

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

B R I G H T O N
H I S T O R I C
P R E S E R V A T I O N
C O M M I S S I O N

October 28th, 2021

At approximately 7:15 p.m.
Brighton Town Hall
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON

JUSTIN DELVECCHIO)
AMANDA L. DREHER)
WAYNE GOODMAN)
JOHN PAGE)
DIANA ROBINSON)
DAVID WHITAKER)

BOARD MEMBERS

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
Town Planner

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I'd like to call the meeting to order. Mr. Secretary, will you call the roll please?

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Here.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

MR. GOODMAN: Here.

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

MS. DREHER: Here.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Robinson and Whitaker.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ramsey.

May I have motion to approve the agenda?

MR. PAGE: I'll make that motion, John Page.

MR. DELVECCHIO: Second, Justin.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Approval of the minutes.

I have a few. Amanda, you probably do too.

MS. DREHER: I have a few.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Would you like to go first?

MS. DREHER: Sure. Page 4, Line 20, Bero should be spelled B-E-R-O.

Page 12, Line 18, haven't designated it, should be hadn't designated it.

Page 17, Line 7, when you do and back, should be go back.

And also Page 17, Line 24, removal should be approval.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Let's go back to Page 15, Line 8, should be once not onces.

Page 17, Line 5, should be make and not makes.

Line 6, should be says, plural, not say.

Page 19, Line 4, I think it should be can and not CA.

22, Line 9, Mr. Fader, was there a Mr. Fader here?

MR. BOEHNER: David Fader is a Planning Board member, so, no.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, then it must have been somebody else. Anyway, I don't know who it was, but Mr. Fader is quoted.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2

3

MR. BOEHNER: What's it say, Jerry?

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I didn't print them out.

5

Page 22, Line 9.

6

MS. LANPHEAR: Fader, F-A-D-E-R.

7

8

MR. GORDON: Let me see, so it was the discussion, during the discussion of the gas station on East Avenue and Lou was talking. Did he have somebody with him?

9

10

11

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: He did, but I don't think --

12

13

MS. DREHER: He did have somebody with him, was it the seller?

14

15

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah, but I don't think the seller said anything.

16

17

18

19

MR. PAGE: He might have had a one liner.

MR. GORDON: He might have had this one line.

MS. DREHER: When I saw it, that's what I thought that.

20

21

22

23

MR. GORDON: My guess is it's who that is.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Very good.

And then, Page 26, Line 15, I think it should be quickly, L-Y, not L-E-E.

24

25

MR. BOEHNER: I think that's how it's spelled.

MR. GORDON: It is, L-E-E.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I know, but it says,
going to do it quickly.

MR. BOEHNER: I was thinking Quicklee's.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And then, Page 30,
Line 20, should be arena not marina.

Any other additions or corrections?

Motion to approve.

MS. DREHER: I will move.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. All in favor?

ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

Was this meeting duly advertised?

MR. BOEHNER: Yes. It was properly advertised
in the Daily Record of October 14, 2021.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. That meeting
as duly advertised will now be held.

We have no communications, no designation of
landmarks. We do have two certificates of appropriateness
APPLICATION 10H-01-21.

10H-01-21 Application of Trinity Reformed
Church, owner of property at 909 North Landing Road, tax
number 123.17-1-44, for a Certificate of Appropriateness to
replace the aging existing sign with a new sign. All as

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

described on application and documents on file.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone here to speak on that? Would you come up please and state your name. Take down your mask so we can hear you.

CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Yes. My name is Chuck DiPiazza, D-I-P-I-A-Z-Z-A, I'm a deacon at Trinity Reformed Church.

Our current sign has been repaired at least two or three times, to the point it's deteriorating and it can't be repaired anymore.

So anyways, you know, we thought we'd take on a new sign in replacement of it, and we talked to Joe over at Turning Point Signs in Fairport, whose done a lot of signs in the Fairport area and I think the Brighton area as well, all of the towns and schools are using him.

And anyways, he came up with a design which I think we shared with you, and it kind of mimics the church itself the way it's got the peak, okay? And the rooster that sits up on our -- there as well, and we've done all of the things required, we took away the web page and we checked and we had 33.5 percent of the sign itself is, you know, the logo. We have the Reformed Church of America logo plus the rooster, you know, so I think we've --

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

4 MR. BOEHNER: I can say that the sign does
5 meet code, been reviewed by the Planning Board and
6 recommended approval as presented. I don't know if that
7 helps this Board at all.

8 MR. GORDON: Subject to the review of the
9 conditions of this Board.

10 MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any questions?

12 MR. PAGE: The sign looks good. I thank you
13 for that presentation.

14 MR. GOODMAN: It's a good design, thank you.

15 CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Do we get funding?

16 MR. BOEHNER: No, nice try.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do we get an invitation
18 to the strawberry social?

19 CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Hopefully we will get that
20 back next year, you know, it's been -- I'm hoping.

21 We miss doing that and we missed a couple
22 things this year. We did have the chicken barbecue and it's
23 the kind of things that we are hoping to get back once things
24 settle down some, so.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: If there are no

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

questions, Ken, do you have a motion?

MR. BOEHNER: You just have to ask if anyone would like to speak.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone in the audience who wants to speak? Okay.

MR. GORDON: So, you're closing this Public Hearing?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I am closing the Public Hearing.

MR. GORDON: Then, I will propose the following resolution.

Whereas, Application Number 10H-01-21 has been submitted for a Certificate of Appropriateness under the Town's Historic Preservation Law for improvement to property located at 909 Landing Road North, owned by Trinity Reformed Church to perform work described as the replacement of an existing sign with a new sign.

And whereas, the Historic Preservation Commission duly called a Public Hearing to consider the matter on October 28, 2021.

And whereas, the necessary legal notice has been published and the required sign posted pursuant to Town Code.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

And whereas, the Public Hearing was held and all persons having an interest in such matter, having had an opportunity to be heard therein.

And whereas, the Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines that pursuant to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code, that the proposed above described work to the subject property is consistent with the purposes of the Town's Historic Preservation Law and compatible with the property's historic character based upon its review of the application and documents on file and received at the Public Hearing and the testimony presented at the Public Hearing, it is hereby resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby receives and files the above described application.

And, it is further resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby approves Application Number 10H-01-21 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the above described work to be performed at the property located at 909 Landing Road North, subject to the condition that the above described work be completed within one year from the date of approval. And, further subject to the condition that the lighting on the property be reused for the sign, and that the sign be constructed, installed as detailed in the plans

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

that are on file.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. Someone please put forth the motion.

MR. GOODMAN: Jerry, I'll make that motion.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Wayne.

MR. PAGE: I will second.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, John.

Ramsey.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

MS. DREHER: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

You're all set.

CHUCK DIPIAZZA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you for coming too.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

Okay, the next application.

APPLICATION 10H-02-21

10-H-02-21 Application of Amanda and Michael Dreher, owners of property at 1300 French Road, tax number 150.09-1-8, for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a detached garage and other renovations. All as described on application and documents on file.

MR. BOEHNER: For the record, I want it to say that this application of Member Dreher is being presented by her. She will not be participating in the review of this application. She will not be procedurally making any decisions on this application. I just want to put that on the record.

Ken, is there anything else?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Folks, you can take your masks down please, and for the record please state your names.

AMANDA DREHER: Amanda Dreher.

MICHAEL DREHER: Michael Dreher.

AMANDA DREHER: Okay. So, multipart project here. We will just take it one element at a time.

The first is the three-car garage. Building that, we currently do not have a garage. The goal was to

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3 have it resemble an outbuilding or a barn that may have been
4 on the property at the time. It's placed about 12 feet from
5 the house. And three-car, a reasonable size for today. We
6 have two cars and lots of toys and yard things for our
7 family.

8 Any questions, or should I just keep going?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Keep going please.

10 AMANDA DREHER: All right. The second piece
11 would be the driveway and parking area. We currently have a
12 circular driveway that goes behind the house, with the length
13 of it being gravel and asphalt, older asphalt in the back.

14 We went through many variations with our
15 landscape architect as to where we could place the garage,
16 close enough to the house so it's functional, but allowing us
17 to preserve that driveway, circular driveway. There just
18 wasn't a good option, so we made the decision to use one side
19 of the driveway. We're going to pave that and there's a
20 parking area in front of the garage allowing for guests and
21 sufficient turnaround for our cars so that we can always be
22 heading out onto French Road. It's not a road that you want
23 to back out onto.

24 The other side of the driveway for the time
25 being we're going to leave it as gravel and leave the curb

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3 cut. We're going to live with the one, using the one side of
4 the driveway for a year or two. It is a little bit more
5 difficult to plow that side, I think we might have to trim a
6 few branches, it will be easier.

7 But, if we feel like we do not like pulling
8 out of that side, we really are missing the element of having
9 the circular drive, we do have an alternative plan to put a
10 circular drive in front of the house. Now, that's not part
11 of the application, but it is an option that we talked about
12 with the landscape architect. So, we are going to leave the
13 curb cut for now, and give ourselves a year or two to make
14 sure that we're really satisfied with the one driveway before
15 we, you know, regrade and put grass over the other side of
16 the driveway. But, for now, it will remain gravel.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It's easier to leave it
18 than ask for another one.

19 AMANDA DREHER: Yes, that is what I have been
20 advised. And we really believe this will be the ideal
21 situation. We won't have any trouble using the one side, but
22 we do have the other curb cut so we want to live with it and
23 make sure that it's the right, the best option for us.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah. If you abandon that
25 access portion now, you might not get it back very easily, so

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

keep it.

AMANDA DREHER: That's what we were advised.

MICHAEL DREHER: That curb cut also gets an extraordinary high amount of use by people who miss the turnoff for the office park next door and turn around. I would say that gets more pull in and pull out than it gets vehicles using our property.

AMANDA DREHER: The next piece is the patio. We currently were surprised when we bought the house to see that no previous owner had ever installed a patio. The current -- one of the benefits of actually getting rid of the driveway that runs behind our house is that we will -- it allows us to have a patio in close proximity to the house. The driveway will no longer bifurcate the yard from the house.

So, we opted for concrete pavers. It is, well not the most economical option as we recently discovered, we got our final quote, it is more reasonable than natural stone and it is an appropriate material for our climate. And it's the look we're going for and in the future, it could be replaced with natural stone if someone were inclined to do so. We're going to continue the pavers on a path to the driveway and into the house. Currently asphalt runs all the

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

way up to the back of the house, as you can see in the photos, which, is not attractive or desirable effects at all. So, the pavers will have a walkway up to the house.

And, the next piece being the back entrance and the mud room. We believe the mud room was really renovated in the late 70s when the prior owner took ownership of the house. It's got, you know, casement windows, aluminum awning, I don't know, late-mid century something to that effect. Not really within character of the rest of the house.

So, our mud room also doesn't have a great configuration for a family. We'd like to get some more space for a bench and sitting down and putting on shoes, and also, we need some sort of utility closet in that area.

So, in doing this we decided to redo the back entrance to make it more in line with the character of the house and overall more useful for us. So, we're doing double hung windows on either side of the door, and adding a overhang, a simple overhang over the door rather than the large metal aluminum overhang, with just a hung light. That would better reflect the historic character of the home, but also we are putting -- opting to put a metal roof on the overhang as a nod to the effect that it isn't a modern

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

addition. That was one of the design choices that was suggested and we agree it's a good look. But, we are eager to hear your feedback on that, if there's any feedback.

And, the next piece we have two steel exterior doors on the south side of the house replaced again some time in the 70s era we believe. They are somewhat deteriorating, they are unattractive inside and out, and there's a lot of air gaps and some safety concerns -- some security concerns, I'm sorry.

So, we thought we would take the opportunity while purchasing windows and doors and whatnot to replace those doors. So, they are not protected in any way, we do not want to put storm doors on them. One of them is used frequently, well, somewhat frequently, the other goes into our basement.

So, we are opting for the fiberglass, wood grain look to have a nod to the -- what originally were wood doors facing there, but also to be appropriate for the weather that they will certainly be affected by.

And there is in front of the door that we do use on the side of the house to get out to that side, there's actually no pad or any landing whatsoever, it just goes right onto the grass. There's maybe like a small piece of old

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

concrete, maybe like a foot by a very small --

MICHAEL DREHER: Like eight inches around it in deteriorated cracks in concrete.

AMANDA DREHER: Yeah. So you're really stepping right out onto the dirt. So, we will have a, you know, there will be a truck pouring for the garage, we'd like to just pour a simple concrete pad at the time.

And the last piece is the pond. As you can see on your site plan, we'd like to fill the pond. It -- research of the architectural historian who did the survey for our house, discovered that it was -- it did not exist prior to 1970 from some aerial photos. So, it was a modern creation, not a livestock pond as we originally thought.

So, I think that it was just put in as a water feature. And when we bought the property there wasn't a fountain in there, however in recent years it empties out for more than three quarters of a year. It's mud, it's overgrown, and it doesn't seem to be serving a purpose. And, we do have small children, so when there is water in there, of course, there's a safety concern. It just doesn't really function as a part of our yard right now. So, we think that best long term option is to fill it in. And, we're going to start doing that with the fill from the excavation from the

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

garage and the patio.

There's also an old fence partially falling down adjacent to the stone barn. We'd just like to remove the rest of it, and no further plans at this time to disturb that area, but as you can see in the site plan, we have some great ideas in the future as to, you know, how to make those areas look their best, but nothing else in the future, only removing what's remaining.

And I will note that we are -- we do have an application in to the Zoning Board for two variances for the height of the garage and for the size of the garage for about 20 feet. The maximum is 16 per code and we are a little over 900 square feet, 960 square feet, for the size and the maximum is 600. So, they will hear our application on those variances next week and asked us to come here first.

And we are also -- we also have technically two lots, two parcels, two tax numbers. We have a small parcel in the front, on the front of French Road is a quarter of an acre. And however, when we build the garage, where it's currently placed, it is within five feet of that lot line. So, it's a little late in the game that we made this realization, it's that second parcel is very easy to forget about, when you're focussing on all of -- on everything else.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2
3 So, I did speak with Rick, who's last name has
4 escaped me.

5 MR. BOEHNER: DiStefano.

6 AMANDA DREHER: Yeah, DiStefano. Several
7 times, and we determined that the best thing, rather than
8 applying for a variance, a third variance, it made more sense
9 to just combine the parcels. So, this application is being
10 made with the note that we will be -- our surveyor is
11 currently working on an updated survey, and redoing the
12 application to combine the lots. And the smaller lot is not
13 buildable, it's below the maximum requirements. So, we don't
14 anticipate any issues with that and that should be done well
15 before the garage is built. We are aiming to build, not
16 until May. Okay.

17 MR. BOEHNER: The resubdivision of the two
18 lots, is something that's just done administratively. And
19 that land would not be covered by it's designation, just by
20 the subdivisions. It's just being able to combine them, so I
21 think we probably told you that.

22 AMANDA DREHER: Yes. I think it's just a
23 holdover from --

24 MR. BOEHNER: No, no, you're right. That's
25 what I would do to. Don't get rid of the curb cut, and put

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

those two lots together, because you're just going to be a little bit more on it.

AMANDA DREHER: Yeah. But, talking to Rick, he said, you know, they have at times the Zoning Board has denied those variance requests because there is another alternative, which they believe is preferred, and that's to combine the lots. And in this case, it did not make any difference to us, other than, you know, an extra two grand to our surveyor. So, we will combine those.

MR. PAGE: Nice presentation. Just note, one of my notes, you've been in already to go over this a few times and let us know what your planning or thinking, so I think that, for me, I have already worked out the good planning that you are doing with your design team, and this is an excellent package that's been put together, very thorough. Maybe just as thorough as we ever get. And I applaud everything that you are planning to do. Thank you.

AMANDA DREHER: I will also note that our architect is here today, Jennifer Takatch, if you have any questions she is available also.

MR. BOEHNER: It's good that you did a master plan for your property. Because, now you know what you want to do, and now you're going to start learning what it takes.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2
3 I know how hard it is, it's a long process,
4 but it's going to be beautiful, it really is. It's very
5 nicely done.

6 AMANDA DREHER: We are very excited. And you
7 can see in the photos, all the children's set is stacked up
8 next to the door.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, but I like that look.

10 AMANDA DREHER: And it's spread around. It
11 will be nice to have a garage to store things in, to get out
12 of the rain, to have a patio. We have a beautiful piece of
13 property, that we cannot really sit down and enjoy because we
14 don't have a great spot for it. So, I think it's really
15 going to contribute to our quality of life there and we plan
16 to stay for a very long time.

17 MICHAEL DREHER: I'm just excited about not
18 bringing the bicycles up and down the old fieldstone stairs
19 in the basement.

20 AMANDA DREHER: It's difficult to store things
21 in our basement.

22 MR. GORDON: So, I just want to point out a
23 procedural bit of information for the Board tonight. Most
24 times when we see a Certificate of Appropriateness
25 application, your viewing it, as you should with this one as

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

well, it simply being a decision as to whether the work, the improvements, are consistent with the historic character of the property. And then, that determination often goes to another Board resulting in them making a final determination on the overall project, for example, the Planning Board.

This project, and that's why I ran over and quickly chatted with Ramsey, this project is not going to the Planning Board. This project is going to be some ZBA reviews, some Zoning Board of Appeals reviews, but they're really only looking at some very specific variance issues.

So, in terms of the review that you are undertaking, I want the Board to understand that you're really the ones who are looking at, if you will, the entire site modifications and the site plan, if you will, to the extent this is your site plan, to determine whether all of these modifications are consistent with the historic character of the property. So, I just wanted to put that sort of in front of you just so you were aware of that.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ken.

Any comments, questions? Did everyone have a chance to see the windows and doors and study those?

And, we don't dictate paint colors, but one thing I hope is that if you do put in new doors and they have

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

a plastic frame around the -- or, yeah, probably plastic around where the window or lights would go, that you paint that the same color as the door.

Nothing screams metal door like leaving a white vinyl there which eventually will turn yellow, given enough chance.

AMANDA DREHER: I believe the doors already -- are you talking about the color of --

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, I'm just talking about that, this, the type of door that you're getting.

AMANDA DREHER: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I just would suggest that you paint the frame around the windows in the same color of the door.

AMANDA DREHER: It comes that way.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great.

AMANDA DREHER: It will all be in that wood grain, the medium dark color, yes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great. It looks great.

MR. BOEHNER: It really does.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks wonderful.

Well, I mean, one of the best presentations we have seen.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

AMANDA DREHER: Well, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any questions, comments?

MR. PAGE: One thing I've seen is this packet of information is thorough, so when we are looking at what you were doing, it made it kind of easy.

MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, there's not a lot to pull out.

MICHAEL DREHER: We were talking about how much fun Mr. Gordon was going to have.

AMANDA DREHER: I did include that material list because I had to make that for myself because there were so many materials, so many places I was looking at things and one place had one thing, and another place had another thing. And so, I made that for myself and then realized it was a neat summary to provide to you as well, and my contractor appreciated it as well.

MR. GOODMAN: On the specifics, the specifics of the project are really well done. The different components of the project come together quite well.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: The landscape plan helps out a lot.

MR. GOODMAN: Yeah, it really does, so, thank you.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

AMANDA DREHER: And that's really how we started because we knew the garage was going to affect everything else, the way we would use the yard and the driveway.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any questions? Anyone from the audience to speak?

I'd like to close the Public Hearings.

Ken, do you have a motion?

MR. GORDON: Yes, I will shortly.

Whereas, Application Number 10H-02-21 has been submitted for a Certificate of Appropriateness under the Town's Historic Preservation Law for improvement to property located at 1300 French Road owned by Amanda and Michal Dreher, to perform work described as, number one, construction of a detached three-car garage to the southeast of the house.

Number two, creation of an asphalt parking, turnaround area south of the garage.

Number three, removal of the asphalt parking area behind and to the east of the house, and the addition of a concrete paver patio.

Number four, the renovation of the back entrance to the house and mud room, including the removal of

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

an aluminum awning and the casement windows, and installation of a new wood door, and the addition of a new overhang with double-hung windows on each side of the door.

Number five, the replacement of steel exterior doors on the south side of the house with fiberglass wood grain doors, and the addition of a concrete pad outside the door farthest to the east.

And number six, the filling in of a pond northeast of the house and removal of the deck at the east end of the pond, and the removal of a board fence at the northeast corner of the stone barn.

And whereas, the Historic Preservation Commission duly called a Public Hearing to consider the matter on October 28, 2021.

And whereas, the necessary legal notice was published and the required sign posted pursuant to Town Code.

And whereas, the Public Hearing was held and all persons having an interest in such matter and having had an opportunity to be heard therein.

And whereas, the Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines pursuant to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code that the proposed above described work to the subject property is consistent

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

with the purposes of the Town's Historic Preservation Law and compatible with the property's historic character.

Based upon its review of the application and documents on file, and received at the Public Hearing, and the testimony presented at the Public Hearing, it is hereby resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby receives and files the above described application.

And, it is further resolved that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby approves Application Number 10H-02-21 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the above described work to be performed at the property located at 1300 French Road, subject to the condition that the above described work be completed within one year from the date of approval.

And further subject to the condition that the work to be performed be compatible with the detailed plans on file with the Board.

And, be it further resolved that pursuant to Chapter 224 of the Town Code, the above described work qualifies for the exemptions set forth in New York Real Property Tax Law Section 444-A.

MR. PAGE: I would make that motion.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Just a second, did you

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

put a time frame on that?

MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, one year.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I think, given the current state of affairs -- well, I guess you can't.

AMANDA DREHER: We can come back for an extension.

MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

MR. GORDON: You would want to do that before the one year was up, obviously.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah, okay. Just a heads up on that, very good.

MR. PAGE: I still make that motion.

MR. DELVECCHIO: I will second.

MR. BOEHNER: Member Ludwig?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. DelVecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Motion carries.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Carry on.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

Okay. No hardship applications, Public Hearings are now closed. New business, we have a demolition review of two properties at the corner of Monroe and Elmwood Avenue.

MR. BOEHNER: We did send you documentation on that building. What they're planning to do, just a little background, to both of the buildings if we can talk about 1966 Monroe Avenue at the same time. They're planning to tear down those buildings, subdivide them and build what is a Quicklee's, similar to what they wanted to do on East Avenue, same people.

MR. GORDON: Same people, very different project.

MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, it's more of a commercial -- yeah, a totally different project. So, that's what's leading to the demolition of these buildings, is that you guys need to review it and determine if you think it has any historical significance. If you don't think it does, then you can direct me to inform the Planning Board of your findings, which I would be glad to do. I think we have sent you the pictures. My opinion, there's not much there.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Other than we're losing another service station.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

MR. GORDON: To put a slightly sharper point on what Ramsey just said, it's not whether these buildings have any historical significance, it's: Are you interested in designating these buildings as landmarks?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No. Unfortunately, no, we're not. Well, I'm not. So, a yes vote.

MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, we're going to do a motion for each one, if we could, to direct me to send a letter notifying the Planning Board.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So, a yes vote will indicate that you can send that --

MR. BOEHNER: That is correct.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: -- a letter.

MR. GORDON: A letter that says the Historic Preservation Commission is not interested in designating first, the building at 1950 Monroe Avenue.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Would someone -- or, do you just want to call a vote?

MR. GORDON: I can't make a motion.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Someone make a motion.

MR. GOODMAN: I will make a motion.

MR. DELVECCHIO: I will second.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ramsey.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. BOEHNER: Member Ludwig?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Delvecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

MS. DREHER: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

MR. GORDON: Now a motion I would suggest to
authorize the secretary to send a letter saying that the
Historic Preservation Commission does not have in interest in
designating the property at 1966 Monroe Avenue.

MR. PAGE: I will make a motion.

MS. DREHER: I will second.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ramsey.

MR. BOEHNER: Member Ludwig?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Delvecchio?

MR. DELVECCHIO: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page?

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

MS. DREHER: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you very much.

Any other new business?

Old business, 52 Varinna Drive, I mentioned to Ramsey earlier and I will like to jump in here with my three and a half cents worth. Mary Jo has done a wonderful job presenting this application, and I think on this particular property we should entertain the idea of not requiring a full survey since whoever surveys it is not going to know any more than Mary Jo knows. How do you feel about that?

I mean, the house is not the primary consideration here. It is a home that's important, but it's not the primary consideration. The primary consideration is the individual or individuals who lived in the home.

MR. BOEHNER: Mary Jo, have you talked to the homeowners?

MS. LANPHEAR: No, I have not. The people who are living in the home are not the people that are involved

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

with this particular application. Dean Tolliver --

MR. BOEHNER: Have they talked to the property owners, do you know?

MS. LANPHEAR: No. So, we will need to do that letter then.

MR. GORDON: Well, I think the suggestion might be to have an informal conversation before a formal letter goes out?

MR. BOEHNER: No. I would say, maybe we do want to survey the property.

MS. DREHER: That's what I was thinking.

MR. BOEHNER: We do not know if they -- I think if you want to have your house designated, you may -- they may not want to do it, they may need to find interest in the survey.

MS. DREHER: I was think along the lines of, if it's not a formal survey, can we put what Mary Jo has done, as far as a formal record, and submit it to the homeowners, because that would help them understand as to why we're pursuing designation. Without the survey, they may wonder why. So, if we can adopt this or somehow get this into a formal part of the process, then I could get into not doing a survey. Although, Ramsey had a good point.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

MR. BOEHNER: One of the things with this I did want to talk about, is that we have \$3,400 left in the account. We have Bero coming under contract to conduct surveys, and with the money that we have we can conduct at least one new survey and some updates.

I do need to let Bero know by after our meeting in November what properties they should start surveying so we can use the monies we have in this budget.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: When does the fiscal year end?

MR. BOEHNER: At the end of year, but you -- there's end of the year payroll sometime in December.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So, we have to spend the money, or we have to earmark the money before the end of the year, is what you're saying?

MR. BOEHNER: Yes. I have to give them and work out, you know -- exactly, Jerry. I do have to put that in.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, we might be able to do an abbreviated survey. I mean, this certainly would save whoever is doing the survey some time, I would think.

MS. DREHER: I think a survey, an abbreviated survey, I think one of the palpable parts of that would be

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3 have it as a reference if a renovation -- someone came in
4 thinking to do renovations to the home and it gives us a
5 baseline to understand with the architectural historian, what
6 is original, what is already modified, I think that is
7 helpful.

8 MR. BOEHNER: It also includes photos and a
9 lot more information than as included in that memo.

10 MS. DREHER: We've got a great history of the
11 house, and the underlying reason -- that supports the
12 underlying reason to designate it, but it is still helpful to
13 know about the actual architecture of the home.

14 MR. BOEHNER: I do also want to let this
15 Commission know that the Town Board increased the budget of
16 this Commission to \$5,000 as you requested. So, I don't want
17 you to think that there's pressure not to do what you think
18 should be done.

19 I do think that, if we're going to designate
20 properties, it's not bad to have full documentation of those
21 properties, just for the pure historic value of it.

22 I would say that our level of the surveys that
23 we do get are of very high quality. I know that Katie,
24 unfortunately I've heard, is moving on. But Michael Bratt is
25 there and there's a number of other people there very capable

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

of doing a good job on those surveys.

So, that's up to you guys to, you know, consider what you want, we just need to know by November.

MR. GORDON: And, if I could just throw in, I was originally thinking that there was not a need for a survey here, because I was looking at this from the perspective of providing sufficient evidence to the Commission to justify this designation. I think Mary Jo has done an excellent job in doing that.

MR. BOEHNER: Absolutely.

MR. GORDON: You don't need a survey to designate a property. And, I don't disagree with whoever said it, that Jerry said, that no one can do more through work than Mary Jo has done these vis-à-vis the history and the reason for designating this property.

But, listening to Amanda and listening to Ramsey, I realized that future Boards may want to know what this house looked like. And, when somebody comes in for a Certificate of Appropriateness, what elements ought to be preserved, and we won't know that unless the property is surveyed.

MR. BOEHNER: It also is, I think, worthy of the subject, that we have all of the documentation just for

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

historic purposes.

MS. LANPHEAR: I would feel more comfortable with a written letter on it from somebody like Katie.

MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, sure, Mary Jo. No, and man, Ken's right. If we just didn't have any money, then that's a different topic. But you do, the Town Board, you know, heard what you guys had to say. There are funds to do the work we need to do this year, and then next year.

We only have 34, and then we have \$5,000 next year, and then there's going to be another budget process, so keep that in mind. And two, we're at the end of the year, so if there is work we need to have done, we should do that. If we don't, I don't want to spend the money obviously, but this is picking up on the last I was with you guys two months ago, because I wasn't here last time.

But, I think that's where you left this conversation off, so I thought it was good to give you an update on all of that. It may help you make a decision on what you may want to do here.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So what's the next step?

MR. BOEHNER: If you would like that, to have that new survey done for that particular property, I will let our consultant know.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

MR. BOEHNER: And put that on the list, and then at that point I believe, if I do the math, yeah, we could do one more update.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

MR. BOEHNER: So, between now and November, if there's anything else we wanted updated.

MR. GORDON: So is that -- I'm not following this. Is it the pleasure of the Board to direct Ramsey to have a full survey done of 42 Varinna Drive?

MR. PAGE: So, I have a question. So, it sounds right now, unless something magical comes up, that we would be designating this based on social significance.

MS. LANPHEAR: The only person who lived in the house, the family that lived in the house, the Tolliver's themselves.

MR. PAGE: You're suggesting that they might reach the level of personal significance.

MS. LANPHEAR: I think the house can fill both the number one and number two on the list of criteria.

MR. PAGE: Okay. So, we don't have too many of these instances, and in some ways malice, sort of, is like that where the building is nice and it's an old building on

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

Monroe Avenue. We do not have too many of those, but I think the real driving force for that is both the building a little bit and also that it served for a period as the town hall.

Okay. But, I just -- we've looked at other properties where personages were but the building wasn't particularly historic, or we just passed them by, or they suggested that they have historic significances but it wasn't the building that had the significance, it was the person who had been there, like Ben Hogan, was it?

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MR. PAGE: So, you know, when -- if we were confronted with -- if we designated it and if we were confronted with some proposed architectural change update, a different level, I'm just musing here because it doesn't really have any effect --

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Can you take your mask off?

MR. PAGE: So, if it came to someone wanting to put an addition on, to make a change of some sort architecturally to a building whose architectural significance was medium or low, you know, we would treat it differently than so, you know, I've constantly taken a closer look at things that had a strong social component versus an

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

architectural component. And, I always want to think twice about that, so that the architectural component doesn't feel like it's going to be burdened in the future trying to balance those things.

So, I'm just musing here and I would sort of speculate on how I would react to something in the future that I wouldn't have put the same level of strictness on architectural change for something that was mostly social.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We don't know the purity of the house.

MS. LANPHEAR: We don't.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I have seen the photos of it.

MS. LANPHEAR: It looks like it might be original, but we don't know.

MR. GOODMAN: Jerry, that's why I would be in favor for a survey. I think Amanda was getting to this too, is that it sort of establishes the baseline, if I can use that term, because I'm in agreement with John. I mean, in the future if it's a -- and, I don't know this being the case, but if it's a heavily modified structure, as it stands now, I think we have to take that into account for the future applications before this commission.

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, and if it has vinyl siding on it, I don't know whether it does or not, but if it did, would we allow vinyl siding on the addition? I don't know.

MR. BOEHNER: Mary Jo, you thought they were the first black homeowners in Brighton. Is there a way to verify that, because it's not part of this designation?

MS. LANPHEAR: They were the first black homeowners in the modern era. I have been doing some research this week about a family named Anthony who lived in the Trion area in the 1830s. And it looked like the land was purchased there for them by a reverend from New York City. And the Anthonys were from New York City, and they did live there for about five or six years.

But then, in 1930, the family dispersed and the father died and the family dispersed mostly to Clarkson. But, they did own land and we do know that Asa Dunbar owned land in Brighton in 1818, so they are not the first homeowner, black homeowners in Brighton.

But, as I said, I think at the last meeting, the other people, there were black people who lived in Brighton in the early 20th century, were also servants in some of the larger houses in town. They were not homeowners

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

in town. So, the Tollivers do appear to be the first black homeowners in the 20th century. So, that's the longest limb I am going to go out on as far as that's concerned.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, and they were, both of them were significant people.

MS. LANPHEAR: They were accomplished people, very definitely.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, sounds like we should proceed with the survey. Does anyone --

MS. DREHER: I agree.

MR. DELVECCHIO: I agree.

MR. PAGE: Me to.

MR. BOEHNER: I will be glad to order it, and think about any updates.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: For November?

MR. BOEHNER: Yes. If we do not have any, I don't want to just do one to do one. But, if you think there's some, so if you could go on our list and look at what surveys we have.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You need a motion for the survey?

MR. GORDON: No.

MR. BOEHNER: No.

1 BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, very good. So, In
4 November we will talk about upgrades.

5 And, any other old business, presentations,
6 announcements?

7 MR. GORDON: How about an announcement?

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No? I don't think so.
9 But, I have an announcement, would you go
10 ahead?

11 MR. BOEHNER: What's that?

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You're not going to say
13 anything, are you?

14 MR. BOEHNER: I going to retire in April. I
15 wanted to talk to Mary Jo. Sorry, Mary Jo.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I am looking for some
17 assistance, so if you would be so kind as to pick up one of
18 these if you have any ideas. There's a job opportunity for
19 any of you who are unemployed at the time and looking for
20 work.

21 MS. DREHER: I might have somebody. I got the
22 e-mail.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

24 MR. GORDON: Are you going to have Jeff Frisch
25 at the next meeting?

BRIGHTON HISTORIC COMMISSION 10/28/2021

MR. BOEHNER: Yes, I will.

MR. GORDON: So, with Ramsey's departure coming in April, we do have a person on staff who is going to be taking his place as secretary of the commission, and his name is Jeff Frisch. Jeff's excellent, he's a planner on staff. What's his technical title?

MR. BOEHNER: Planning technician right now.

MR. GORDON: And, he is going to start attending our meetings next month just so he can get familiar with how the commission works.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Motion to adjourn.

MS. DREHER: I move.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

*

*

*

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;

Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

Dated this 12th day of December, 2021.

At Rochester, New York

Rhoda Collins
Rhoda Collins