

A CULTURAL RESOURCES SURVEY OF
SEVENTY-EIGHT SELECTED SITES IN
THE TOWN OF BRIGHTON
Monroe County, New York

Conducted by
The Landmark Society of Western New York, Inc.

Project Completed

June, 1999

TABLE OF CONTENTS

THE PROJECT SUMMARY	3
Preliminary Investigation	3
Selection of 78 Properties for Study	4
Historic Overview	4
Windshield Survey	4
THE SURVEY METHODOLOGY	5
Information Collected	5
Photographs	5
RESULTS - ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS	6
Groupings - Use	6
Agricultural Resources	6
Residences	6
Barns	6
Domestic Resources	7
Residences	7
Educational Resources	9
Schools	9
Religious Resources	9
Religious facilities	9
Church School	10
Church-related residence	10
Commercial Resources	11
Specialty Stores	11
Shopping Plaza	11
Health Care Resources	12
Sanitarium: nursing home	12
Groupings - Construction Types	13
Wood Construction	13
Stucco Construction	13
Masonry Construction	14
Brick Construction	14
Cast Concrete and Ceramic Block	14
Metal Frame Construction	15
Periods of Construction	16
Chart	16
Building Styles	17
Chart	17
Stylistic Integrity	18
RATING THE SURVEY	19
The Rating System	19
Chart - Breakdown of Final Ratings	20
RECOMMENDATIONS	21
Designation Programs	21
National Register of Historic Places Program	
Criteria for Listing	21
Surveyed Properties Which Appear to Meet	
National Register Criteria	22
Individually Eligible	22

Surveyed Properties Which Appear to Meet National Register Criteria - continued	
Historic District	24
Thematic Group	25
Town of Brighton Historic Preservation Law	
Criteria for Designation	26
Properties Designated Under Town of Brighton Preservation Ordinance	26
Identification and Documentation of Additional Cultural Resources in the Town of Brighton	28
APPENDICES	29
A. Sample of Survey Form Used	29
B. List of Addresses: Final Ratings, Dates, Styles and Siding Material	31
C. List of Properties with Barns	36
D. List of Brick Buildings	37
E. Technical Booklets:	
Getting to Know Your Early 20th-Century Neighborhood	38
Getting to Know Your 20th-Century Neighborhood	54
F. Sources, Acknowledgments and Staff	72

THE PROJECT SUMMARY

The cultural resources survey of 78 properties in the town of Greece was undertaken by the Landmark Society of Western New York beginning in 1995 and concluding in June, 1999. **The survey was limited to 78 properties due to budgetary constraints and should in no way imply that all historic pre-1960 properties worthy of being documented are covered by this survey.** According to estimates made during the proposal stage of this project in 1994, several hundred pre-1960 properties were reviewed for inclusion in the survey. This survey covers only approximately one-fourth of that number, leaving three-fourths of the cultural resources in the town of Brighton undocumented.

It is hoped that this completed survey will serve as base documentation to substantiate requests for funding for further study work and the identification of additional significant cultural resources.

PRELIMINARY INVESTIGATION

The Brighton Cultural Resources Survey of 78 pre-1960 buildings and sites was initiated in December, 1994. At that time, the town of Brighton designated \$2,500 in funds to survey an initial 25 properties. The survey was proposed by the town's Historic Recognition Task Force, a committee of Brighton residents appointed to investigate strategies for protecting the town's historic/cultural resources.

An list of 25 properties was compiled by the Historic Recognition Task Force, in consultation with Landmark Society staff. Members of the Task Force were Mary Jo Barone, town historian and chairman of the Task Force; Elizabeth Brayer, architectural historian; Deborah Bower, owner of the Stoneburner-Corbett House; Anne Marie Cook; Paul Dubelstein; Honey Heyer, former trustee, The Landmark Society; Jan Hopkin; Valerie Konopka, architect; Howard LeVant; Darryl Norris, professor of geography, SUNY/Geneseo; Elaine Nusbaum; Diane Robinson; Susan Schilling, trustee, The Landmark Society and owner of a National Register-listed home; Marjorie Searle, curator, Memorial Art Gallery, and Arlene Wright, trustee, The Landmark Society.

Originally, the committee was to review potential sites that dated from pre-1947. This was based on the National Park Service's guidelines that define cultural/historic resources as principally those properties that are 50 or more years old. There were, however, several significant properties that were not yet 50 years old, but were notable examples of mid 20th-century architecture. These post-1947 properties therefore, were included in the study.

The preliminary investigation of these 25 sites was initiated in 1995. This included a historic overview of the development of the town of Brighton, a windshield survey of town roads, and a map review.

In September, 1996, the town of Brighton was awarded a \$2,500 grant from the New York State Council of the Arts to survey an additional 25 sites. An additional \$2,500 of funding was subsequently provided by the town, bringing the total cost of the project to \$7,500. Initially, this funding insured that the survey would include 75 sites. After preliminary reviews of the potential resources in the town, however, it was decided to increase that total to 78 sites.

Selection of 78 Properties for Study

The selection of the properties for survey was made by the Brighton Historic Recognition Task Force, working in conjunction with Landmark Society staff. A preliminary list of 114 properties, titled, "Brighton Buildings and Structures, 1792-1960" was compiled in 1996 using information from published histories, the town historian's files, and committee members' personal knowledge of local history/architecture. Additional discussions and site visits were included in the review process. The final list of 78 properties was compiled by January, 1997.

Historic Overview

The period of significance used for this cultural resources survey is 1790 to 1947. This time period allows the study of the social and economic influences upon the town's historic sites up to the conclusion of World War II and the beginning of post-war development. After World War II, in the late 1940s, settlement patterns and socio-economic trends changed dramatically in both the local and national contexts. In selecting the 78 properties for this study, however, there were three distinctive properties reviewed whose dates of construction extend into the mid and late 1950s. Because of the exceptional architectural and/or historical merit of these buildings, they were also included in this study.

Windshield Survey

During the early part of the survey, in 1995-'96, a windshield survey of buildings/structures located along the town roads was completed. Each pre-1950 roadway in the town was traveled and historic properties were noted. The original list of 114 recommended sites was devised based on this survey and other sources. The revised list contained 78 pre-1958 sites to be intensively surveyed in the town.

THE SURVEY METHODOLOGY

INFORMATION COLLECTED

Information collected on the 78 selected properties conformed with the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Bureau of Historic Preservation form titled, Building-Structure Inventory Form. A sample form is attached as Appendix A.

The "blue form," as the form is most well known, is divided into three sections: Identification, Description, and Significance. The first section deals with the identification of the building, by address and of the owner. Original and current use are also part of the first section.

The second section, "Description," is the place for observations about the property recorded from the field. The types of catalogued information included building material, structural systems, condition, integrity, threats to the property, surroundings of the building, related buildings and landscape features, and the interrelationship of building and surroundings.

The third section, "Significance," deals with information obtained through research. These items include date of construction, architect, builder, and other historical information. **The first paragraph of #20, "Historical and Architectural Importance" provides a summary of the architectural and historical significance of each of the properties surveyed.** Sources for the information are also recorded on the form.

Photographs

As a rule, the photographs of each property were taken from the public right-of-way. Each surveyed property has a set of black and white photographs of the main building on the property and other outbuildings. In some cases, photographs of barns and other outbuildings or contributing structures/objects were taken. These additional photographs depended on the position of the buildings/structures and whether the photographer had access to the property.

RESULTS - ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS

The analysis of building types has identified resources which are primarily in the following categories: domestic/residences, educational, commercial, religious, and a health care institution. There were 69 residences, one religious building, three educational properties (including a large, educational campus), four commercial properties, and one health-care institution.

GROUPINGS - USE

AGRICULTURAL RESOURCES

Until the early 20th century, land in Brighton was generally related to agriculture. A predominant number (46) of the inventoried properties in the survey represent this trend. This activity generated many special use building types relating to the type of agriculture practiced on site. Survey sheets notate numbers and types of outbuildings present on the inventoried properties.

Only one inventoried property in the survey, however, remains intact as a farmstead with a primary residence, related agricultural outbuildings, and extensive acreage with fenced pastures. That property is the Buckland-Gonsenhouser property at 1341 Westfall Road. At present, the Buckland-Gonsenhauser house is vacant; the buildings and 64 acres of surrounding land have been purchased by the Town of Brighton for development as a public park.

Residences

Forty-six of the houses surveyed for this project were originally farm houses. Because of 20th-century suburban development, however, most of them have lost their agricultural outbuildings and farm acreage. Stylistically, these houses range from very high style to vernacular buildings and span the period of c. 1798 - 1902. Houses originally built as part of a farm complex have been included in the analysis of all residential properties in this survey.

Barns

Barns can be categorized into groups relating to physical characteristics such as roof shape, entrance placement and relationship to earth. Common roof shapes for barns in the Brighton survey included gable and gambrel shapes. Entrances on the side of the barn are called English barns, while an end entrance denotes a Dutch barn. Some barns are two levels high with a dirt ramp leading to a side entrance. These banked barns are usually associated with livestock husbandry.

Eleven of the properties surveyed had at least one barn standing on the site. Photographs and descriptions of most barns are indicated on the survey forms. A list of addresses for the 11 properties with barns is included; see Appendix C.

There are other historic farm properties in Brighton that retain significant agricultural outbuildings. With the intensive suburban development in the town and the demolition of this type of agricultural complex, these properties should be photographed and recorded before they are lost.

DOMESTIC RESOURCES

For most of the 19th and early 20th centuries, the town of Brighton was a rural community that included a village center (at the intersection of East Ave. and Winton Road) and surrounding countryside of mostly scattered farms and agricultural land. In the early and mid-20th century, however, suburban development began in the town, due to improved roads, improved transportation, and proximity to the city. Forty-six of the houses included in this survey date from the 19th century and were originally constructed as farmhouses. An additional twenty-three houses in the survey were built in the early/mid/late 20th century and reflect the suburban development of the town.

Residences

Forty-six houses surveyed for this project were originally constructed as farm houses. These houses were built between c. 1798 and 1902. Most have lost their original agricultural outbuildings and cultivated farmland. Styles include Federal, Greek Revival, Gothic Revival, Italianate, Queen Anne and numerous vernacular examples.

Among the most outstanding examples of 19th-century residences in the survey are the Greek Revival houses at 1564 E. River Road and 1600 Crittenden Rd., the Gothic Revival house at 525 Penfield Rd., the Federal style house at 1675 Clover St., the Italianate style houses at 2230 Clover St., 1100 Highland Ave., and 1956 W. Henrietta Rd., the vernacular/Queen Anne residence at 139 Glen Rd., the vernacular style Amasa Drake House at 474 Winton Rd. South, and the Queen Anne residence at 1233 Crittenden Road. The Gothic Revival style, brick residence at 525 Penfield Rd. is one of the most outstanding examples of this style in Monroe County.

Thirteen of the 19th-century residences included in the survey are constructed of brick and reflect the prominence of the brick manufacturing industry in the town during the 1800s. They are 1496 and 2230 Clover St., 921 Crittenden Rd., 407 Edgewood Ave., 2311 Elmwood Ave., 1100 Highland

Ave., 525 Penfield Rd., 1341 and 2005 Westfall Rd., and 1037, 1340, 1438 and 1551 Winton Road South (see also "Recommendations - Designation Programs: Thematic Group).

Twenty-three of the houses surveyed for this project were constructed as individual residences (not part of a farm) between the early 1900s and 1958. Stylistically, these houses range from high style to vernacular buildings. Styles include Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Neo-Classical, Craftsman/Bungalow, Tudor Revival, International, Ranch, and Split Level.

The town of Brighton includes some of the most distinctive early 20th-century, suburban, residential areas in the region. A number of neighborhoods are characterized by large, high style houses set on spacious, often multi-acre sites in park-like settings. These notable residential areas are located principally in the southeast quadrant of the town and include Allens Creek Rd., Clover St., East Ave., Elmwood Ave., Highland Ave., Winton Road South and numerous side streets that extend off of these primary roadways. A number of these residential areas appear to be eligible for listing as historic districts in the National Register of Historic Places (see Recommendations: Designation Programs).

One of the most distinctive examples of an early 20th-century residence is the Hornbeck-Gannett House at 195 Sandringham Road. Built in 1928-1929, this is the largest example of a Tudor Revival style residence in Monroe County. Another notable 1930s residence is the Keating House at 3500 Elmwood Avenue, an outstanding example of early 20th-century, Georgian Revival, domestic architecture.

Other residences included in the survey show Brighton's transition from a 19th-century rural community to a 20th-century suburb. Three of the more notable examples in this category are houses that have been transformed from modest farmhouses into spacious, 20th-century, suburban residences. The Lindsay House at 3333 Elmwood Ave. was previously a Italianate farmhouse with clapboard siding and cupola. In the 1930s, it was completely remodeled into its present Colonial Revival appearance with stucco cladding. The Dryer House at 2550 East Ave. was originally a small farmhouse that was moved to this site in the late 1800s. In the early 20th century, however, it acquired its present size and Colonial Revival appearance during a remodeling/expansion of the earlier residence. A distinctive, brick farmhouse for most of the 19th century, the Moore-Babcock-Harris House at 1496 Clover Street was greatly remodeled and expanded to its present configuration in the early and late 20th century.

Five contemporary houses have been included in this survey. Built between 1935 and 1958, they include three residences

designed by Rochester architect, Donald Hershey (5 and 7 Landing Rd. South, 285 Council Rock Ave.), an International style residence at 30 Stoneham Rd. and the large, Ranch style residence at 1589 Clover Street. Built in 1957, the house at 1589 Clover St. is of particular note. An example of an Alcoa Aluminum Company "Alcoa Care-free Home," it is the only house of this design to be built in New York State. It features extensive use of aluminum in its construction and interior details. For many years, the house was most widely known for its distinctive, purple, exterior, aluminum sheathing (now painted brown).

There are numerous, other, early/mid 20th-century residences in the town that are of high architectural and historical significance. They should be surveyed in the near future. In particular, houses in the Barnard, Home Acres, Meadowbrook, and Struckmar tracts, and along East Elmwood Ave., Clover Street, East Ave., Highland Ave. and Allens Creek Road should be documented with photographs and written information.

EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Schools

Two educational buildings were identified in the survey, dating from the late 19th and early 20th centuries: former District School Number 9 (c. 1902) at 490 French Road and the Colonial Revival-style, former District School Number 7 (c. 1912-1913) at 909 Landing Road South. When the Brighton schools were centralized in the mid 20th century, the schools were converted to other uses. Former District School No. 9 was rehabilitated as a single-family house in 1949. Former District School No. 7 was purchased by Trinity Reformed Church by 1955. The renovated school became the education wing for a contemporary church building constructed to the north. The characteristic late 19th and early 20th-century appearances of both these buildings remain evident.

(A third educational facility was included in the survey: Our Lady of Mercy High School, which is described under "RELIGIOUS RESOURCES: church school and convent).

RELIGIOUS RESOURCES

Religious Facilities

Two religious buildings were identified in the survey: the Chabad Center for Jewish Enrichment (former Abner Buckland House) at 1037 Winton Road South and the Congregation Beth Hakneses Hachodosh synagogue (former Centenary Methodist Church) at 19 North St. Regis Drive. The Chabad Center is located in an c. 1830, Federal-style, brick residence of highest architectural and historical merit. Although it is

now used for religious services and programs, the house retains its residential character and much of its historic exterior design. The addition of the new, 2-story, rear (west) wing has not greatly change the residential appearance of this building.

The building at 19 North St. Regis Drive, however, was originally constructed as a religious edifice. An example of early 20th-century, Gothic Revival design, it was originally the home of Centenary Methodist Church from 1929 until 1960. Since 1961, it has been the home of the orthodox Jewish congregation, Beth Hakeneses Hachodosh. This is one of the oldest surviving religious buildings in the town of Brighton. It is also of historic interest, in that it is a rare example of a Gothic Revival-style building that serves as a synagogue. Traditionally, the Romanesque style (round arches) was associated with historic synagogue architecture. This was to differentiate with the use of Gothic Revival design (pointed arches), which has been mostly associated with Christian architecture since the Middle Ages.

Church School and Church-Related Residence (convent)

One church school campus was identified in the survey: Our Lady of Mercy High School and Sisters of Mercy of the Americas Motherhouse at 1437 Blossom Road. Located on a large, campus of approximately 62 acres, the complex of buildings includes the high school (1928), motherhouse (1930), auditorium and gym (1940), chapel and dining room (1950), and McCauley building (1957).

The buildings feature the work of five Rochester architects, most notably J. Foster Warner. With his father, Andrew Jackson Warner, he represents Rochester's most famous family of architects. Many of notable buildings in Rochester and western New York were designed by their firm between the 1860s and 1937. J. Foster Warner designed the original Mercy High School and the motherhouse (the architectural drawings for these two buildings, as well as the three other major buildings in the complex are housed in the Sisters of Mercy archives).

In addition, the site features an in-ground swimming pool with quonset-style cabana building, several large athletic fields, two large parking lots, and a multi-car garage with attached storage building. The site also includes a landscaped grotto with shrine, as well as several religious statues and memorial plaques. The south half of the property features a large area of undeveloped woodland and a creek.

Located on one of the largest, educational campuses in the county, Our Lady of Mercy High School and the Sisters of Mercy Motherhouse comprise a facility of regional significance. Built in 1928, Our Lady of Mercy High School

is one of the earliest 20th-century school buildings in the town. The Sisters of Mercy Motherhouse is one of only three large, religious motherhouses in Monroe County (the other two are the Sisters of St. Joseph Motherhouse on East Ave. in the town of Pittsford and the Carmelite Monastery on Jefferson Road in the town of Henrietta). Also, the 1957 west wing originally housed Catherine McCauley Junior College (now closed), the first junior college to be established in Monroe County.

COMMERCIAL RESOURCES

Specialty store:

Four commercial properties were identified in the survey. Three are defined as "specialty stores:" Malek's Bakery at 1795 Monroe Ave., Twelve Corners Apothecary at 1832 Monroe Ave., and the Tudor Revival style Gas Station at 3108 East Avenue.

Built in 1925, Malek's Bakery is an example of an early 20th-century, two-part commercial block. In addition to its commercial use, the building is also notable for its use as Brighton's town hall from 1928 to 1953. Built c. 1840s-'52, the Twelve Corners Apothecary was both a residence and a tavern (Caples Tavern) in the 19th century. It was in the 20th century that it was remodeled for commercial use. The site also features one of the few surviving brick carriage barns in the town. The Tudor Revival style, c.1930 gas station is a unique example of early 20th-century, commercial architecture in the town. It appears to be the oldest surviving gas station in the town and one of the few Tudor Revival style gas stations in the region. It was recently designated a Town of Brighton Landmark.

(Although the Rowland House at 2349 Monroe Ave. has been used for commercial purposes since the 1950s, it has been included in the statistics for "domestic architecture.")

Shopping Plaza

The fourth commercial property included in the survey is the Twelve Corners Plaza at 1890-1940 Monroe Avenue. Built in 1941, it was the first, "modern" suburban, shopping plaza to be constructed in Monroe County. Its present exterior appearance and brick veneer date from the early 1990s. It was the second major exterior remodeling/re-design of this important, mid-20th century, commercial property.

HEALTH CARE RESOURCES

Sanitarium: Nursing Home

One health care facility was included in the survey: the campus of the Rochester Friendly Home at 3156 East Avenue. The oldest health-care campus in the town of Brighton, the Friendly Home is located in a park-like, 10-acre setting adjacent to Allens Creek and the I-490 Expressway. The Rochester Friendly Home is the ninth oldest, not-for-profit nursing home in the United States. Founded in 1849, the Friendly Home was located in the city of Rochester until 1918, when the 50+ residents and staff moved to this suburban campus on East Avenue.

The original, two-story, Friendly Home building, constructed in 1916-'18, was designed by architect, John Gade of the New York City firm, Foster, Gade and Graham. The landscape plans for the grounds were designed by notable Rochester landscape architect, Alling S. Deforest, who also designed the grounds of the George Eastman House.

The Friendly Home was greatly expanded with the construction of three, two-story wings in 1968-'69. This expanded the home to a total of 118 beds, including an infirmary. It also created both health-related and skilled nursing facilities at the Home for the first time. Shortly thereafter, the construction of the adjacent Linden Knoll building with 148 independent-living, one-room apartments was completed in 1975. Linden Knoll was designed by prominent Rochester architect, Carl F. G. Kaelber, Jr.

The park-like setting is enhanced by extensive landscaping of mature trees, flower beds, a large gazebo, and Allen's Creek, which flows along the northern boundary of the property.

GROUPINGS - CONSTRUCTION TYPES

WOOD FRAME CONSTRUCTION

The 53 buildings of frame construction fall into the category of wood frame construction. Most wood frame construction falls into two categories: timber framing and balloon framing.

Timber frame construction, the practice of using heavy, solid, hewn beams fastened together with mortise and tenon joints secured by wooden pins, is the predominant construction technique in the oldest houses. The dense forests of the region plentifully provided raw materials for this type of construction which continued to be used in this area past the invention of the balloon framing technique in 1832.

The technique of balloon framing was popularized in the mid-19th century because of the access to inexpensive materials including standardized lumber and machine cut nails.

Stucco

"Stucco" is a type of exterior plaster applied as a two- or three-part coating directly onto masonry or applied over a wood frame structure. It is primarily used on residential buildings and relatively small-scale commercial structures.

The introduction of many revival styles of architecture around the turn of the 20th century, combined with the improvement and increased availability of portland cement resulted in a "craze" for stucco as a building material in the United States. Beginning about 1890 and gaining momentum into the 1930s and 1940s, stucco was associated with certain historic architectural styles, including Art Moderne, Art Deco, Spanish Eclectic, Mediterranean, Colonial and Tudor Revival styles, as well as Craftsman/bungalow and American Foursquare. The fad for Spanish Colonial Revival was especially important in furthering stucco as a building material in the U.S. during this period, since stucco clearly looked like adobe.

Nine buildings with stucco cladding were identified in the survey. Dating principally from the early-20th century, they are mostly of wood frame construction with an exterior veneer of stucco. One example, the gas station at 3108 East Ave., features cast cinder block construction covered with a veneer of stucco. The principal styles represented are Tudor Revival, Colonial Revival, and International. The buildings include eight houses and one commercial building. Their addresses are: 2351 East Ave., 3108 East Ave., 3225 East

Ave., 3333 Elmwood Ave., 234 Landing Rd. South, 106 Oak Lane, 195 Sandringham Rd., 30 Stoneham Rd., and 2331 Westfall Road.

MASONRY CONSTRUCTION

Masonry construction includes any building or structure that is constructed of stone, brick, tiles, cement, concrete, and similar materials. In this survey, three types of masonry construction methods are represented: brick, cast concrete block, and ceramic block.

Brick Construction

Fourteen buildings of brick construction were identified in the survey. All of these buildings date from the 19th century: thirteen houses and one commercial building. See Appendix D for a complete list of addresses.

The most distinguished examples of 19th-century brick buildings in the survey are: the Moore-Babcock-Harris House at 1496 Clover St., the Todd-Ford House at 2230 Clover St., the Wilson-Hill House at 407 Edgewood Ave., the Cobb-Meagher House at 1100 Highland Ave., the Ketchum-Deshon House at 525 Penfield Rd., the Abner Buckland House at 1037 Winton Rd. South, and the Buckland-Horst House at 1551 Winton Road South.

Brick construction is not a common building method in our northeast region, where wood frame buildings predominate. Examples of brick construction from the 19th and early 20th centuries are becoming more rare as development often replaces these buildings with new construction.

Cast Concrete Block and Ceramic Block Construction

Five buildings of cast concrete block construction and one building of ceramic block construction were identified in the survey. They include: the Tudor Revival-style gas station at 3108 East Ave., former District School #7 at 909 Landing Rd. North, the former Brighton Town Hall at 1995 Monroe Ave., the International-style house at 30 Stoneham Rd., and the late 1930s residence, "Jalna" at 2331 Westfall Road. The building that is constructed of cast ceramic glaze structural tile is the Twelve Corners Plaza at 1890-1940 Monroe Avenue, built in 1941.

Ornamental and structural cast concrete block was a building material widely used from the 1890s through the 1930s. This type of concrete block was the forerunner of the commonly seen, but plain, concrete block of today. Also called decorative or cast block and imitation or artificial stone, it was developed as an inexpensive yet strong alternative to stone and brick.

Until the 1930s, concrete block was almost always finished with a decorative face, usually imitating rough-cut or faced stone, but sometimes with more lively designs. Used in all kinds of structures, it was inexpensive, easily made from readily available raw materials, and assembled like ordinary masonry.

From the late 1800s through the 1930s, ornamental block saw its heyday. Most was produced by local contractors, building-supply companies, or family businesses. Block manufacturing was touted by Sears, Roebuck, Co. as a "remarkably profitable business."

Generally, block could be used anywhere stone or brick traditionally had been used. It was very popular for house foundations, where it was cheaper than stone and stood up better than brick. The commonly used face designs for foundation blocks were rock-face, cobblestone, panel-face and ashlar.

The biggest use of block during the 1920s was for garages and gas stations. A notable example of this in Brighton is the Tudor Revival-style gas station at 3108 East Avenue, whose cast concrete block walls are faced with a stucco finish. The inexpensive cost and fireproof quality of cast concrete block were major selling points for using this material for garage and gas station construction (the presence of flammable materials and proximity to neighboring buildings were definite concerns for builders and property owners).

METAL CONSTRUCTION

Four buildings of metal frame construction were identified in the survey. The three that feature steel frame construction are: Our Lady of Mercy High School and the Sisters of Mercy Motherhouse complex at 1437 Blossom Road, the Rochester Friendly Home at 3156 East Avenue, and the Beth Hakeneses Hachodosh synagogue at 19 North St. Regis Drive. A fifth building, the "Alcoa Care-Free Home," at 1589 Clover Street features aluminum frame construction.

PERIODS OF CONSTRUCTION

Buildings surveyed were constructed between c. 1798 and 1957. Due to the process of selection and the small sample of buildings surveyed, in-depth statistical analysis of economic trends and building patterns in any meaningful way is precluded.

The breakdown of period of construction was as follows:

1798 - c. 1830	6
1831 - c. 1869	29
1870 - c. 1899	12
1900 - c. 1924	14
1925 - 1957	<u>17</u>
TOTAL:	78

While the exact date of construction was unknown for the majority of properties surveyed, approximate dates could be derived by evaluating construction techniques, architectural styles, and historical data.

BUILDING STYLES

Stylistically, the buildings surveyed were mostly vernacular meaning architectural detailing and style were not heavily used. Of the 78 properties surveyed, 34 were identified by the surveyors as vernacular. The other 44 surveyed properties represent a variety of architectural styles popular in the nineteenth and early/mid twentieth centuries. Building styles represented in the survey included:

Federal	3
Greek Revival	7
Gothic Revival	1
Italianate	4
Queen Anne	1
Neo-classical	1
Colonial Revival	9
Georgian Revival	1
Craftsman	1
Tudor Revival	7
20th-century Gothic Revival	1
20th-century commercial	2
Modernistic	1
International	1
Ranch	3
Split-level	1
Vernacular - all periods	<u>34</u>
TOTAL:	78

The Federal and Greek Revival styles represent the earliest era of development in Brighton. Few unaltered buildings from this early 19th-century period remain in the town. One of the most distinctive examples is the brick house at 525 Penfield Road. Built c. 1845, this Gothic Revival-style residence has been rated a "red plus" - of extraordinary architectural and historical significance. It is an outstanding example of 19th-century, Gothic Revival, residential architecture in both the town and Monroe County. The majority of the 19th-century buildings included in the survey represent vernacular examples of their respective styles.

The 20th-century buildings included in the survey, however, are often high-style, architect-designed, examples of their respective styles. An exemplary property among the many distinctive examples of 20th-century residential architecture included in the survey is the Hornbeck-Gannett House at 195 Sandringham Road. Built in 1928-29, this unique residence has been rated a "red plus" - of extraordinary architectural and historical significance. A landmark example of the Tudor Revival style, it is the largest residence of this style to have been built in Monroe County.

An exceptional example of mid 20th-century residential architecture in the town is the spacious, Ranch-style house located at 1589 Clover Street. Built in 1957, it is the only example of an "Alcoa Care-free Home" in New York State. Designed as a prototype residence by the Alcoa Aluminum Co. of America, the house promoted "maintenance free living," by means of its building materials and layout.

See Appendix B for an illustrated guide to historic architectural styles.

STYLISTIC INTEGRITY

Integrity in this sense refers to the historic appearance of the building being maintained. Changes to structures effect the integrity in differing degrees. Additions, alteration, changing of windows and doors and the application of replacement siding are all examples of changes which effect integrity.

Of the 78 surveyed properties, 21 were sided with non-original materials. These replacement sidings include asphalt, asbestos shingles, vinyl, and aluminum.

This type of major change in the appearance of surveyed buildings effected the ratings assigned. The use of synthetic replacement siding on a historic building is considered a major alteration and, therefore, reduces the architectural and historical significance of that property.

RATING THE SURVEY

THE RATING SYSTEM

The Landmark Society of Western New York has utilized the services of an outside "expert" to rate properties identified in survey projects for the last thirty years. The rating system provides a basis of comparison for surveyed properties for their relative architectural merit in a county-wide and larger context. The ratings for this survey follow the basic format of color coding. Because of the rigorous selection process for the surveyed buildings, only the top three categories of color coding were used: red, green and yellow. The definition of each rating is as follows:

- RED** = Extremely high merit and of the highest importance to the entire town; should be inviolate and retained for posterity.
- GREEN** = Of the utmost importance to the surrounding area; should be saved.
- YELLOW** = As a group, these are equally as important as a high-rated individual structure and should be preserved because they enhance the significant structures by harmonizing with them or because, as a group, they make up a streetscape or district worth saving.
- +** = Of relatively high architectural merit within its color category. May be awarded on basis of condition, setting, associated outbuildings or lack of modification.
- = Of relatively lower architectural merit within its color category. May be awarded on basis of condition, insensitive alteration or application of replacement siding.

In October, 1997 the ratings of the buildings included in this survey were completed. Mr. Paul Malo, Professor of Architecture (emeritus), at Syracuse University reviewed and rated the buildings. Professor Malo has written books on historic architecture in Monroe County, as well as in other areas of the state. He has been called upon to rate other Monroe County architectural surveys by the Landmark Society for the past thirty years.

The final ratings for 78 properties are as follows:

Breakdown of Final Ratings

Red plus	3
Red	25
Red minus	22
Green plus	14
Green	11
Green minus	2
Yellow	1

A listing of addresses with specific ratings assigned is attached as Appendix B.

RECOMMENDATIONS

DESIGNATION PROGRAMS:

THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES PROGRAM

The National Register of Historic Places is a program of the federal government to identify buildings, sites, structures, objects, and districts considered to be worthy of preservation. This program is administered at the state level by the State Historic Preservation Office designated in each state. In our state this program is run by the Field Services Bureau of the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (NYSOPRHP). The state was divided up into 12 regions by the Field Services Bureau with designated staff to act as first point of information about federal and state preservation programs. More detailed information about these programs can be obtained from Robert Englert, the NYSOPRHP staff person assigned to this part of the state. He can be reached at: NYS Historic Preservation Field Services Bureau, Peebles Island, P.O. Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189; telephone (518) 237-8643 extension 268; E-Mail: Robert.Englert@OPRHP.state.NY.US

Criteria for Listing

Eligibility for listing a property in the National Register of Historic Places is composed of three parts: age, architectural integrity and the four specific criteria for listing:

1. Unless of exceptional significance, a property must be fifty years of age or older;
2. The property must retain its architectural integrity. This requirement refers to the number of changes the property has gone through not in the historic period. In the case of a house, a rule of thumb could be that if the person associated with the property would recognize it, the building meets the integrity criteria. Conversely, too many changes cause the property to lose integrity.
3. One or more of the following criteria must be met:
 - A. Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;
or
 - B. Association with the lives of persons significant in our past; or

- C. Embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- D. Have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Surveyed Properties Which Appear to Meet National Register Criteria

Presently, the Stone-Tolan House at 2370 East Ave. and the Timothy Wallace House at 2169 Clinton Avenue South are the **only properties in the town of Brighton that are listed in the State and National Registers of Historic Places.** Stone-Tolan House was listed in 1983 and the Wallace House was listed in 1994.

There are many other historic resources in the town of Brighton that are eligible for listing in the State and National Register of Historic Places. The owners of these properties, however, have not yet applied for landmark designation in the Registers. In the opinion of the surveyors, the buildings included in this survey which appear to be eligible for listing in the State and National Registers include:

Individual Eligibility

1437 Blossom Road - the campus of Our Lady of Mercy High School and Motherhouse is a major example of a 20th-century, educational campus and religious institution with contributing buildings and landscape features.

1589 Clover Street - this unique, 1957, Ranch-style house is architecturally significant as the only example of an "Alcoa Care-free Home" in New York State.

1675 Clover Street - this distinctive c. 1830s-52 residence is an important example of Federal style, domestic architecture in the town.

1600 Crittenden Road - the Austin Crittenden House (1830) is a distinguished example of a vernacular, early 19th-century, Greek Revival farmhouse. It is historically significant for its association with the Crittenden family, pioneer settlers for whom Crittenden Rd. was named.

2855 East Avenue - Parsons-Kingston House. Built c. 1872-'73, this distinctive, late 19th-century farmhouse includes details from the Gothic Revival,

Italianate, Stick, and Colonial Revival styles. The house is historically significant for its association with the Parsons family, pioneer settlers and prominent landowners in the East Ave./Elmwood Ave. area.

3500 Elmwood Avenue - Keating House. Built in 1935, this handsome Georgian Revival style residence is one of the most outstanding examples of its type in the county. It is historically significant for its association with Kenneth B. Keating, former U.S. Senator and ambassador to India and Israel.

139 Glen Road - Stoneburner-Corbett House. Built c. 1880-1884, this house is architecturally significant as a notable example of a late 19th-century vernacular farmhouse with Queen Anne style details. It is historically significant for its association with Brighton's agricultural, recreational, and social heritage, in particular its association with the Corbett family, who for over 80 years operated a private picnic ground - Corbett's Glen - on this property.

909 Landing Road North - former District School No. 7. A distinctive and unique example of early 20th-century, Colonial Revival-style, educational architecture in the town.

5 & 7 Landing Road South - two, early examples of mid 20th-century (late 1930s), contemporary, residential architecture in the town. Both houses were designed by well-known Rochester architect, Donald Hershey.

525 Penfield Road - the Ketchem-Deshon House is one of the most outstanding examples of mid 19th-century, Gothic Revival-style, domestic architecture in the county.

30 Stoneham Road - Built in 1935, the Myers-Segal House is a notable and rare example of International-style, domestic architecture in the town.

1564 East River Road - an outstanding example of an early 19th-century, vernacular, Greek Revival-style farmhouse. Overlooking the Genesee River, it is one of the oldest, wood-frame, Greek Revival houses in the southwest quadrant of the town.

19 St. Regis Drive North - a distinctive example of early 20th-century, Gothic Revival religious architecture and one of the earliest surviving religious buildings in the town.

195 Sandringham Road - built in 1928-'29, the Hornbeck-Gannett House is the largest, early 20th-century, Tudor

Revival-style residence in Monroe County. It is historically significant for its association with Frank Gannett, pioneering newspaper publisher and founder of what became the largest newspaper chain in the U.S.

474 Winton Road South - Amasa Drake House. Built c. 1831-1840s, this house is one of the most distinguished examples of mid 19th-century, residential architecture in the town. It is historically significant for its association with the town's agricultural heritage and the development of the Erie Canal (Amasa Drake was the supervising engineer of the Erie Canal/Broad St. Aqueduct in Rochester).

1875 Winton Road South - one of the oldest surviving examples of an early 19th-century, vernacular, Greek Revival-style farmhouse in the town. It is historically significant for its association with the Little and Peck families, who were pioneer settlers in the town.

Historic Districts

Clover Street/Babcock Drive Historic District - consists of principally late 19th- and early 20th-century residences located on the east and west sides of Clover Street, from East Ave. (on the north) to Babcock Drive (on the south). This also includes the former Rowland farmhouse at #138 Rowland Parkway.

Cobb Historic District - this compact district on the north side of Highland Ave. includes the Cobb-Meagher House, a brick, Italianate-style house at #1100 Highland Ave. and its former tenant house at #1054 Highland Ave.

Crittenden Road Historic District - consists of the Gillespie House at #1211 Crittenden Road and the Basold House at #1233 Crittenden Road, as well as the early 20th-century residences immediately across the street, on the north side of the road.

East Avenue - Barnard Tract Historic District - a large district that would be bordered by East Ave. on the north, Esplanade Dr. and Elmwood Ave. on the south, Grosvenor Rd. on the west and Oak Lane on the east. It features outstanding examples of Colonial Revival and Tudor Revival style homes from the early/mid 20th century, as well as historic landscape design features. This includes the houses at #2351, #2369, #2525, #2550, #2563 East Ave., #3333 & # 3500 Elmwood Avenue and #106 Oak Lane.

East Avenue - Knollwood Drive Historic District - located just east of the intersection of Linden Ave. and East

Ave., this district includes the Tudor Revival-style gas station at #3108 East Ave., the Allens Creek Elementary School, "Greystones," at 3225 East Ave. and early/mid 20th-century residences along Knollwood Drive.

Home Acres Historic District - although this early 20th-century housing tract was not included in this survey, it appears to meet the criteria for listing as a district in the National Register of Historic Places. The proposed district includes Eastland and Westland avenues, Fonthill Park, and Southern Parkway.

Landing Road South Historic District - located between the I-490 Expressway and Linden Ave., this district would include homes on the east and west sides of Landing Road South, including the houses at #234, #248, and #270 Landing Road South.

Thematic Group

Brick construction - the category of "thematic group" includes distinctive examples of specific types of construction. Thirteen houses in the survey are constructed of brick that appears to have been manufactured in the town of Brighton. Throughout the 19th and early 20th century, brick manufacturing was a major industry in Brighton. Pioneer families such as the Cobbs and the Bucklands established a number of "brick yards" in the community, principally in the Monroe Ave. and Winton Road South/12 Corners neighborhoods.

The following 13 houses are architecturally and historically distinctive examples of brick construction and may be eligible as a thematic group: **#1496 Clover St., #2230 Clover St., #921 Crittenden Rd., #407 Edgewood Ave., #2311 Elmwood Ave., #1100 Highland Ave., #525 Penfield Rd., #1341 and #2005 Westfall Rd., and #1037, #1340, #1438, and #1551 Winton Rd. South.**

Other properties in the survey may meet the criteria for listing in the State and National Registers. For evaluation of specific properties, please contact:

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and
Historic Preservation -
Field Services Bureau
Peebles Island, P. O. Box 189
Waterford, New York 12188-0189
phone: (518) 237-8643

THE TOWN OF BRIGHTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION LAW

In 1996, the town of Brighton adopted a Historic Preservation Local Law as part of the Town's Comprehensive Development Ordinance. The local law declared it a matter of public policy that the protection, enhancement, perpetuation and the use of buildings, structures, places and sites of historic value was in the public interest for the Town of Brighton.

Under this local preservation law, the Brighton Historic Preservation Commission was created, consisting of seven members. Among the Commission's powers is the designation of landmarks in the town of Brighton. The Commission may designate an individual property, site or structure, or a significant feature of any such property, site or structure as a landmark if it:

- (i) possesses historic value as part of the cultural, political, economic, architectural, or social history of the locality, region, state or nation; or
- (ii) is identified with historic personages; or
- (iii) embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style; or
- (iv) is the work of a significant designer.

PROPERTIES DESIGNATED UNDER THE BRIGHTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION ORDINANCE*

1981 South Clinton Avenue	James Hartley House
2169 South Clinton Avenue	Timothy Wallace House
1550 Clover Street	Clover Street Seminary
1211 Crittenden Road	
2370 East Avenue	Stone-Tolan House
3108 East Avenue	Socony/Mobil/Sunoco Gas Station
245 Edgewood Avenue	Abbey-Taylor House
484 French Road	Former District School #9
130 Glen Road	Stoneburner-Corbett House
895 Highland Avenue	John Hagaman House

896 Highland Avenue	Carl Paul House
1100 Highland Avenue	Cobb-Maegher House
421 Landing Road North	New Tryon House
1795 Monroe Avenue	former Brighton Town Hall
1438 South Winton Road	Carey-Harper House
1956 West Henrietta Road	Warrant Homestead
2176 Westfall Road	Sears-Roebuck Co. catalog house

Other properties included in this survey may meet the criteria for designation as a Town of Brighton landmark. For evaluations of specific properties contact:

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission
 c/o Building & Planning Department
 Town Hall
 2300 Elmwood Avenue
 Rochester, New York 14618

(716) 473-8800.

* This list was compiled April 22, 1999.

IDENTIFICATION AND DOCUMENTATION OF ADDITIONAL CULTURAL RESOURCES IN THE TOWN OF BRIGHTON

As stated in the "Project Summary," several hundred pre-1960 properties were initially reviewed for inclusion in this cultural resources survey. Because of funding limitations, however, only 78 properties were documented and photographed for this project. This is less than one-fourth the total number of potential cultural resources in the town.

There are 300-400 additional cultural resources still to be photographed and documented in the town of Brighton. Among the notable individual properties still to be surveyed is the International-style residence at 291 Weymouth Drive, built in 1937 by the renowned Philadelphia architect, William Lescaze. It is the only example of his work in the upstate region.

In addition, there are a number of early 20th-century neighborhoods with distinctive examples of residential architecture that should be surveyed. These neighborhoods include Home Acres, Meadowbrook, Clover Hills, Brighton-Browncroft, East Elmwood, Houston Barnard, Roselawn, Struckmar, and Ellison Park Heights.

We strongly urge the Town of Brighton to consider further study work to identify and document the significant cultural resources in the town that have not yet been surveyed.