any landing whatsoever, it just goes right
25 onto the grass. There's maybe like a small piece of old

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 concrete, maybe like a foot by a very small --

4 MICHAEL DREHER: Like eight inches around it
5 in deteriorated cracks in concrete.6 AMANDA DREHER: Yeah. So you're really
7 stepping right out onto the dirt. So, we will have a, you
8 know, there will be a truck pouring for the garage, we'd like
9 to just pour a simple concrete pad at the time.10 And the last piece is the pond. As you can
11 see on your site plan, we'd like to fill the pond. It --
12 research of the architectural historian who did the survey
13 for our house, discovered that it was -- it did not exist
14 prior to 1970 from some aerial photos. So, it was a modern
15 creation, not a livestock pond as we originally thought.16 So, I think that it was just put in as a water
17 feature. And when we bought the property there wasn't a
18 fountain in there, however in recent years it empties out for
19 more than three quarters of a year. It's mud, it's
20 overgrown, and it doesn't seem to be serving a purpose. And,
21 we do have small children, so when there is water in there,
22 of course, there's a safety concern. It just doesn't really
23 function as a part of our yard right now. So, we think that
24 best long term option is to fill it in. And, we're going to
25 start doing that with the fill from the excavation from the

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 garage and the patio.

4 There's also an old fence partially falling
5 down adjacent to the stone barn. We'd just like to remove
6 the rest of it, and no further plans at this time to disturb
7 that area, but as you can see in the site plan, we have some
8 great ideas in the future as to, you know, how to make those
9 areas look their best, but nothing else in the future, only
10 removing what's remaining.

11 And I will note that we are -- we do have an
12 application in to the Zoning Board for two variances for the
13 height of the garage and for the size of the garage for about
14 20 feet. The maximum is 16 per code and we are a little over
15 900 square feet, 960 square feet, for the size and the
16 maximum is 600. So, they will hear our application on those
17 variances next week and asked us to come here first.

18 And we are also -- we also have technically
19 two lots, two parcels, two tax numbers. We have a small
20 parcel in the front, on the front of French Road is a quarter
21 of an acre. And however, when we build the garage, where
22 it's currently placed, it is within five feet of that lot
23 line. So, it's a little late in the game that we made this
24 realization, it's that second parcel is very easy to forget
25 about, when you're focussing on all of -- on everything else.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 So, I did speak with Rick, who's last name has
4 escaped me.

5 MR. BOEHNER: DiStefano.

6 AMANDA DREHER: Yeah, DiStefano. Several
7 times, and we determined that the best thing, rather than
8 applying for a variance, a third variance, it made more sense
9 to just combine the parcels. So, this application is being
10 made with the note that we will be -- our surveyor is
11 currently working on an updated survey, and redoing the
12 application to combine the lots. And the smaller lot is not
13 buildable, it's below the maximum requirements. So, we don't
14 anticipate any issues with that and that should be done well
15 before the garage is built. We are aiming to build, not
16 until May. Okay.17 MR. BOEHNER: The resubdivision of the two
18 lots, is something that's just done administratively. And
19 that land would not be covered by it's designation, just by
20 the subdivisions. It's just being able to combine them, so I
21 think we probably told you that.22 AMANDA DREHER: Yes. I think it's just a
23 holdover from --24 MR. BOEHNER: No, no, you're right. That's
25 what I would do to. Don't get rid of the curb cut, and put

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 those two lots together, because you're just going to be a
4 little bit more on it.5 AMANDA DREHER: Yeah. But, talking to Rick,
6 he said, you know, they have at times the Zoning Board has
7 denied those variance requests because there is another
8 alternative, which they believe is preferred, and that's to
9 combine the lots. And in this case, it did not make any
10 difference to us, other than, you know, an extra two grand to
11 our surveyor. So, we will combine those.12 MR. PAGE: Nice presentation. Just note, one
13 of my notes, you've been in already to go over this a few
14 times and let us know what your planning or thinking, so I
15 think that, for me, I have already worked out the good
16 planning that you are doing with your design team, and this
17 is an excellent package that's been put together, very
18 thorough. Maybe just as thorough as we ever get. And I
19 applaud everything that you are planning to do. Thank you.20 AMANDA DREHER: I will also note that our
21 architect is here today, Jennifer Takatch, if you have any
22 questions she is available also.23 MR. BOEHNER: It's good that you did a master
24 plan for your property. Because, now you know what you want
25 to do, and now you're going to start learning what it takes.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 I know how hard it is, it's a long process,
4 but it's going to be beautiful, it really is. It's very
5 nicely done.6 AMANDA DREHER: We are very excited. And you
7 can see in the photos, all the children's set is stacked up
8 next to the door.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, but I like that look.

10 AMANDA DREHER: And it's spread around. It
11 will be nice to have a garage to store things in, to get out
12 of the rain, to have a patio. We have a beautiful piece of
13 property, that we cannot really sit down and enjoy because we
14 don't have a great spot for it. So, I think it's really
15 going to contribute to our quality of life there and we plan
16 to say for a very long time.17 MICHAEL DREHER: I'm just excited about not
18 bringing the bicycles up and down the old fieldstone stairs
19 in the basement.20 AMANDA DREHER: It's difficult to store things
21 in our basement.22 MR. GORDON: So, I just want to point out a
23 procedural bit of information for the Board tonight. Most
24 times when we see a Certificate of Appropriateness
25 application, your viewing it, as you should with this one as

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 well, it simply being a decision as to whether the work, the
4 improvements, are consistent with the historic character of
5 the property. And then, that determination often goes to
6 another Board resulting in them making a final determination
7 on the overall project, for example, the Planning Board.

8 This project, and that's why I ran over and
9 quickly chatted with Ramsey, this project is not going to the
10 Planning Board. This project is going to be some ZBA
11 reviews, some Zoning Board of Appeals reviews, but they're
12 really only looking at some very specific variance issues.

13 So, in terms of the review that you are
14 undertaking, I want the Board to understand that you're
15 really the ones who are looking at, if you will, the entire
16 site modifications and the site plan, if you will, to the
17 extent this is your site plan, to determine whether all of
18 these modifications are consistent with the historic
19 character of the property. So, I just wanted to put that
20 sort of in front of you just so you were aware of that.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ken.

22 Any comments, questions? Did everyone have a
23 chance to see the windows and doors and study those?

24 And, we don't dictate paint colors, but one
25 thing I hope is that if you do put in new doors and they have

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 a plastic frame around the -- or, yeah, probably plastic
4 around where the window or lights would go, that you paint
5 that the same color as the door.

6 Nothing screams metal door like leaving a
7 white vinyl there which eventually will turn yellow, given
8 enough chance.

9 AMANDA DREHER: I believe the doors already --
10 are you talking about the color of --

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, I'm just talking
12 about that, this, the type of door that you're getting.

13 AMANDA DREHER: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I just would suggest that
15 you paint the frame around the windows in the same color of
16 the door.

17 AMANDA DREHER: It comes that way.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great.

19 AMANDA DREHER: It will all be in that wood
20 grain, the medium dark color, yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great. It looks great.

22 MR. BOEHNER: It really does.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks wonderful.

24 Well, I mean, one of the best presentations we
25 have seen.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 AMANDA DREHER: Well, thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any questions, comments?

5 MR. PAGE: One thing I've seen is this packet
6 of information is thorough, so when we are looking at what
7 you were doing, it made it kind of easy.8 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, there's not a lot to pull
9 out.10 MICHAEL DREHER: We were talking about how
11 much fun Mr. Gordon was going to have.12 AMANDA DREHER: I did include that material
13 list because I had to make that for myself because there were
14 so many materials, so many places I was looking at things and
15 one place had one thing, and another place had another thing.
16 And so, I made that for myself and then realized it was a
17 neat summary to provide to you as well, and my contractor
18 appreciated it as well.19 MR. GOODMAN: On the specifics, the specifics
20 of the project are really well done. The different
21 components of the project come together quite well.22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The landscape plan helps
23 out a lot.24 MR. GOODMAN: Yeah, it really does, so, thank
25 you.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 AMANDA DREHER: And that's really how we
4 started because we knew the garage was going to affect
5 everything else, the way we would use the yard and the
6 driveway.7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any questions? Anyone
8 from the audience to speak?

9 I'd like to close the Public Hearings.

10 Ken, do you have a motion?

11 MR. GORDON: Yes, I will shortly.

12 Whereas, Application Number 10H-02-21 has been
13 submitted for a Certificate of Appropriateness under the
14 Town's Historic Preservation Law for improvement to property
15 located at 1300 French Road owned by Amanda and Michal
16 Dreher, to perform work described as, number one,
17 construction of a detached three-car garage to the southeast
18 of the house.19 Number two, creation of an asphalt parking,
20 turnaround area south of the garage.21 Number three, removal of the asphalt parking
22 area behind and to the east of the house, and the addition of
23 a concrete paver patio.24 Number four, the renovation of the back
25 entrance to the house and mud room, including the removal of

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 an aluminum awning and the casement windows, and installation
4 of a new wood door, and the addition of a new overhang with
5 double-hung windows on each side of the door.

6 Number five, the replacement of steel exterior
7 doors on the south side of the house with fiberglass wood
8 grain doors, and the addition of a concrete pad outside the
9 door farthest to the east.

10 And number six, the filling in of a pond
11 northeast of the house and removal of the deck at the east
12 end of the pond, and the removal of a board fence at the
13 northeast corner of the stone barn.

14 And whereas, the Historic Preservation
15 Commission duly called a Public Hearing to consider the
16 matter on October 28, 2021.

17 And whereas, the necessary legal notice was
18 published and the required sign posted pursuant to Town Code.

19 And whereas, the Public Hearing was held and
20 all persons having an interest in such matter and having had
21 an opportunity to be heard therein.

22 And whereas, the Historic Preservation
23 Commission hereby determines pursuant to the factors set
24 forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code that the proposed
25 above described work to the subject property is consistent

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 with the purposes of the Town's Historic Preservation Law and
4 compatible with the property's historic character.

5

6 Based upon its review of the application and
7 documents on file, and received at the Public Hearing, and
8 the testimony presented at the Public Hearing, it is hereby
9 resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby
receives and files the above described application.

10

11 And, it is further resolved that the Historic
12 Preservation Commission hereby approves Application Number
13 10H-02-21 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the above
14 described work to be performed at the property located at
15 1300 French Road, subject to the condition that the above
16 described work be completed within one year from the date of
approval.

17

18 And further subject to the condition that the
19 work to be performed be compatible with the detailed plans on
file with the Board.

20

21 And, be it further resolved that pursuant to
22 Chapter 224 of the Town Code, the above described work
23 qualifies for the exemptions set forth in New York Real
Property Tax Law Section 444-A.

24

MR. PAGE: I would make that motion.

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just a second, did you

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 put a time frame on that?

4 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, one year.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think, given the
6 current state of affairs -- well, I guess you can't.7 AMANDA DREHER: We can come back for an
8 extension.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

10 MR. GORDON: You would want to do that before
11 the one year was up, obviously.12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah, okay. Just a heads
13 up on that, very good.

14 MR. PAGE: I still make that motion.

15 MR. DELVECCHIO: I will second.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Member Ludwig?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio?

19 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

20 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

21 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

22 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

23 MR. PAGE: Yes.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Motion carries.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Carry on.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 Okay. No hardship applications, Public
4 Hearings are now closed. New business, we have a demolition
5 review of two properties at the corner of Monroe and Elmwood
6 Avenue.7 MR. BOEHNER: We did send you documentation on
8 that building. What they're planning to do, just a little
9 background, to both of the buildings if we can talk about
10 1966 Monroe Avenue at the same time. They're planning to
11 tear down those buildings, subdivide them and build what is a
12 Quicklee's, similar to what they wanted to do on East Avenue,
13 same people.14 MR. GORDON: Same people, very different
15 project.16 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, it's more of a commercial
17 -- yeah, a totally different project. So, that's what's
18 leading to the demolition of these buildings, is that you
19 guys need to review it and determine if you think it has any
20 historical significance. If you don't think it does, then
21 you can direct me to inform the Planning Board of your
22 findings, which I would be glad to do. I think we have sent
23 you the pictures. My opinion, there's not much there.24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Other than we're losing
25 another service station.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 MR. GORDON: To put a slightly sharper point
4 on what Ramsey just said, it's not whether these buildings
5 have any historical significance, it's: Are you interested
6 in designating these buildings as landmarks?7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No. Unfortunately, no,
8 we're not. Well, I'm not. So, a yes vote.9 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, we're going to do a motion
10 for each one, if we could, to direct me to send a letter
11 notifying the Planning Board.12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So, a yes vote will
13 indicate that you can send that --

14 MR. BOEHNER: That is correct.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: -- a letter.

16 MR. GORDON: A letter that says the Historic
17 Preservation Commission is not interested in designating
18 first, the building at 1950 Monroe Avenue.19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Would someone --
20 or, do you just want to call a vote?

21 MR. GORDON: I can't make a motion.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Someone make a motion.

23 MR. GOODMAN: I will make a motion.

24 MR. DELVECCHIO: I will second.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ramsey.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 MR. BOEHNER: Member Ludwig?

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

5 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Delvecchio?

6 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

7 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

8 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

10 MR. PAGE: Yes.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

12 MS. DREHER: Yes.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

14 MR. GORDON: Now a motion I would suggest to
15 authorize the secretary to send a letter saying that the
16 Historic Preservation Commission does not have in interest in
17 designating the property at 1966 Monroe Avenue.

18 MR. PAGE: I will make a motion.

19 MS. DREHER: I will second.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ramsey.

21 MR. BOEHNER: Member Ludwig?

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

23 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Delvecchio?

24 MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

4 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

5 MR. PAGE: Yes.

6 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

7 MS. DREHER: Yes.

8 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you very much.

10 Any other new business?

11 Old business, 52 Varinna Drive, I mentioned to
12 Ramsey earlier and I will like to jump in here with my three
13 and a half cents worth. Mary Jo has done a wonderful job
14 presenting this application, and I think on this particular
15 property we should entertain the idea of not requiring a full
16 survey since whoever surveys it is not going to know any more
17 than Mary Jo knows. How do you feel about that?18 I mean, the house is not the primary
19 consideration here. It is a home that's important, but it's
20 not the primary consideration. The primary consideration is
21 the individual or individuals who lived in the home.22 MR. BOEHNER: Mary Jo, have you talked to the
23 homeowners?24 MS. LANPHEAR: No, I have not. The people who
25 are living in the home are not the people that are involved

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 with this particular application. Dean Tolliver --

4 MR. BOEHNER: Have they talked to the property
5 owners, do you know?

6 MS. LANPHEAR: No. So, we will need to do
7 that letter then.

8 MR. GORDON: Well, I think the suggestion
9 might be to have an informal conversation before a formal
10 letter goes out?

11 MR. BOEHNER: No. I would say, maybe we do
12 want to survey the property.

13 MS. DREHER: That's what I was thinking.

14 MR. BOEHNER: We do not know if they -- I
15 think if you want to have your house designated, you may --
16 they may not want to do it, they may need to find interest in
17 the survey.

18 MS. DREHER: I was think along the lines of,
19 if it's not a formal survey, can we put what Mary Jo has
20 done, as far as a formal record, and submit it to the
21 homeowners, because that would help them understand as to why
22 we're pursuing designation. Without the survey, they may
23 wonder why. So, if we can adopt this or somehow get this
24 into a formal part of the process, then I could get into not
25 doing a survey. Although, Ramsey had a good point.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 MR. BOEHNER: One of the things with this I
4 did want to talk about, is that we have \$3,400 left in the
5 account. We have Bero coming under contract to conduct
6 surveys, and with the money that we have we can conduct at
7 least one new survey and some updates.

8 I do need to let Bero know by after our
9 meeting in November what properties they should start
10 surveying so we can use the monies we have in this budget.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: When does the fiscal year
12 end?

13 MR. BOEHNER: At the end of year, but you --
14 there's end of the year payroll sometime in December.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So, we have to spend the
16 money, or we have to earmark the money before the end of the
17 year, is what you're saying?

18 MR. BOEHNER: Yes. I have to give them and
19 work out, you know -- exactly, Jerry. I do have to put that
20 in.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, we might be able to
22 do an abbreviated survey. I mean, this certainly would save
23 whoever is doing the survey some time, I would think.

24 MS. DREHER: I think a survey, an abbreviated
25 survey, I think one of the palpable parts of that would be

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 have it as a reference if a renovation -- someone came in
4 thinking to do renovations to the home and it gives us a
5 baseline to understand with the architectural historian, what
6 is original, what is already modified, I think that is
7 helpful.

8

9 MR. BOEHNER: It also includes photos and a

lot more information than as included in that memo.

10

11 MS. DREHER: We've got a great history of the
12 house, and the underlying reason -- that supports the
13 underlying reason to designate it, but it is still helpful to
know about the actual architecture of the home.

14

15 MR. BOEHNER: I do also want to let this
16 Commission know that the Town Board increased the budget of
17 this Commission to \$5,000 as you requested. So, I don't want
18 you to think that there's pressure not to do what you think
should be done.

19

20 I do think that, if we're going to designate
21 properties, it's not bad to have full documentation of those
properties, just for the pure historic value of it.

22

23 I would say that our level of the surveys that
24 we do get are of very high quality. I know that Katie,
unfortunately I've heard, is moving on. But Michael Bratt is
25 there and there's a number of other people there very capable

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 of doing a good job on those surveys.

4 So, that's up to you guys to, you know,
5 consider what you want, we just need to know by November.6 MR. GORDON: And, if I could just throw in, I
7 was originally thinking that there was not a need for a
8 survey here, because I was looking at this from the
9 perspective of providing sufficient evidence to the
10 Commission to justify this designation. I think Mary Jo has
11 done an excellent job in doing that.

12 MR. BOEHNER: Absolutely.

13 MR. GORDON: You don't need a survey to
14 designate a property. And, I don't disagree with whoever
15 said it, that Jerry said, that no one can do more through
16 work than Mary Jo has done these vis-à-vis the history and
17 the reason for designating this property.18 But, listening to Amanda and listening to
19 Ramsey, I realized that future Boards may want to know what
20 this house looked like. And, when somebody comes in for a
21 Certificate of Appropriateness, what elements ought to be
22 preserved, and we won't know that unless the property is
23 surveyed.24 MR. BOEHNER: It also is, I think, worthy of
25 the subject, that we have all of the documentation just for

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 historic purposes.

4 MS. LANPHEAR: I would feel more comfortable
5 with a written letter on it from somebody like Katie.

6 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, sure, Mary Jo. No, and
7 man, Ken's right. If we just didn't have any money, then
8 that's a different topic. But you do, the Town Board, you
9 know, heard what you guys had to say. There are funds to do
10 the work we need to do this year, and then next year.

11 We only have 34, and then we have \$5,000 next
12 year, and then there's going to be another budget process, so
13 keep that in mind. And two, we're at the end of the year, so
14 if there is work we need to have done, we should do that. If
15 we don't, I don't want to spend the money obviously, but this
16 is picking up on the last I was with you guys two months ago,
17 because I wasn't here last time.

18 But, I think that's where you left this
19 conversation off, so I thought it was good to give you an
20 update on all of that. It may help you make a decision on
21 what you may want to do here.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So what's the next step?

23 MR. BOEHNER: If you would like that, to have
24 that new survey done for that particular property, I will let
25 our consultant know.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.
45 MR. BOEHNER: And put that on the list, and
6 then at that point I believe, if I do the math, yeah, we
7 could do one more update.8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.
910 MR. BOEHNER: So, between now and November, if
11 there's anything else we wanted updated.
1213 MR. GORDON: So is that -- I'm not following
14 this. Is it the pleasure of the Board to direct Ramsey to
15 have a full survey done of 42 Varinna Drive?16 MR. PAGE: So, I have a question. So, it
17 sounds right now, unless something magical comes up, that we
18 would be designating this based on social significance.19 MS. LANPHEAR: The only person who lived in
20 the house, the family that lived in the house, the Tolliver's
21 themselves.22 MR. PAGE: You're suggesting that they might
23 reach the level of personal significance.24 MS. LANPHEAR: I think the house can fill both
25 the number one and number two on the list of criteria.26 MR. PAGE: Okay. So, we don't have too many
27 of these instances, and in some ways malice, sort of, is like
28 that where the building is nice and it's an old building on

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 Monroe Avenue. We do not have too many of those, but I think
4 the real driving force for that is both the building a little
5 bit and also that it served for a period as the town hall.6 Okay. But, I just -- we've looked at other
7 properties where personages were but the building wasn't
8 particularly historic, or we just passed them by, or they
9 suggested that they have historic significances but it wasn't
10 the building that had the significance, it was the person who
11 had been there, like Ben Hogan, was it?

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

13 MR. PAGE: So, you know, when -- if we were
14 confronted with -- if we designated it and if we were
15 confronted with some proposed architectural change update, a
16 different level, I'm just musing here because it doesn't
17 really have any effect --18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Can you take your mask
19 off?20 MR. PAGE: So, if it came to someone wanting
21 to put an addition on, to make a change of some sort
22 architecturally to a building whose architectural
23 significance was medium or low, you know, we would treat it
24 differently than so, you know, I've constantly taken a closer
25 look at things that had a strong social component versus an

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 architectural component. And, I always want to think twice
4 about that, so that the architectural component doesn't feel
5 like it's going to be burdened in the future trying to
6 balance those things.7 So, I'm just musing here and I would sort of
8 speculate on how I would react to something in the future
9 that I wouldn't have put the same level of strictness on
10 architectural change for something that was mostly social.11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We don't know the purity
12 of the house.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: We don't.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I have seen the photos of
15 it.16 MS. LANPHEAR: It looks like it might be
17 original, but we don't know.18 MR. GOODMAN: Jerry, that's why I would be in
19 favor for a survey. I think Amanda was getting to this too,
20 is that it sort of establishes the baseline, if I can use
21 that term, because I'm in agreement with John. I mean, in
22 the future if it's a -- and, I don't know this being the
23 case, but if it's a heavily modified structure, as it stands
24 now, I think we have to take that into account for the future
25 applications before this commission.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, and if it has vinyl
4 siding on it, I don't know whether it does or not, but if it
5 did, would we allow vinyl siding on the addition? I don't
6 know.

7

8 the first black homeowners in Brighton. Is there a way to
9 verify that, because it's not part of this designation?

10

11 homeowners in the modern era. I have been doing some
12 research this week about a family named Anthony who lived in
13 the Trion area in the 1830s. And it looked like the land was
14 purchased there for them by a reverend from New York City.
15 And the Anthonys were from New York City, and they did live
16 there for about five or six years.

17

18 the father died and the family dispersed mostly to Clarkson.
19 But, they did own land and we do know that Asa Dunbar owned
20 land in Brighton in 1818, so they are not the first
21 homeowner, black homeowners in Brighton.

22

the other people, there were black people who lived in Brighton in the early 20th century, were also servants in some of the larger houses in town. They were not homeowners

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 in town. So, the Tollivers do appear to be the first black
4 homeowners in the 20th century. So, that's the longest limb
5 I am going to go out on as far as that's concerned.6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, and they were, both
7 of them were significant people.8 MS. LANPHEAR: They were accomplished people,
9 very definitely.10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, sounds like we
11 should proceed with the survey. Does anyone --

12 MS. DREHER: I agree.

13 MR. DELVECCHIO: I agree.

14 MR. PAGE: Me to.

15 MR. BOEHNER: I will be glad to order it, and
16 think about any updates.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: For November?

18 MR. BOEHNER: Yes. If we do not have any, I
19 don't want to just do one to do one. But, if you think
20 there's some, so if you could go on our list and look at what
21 surveys we have.22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You need a motion for the
23 survey?

24 MR. GORDON: No.

25 MR. BOEHNER: No.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, very good. So, In
4 November we will talk about upgrades.5 And, any other old business, presentations,
6 announcements?

7 MR. GORDON: How about an announcement?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No? I don't think so.

9 But, I have an announcement, would you go
10 ahead?

11 MR. BOEHNER: What's that?

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You're not going to say
13 anything, are you?14 MR. BOEHNER: I going to retire in April. I
15 wanted to talk to Mary Jo. Sorry, Mary Jo.16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I am looking for some
17 assistance, so if you would be so kind as to pick up one of
18 these if you have any ideas. There's a job opportunity for
19 any of you who are unemployed at the time and looking for
20 work.21 MS. DREHER: I might have somebody. I got the
22 e-mail.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

24 MR. GORDON: Are you going to have Jeff Frisch
25 at the next meeting?

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021
2

3 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, I will.

4 MR. GORDON: So, with Ramsey's departure
5 coming in April, we do have a person on staff who is going to
6 be taking his place as secretary of the commission, and his
7 name is Jeff Frisch. Jeff's excellent, he's a planner on
8 staff. What's his technical title?

9 MR. BOEHNER: Planning technician right now.

10 MR. GORDON: And, he is going to start
11 attending our meetings next month just so he can get familiar
12 with how the commission works.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Motion to adjourn.

14 MS. DREHER: I move.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

16 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

17 *

*

*

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3 REPORTER CERTIFICATE
4
56 I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did
7 report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in
the above-entitled matter;8 Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and
9 accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at
10 the time and place hereinbefore set forth.11
12 Dated this 12th day of December, 2021.13 At Rochester, New York
14
1516 Rhoda Collins
17 Rhoda Collins
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25